Understanding drivers for, and barriers to green jobs in the tourism sector: A case study of Rafsanjan, Iran

Elahe Hoseinifirouzabadi
B.A. Tourism Management; M.A. Tourism Management
Allame Tabatabaei University

College of Business, Victoria University

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the Master of Business [by research]

March 2019
Preface

Born and bred in Rafsanjan and more broadly in Iran, I was always aware of the environmental situation when travelling outside Iran. The first difference I always noticed when travelling outside Iran was the clean environment in other countries compared to that in Iran. Studying tourism as a major at university made me even more sensitive about environmental issues because I became aware of how environmental problems can have a negative effect on a country both domestically and globally. Although Rafsanjan is a very famous and impressive city in Iran, I often heard people of other cities describing it as a dirty place, and how they were amazed that a city which is alive with agricultural activities can be so ignorant about considering the environment. After visiting other cities of Iran and living for many years in Tehran, I began to think the same about other cities as people did about Rafsanjan. I kept wondering how this issue can be solved in Iran? Where to start? What can contribute the most to solving this problem?

The idea of a green job actually started when I was sitting with my supervisor, talking about our countries. She came up with the term “Green Job”. Suddenly my brain lit up. I started to think about the importance of the economy in every country, including Iran, and how people of Iran are interested in the idea of being an entrepreneur, establishing businesses, getting in touch with the whole world and having people from other countries as tourists. Tourism as a major at university and tourism jobs were gaining significance for Iran and its economy. In addition, there was a major subject on sustainable tourism. However, there was no focus on how jobs in the tourism industry should be green. My mind started to connect these ideas together. What if all the efforts start from conducting an everyday job? Is not an everyday economic activity more effective in changing the environmental circumstances than looking for an overnight miracle? Are green jobs possibly that miracle which we are looking for?

I started my research in this area, and the more I dug in, the more I realised how much we do not know about this issue in Iran. Rafsanjan is losing its amazing ability to be one of the biggest producers and exporters of pistachio in the world just because of the lack of attention to environmental issues. Environmental challenges are reducing people’s life span, community satisfaction and the number of tourists every year. Finally, environmental problems that in the first place are caused by unsustainable jobs afflict those jobs and reduce their ability to make money. The environment around us is always
taken for granted and considered as a bonus that should recover itself naturally, despite the fact that our destruction speed is much more than the recovery ability of nature.

Looking at the environment, Iran, Rafsanjan and the tourism industry from another point of view; when after two years of living in Australia I took my Australian husband to Iran, the environmental beauties of the Alborz ranges and Damavand mountain were the most significant eye-catching scenes for him, but the environmental problems of the cities were his biggest disappointments. I was also looking at my country this time as a guest and not a host, and I agreed with him. Perhaps this study can shed some light on this problem in Rafsanjan, Iran and contribute to a proper final solution for that. Today after two years, I am still learning more about the importance of the environment in our life, in our happiness and sense of satisfaction about life.
Abstract

Jobs have a meaningful role in every economy, and tourism is one of the most significant drivers of economic growth. Although the process of transition to a green economy and green jobs has already started in various industries, participation in this respect among tourism workers and professionals in direct, indirect and induced jobs is comparatively low. To explore the reason for such a low participation rate, this study adopted a qualitative method case study approach. This method facilitated an in-depth investigation of the reasons behind the low participation rate. Specifically, the research methods utilised were semi-structured interviews and self-interviewing. Participants included 21 workers and professionals holding tourism-related jobs in Rafsanjan, Kerman, Iran.

The findings suggested that older workers and professionals are more understanding of the environmental effect of their jobs. They more readily complied with environmental rules and educated others as to the importance of applying them. They are willing to participate in greening their current jobs for the benefit of the area in which they live. Younger workers and professionals, however, find it more difficult to alter their job process into a more environmentally-friendly way. Despite these differences, the drivers for participating in greening the jobs were the same: financial opportunities and constraints, and the government’s attitude to supporting environmentally friendly policies and regulations. The lack of knowledge, technology and standards, the lack of management, policies and plans, the lack of support and ignorance are the key barriers for participants to do their jobs sustainably. Participants predominantly highlighted external drivers and barriers as being important. However, internal drivers and barriers were also identified in some of the participants’ responses. These included openmess to new ideas, and willingness to adopt sustainable environmental policies. Internal barriers to greening jobs were more prominent. These included inappropriate habits, ignorance, lack of internal motivation, lack of a conscientious attitude among customers, and finally lack of trust in the system. This study also explored the workers’ and professionals’ motivations for working in tourism, which can indicate their mindset about altering their job to be eco-friendlier. The results show that younger people working in this industry chose their job because of personal interest and to be in contact with people. Professional and older workers stated that their main reasons for working in the tourism industry are
that they regard it as a valuable job and they like to be in touch with nature. Both groups mentioned that unreasonable criticism, ignorant people and government are their main reasons for resenting tourism-based jobs. The barriers to working in tourism posed by tourism jobs are similar to the barriers of greening such jobs. This suggests that making tourism jobs more eco-friendly may reduce resentment and dissatisfaction among workers in this sector.

These results underscore the need for significant changes in policies, rules, regulations, and strategies that benefit workers and the ecology in which they work. As well, there is a need for a change in the mindset of workers and professionals in tourism, such that they are more aware of their role in saving the environment and begin to take steps to contribute to that. Underestimating the jobs and their effects on the environment is one of the main barriers between young workers and professionals. Adding to that, having the mentality that one is unable to make any change without the government’s assistance, can be one of the main reasons for not taking action to improve job strategies. Training, awareness and knowledge would help workers and professionals realise how they can contribute to creating a more sustainable tourism industry in Rafsanjan, Iran.
Student declaration

I, Elahe Hoseinifirouzabadi, declare that the Master by Research thesis entitled “Understanding drivers for, and barriers to green jobs in the tourism sector: A case study of Rafsanjan, Iran” is no more than 60,000 words in length including quotes and exclusive of tables, figures, appendices, bibliography, references and footnotes. This thesis contains no material that has been submitted previously, in whole or in part, for the award of any other academic degree or diploma. Except where otherwise indicated, this thesis is my own work.

15/03/2019

Signature

Date
Dedication

To my hero, my love and my amazing husband Julian who always is trying to be better and do better.
Acknowledgements

During my journey of compiling this thesis, I experienced quite a few difficulties that became easier and possible to deal with due to having valuable people beside me.

First and primary, I thank my supervisors who were always prepared for any help and support. My main supervisor, Terry DeLacy, was like a kind friend and not only helped me with my thesis but was always ready to help with any other difficulty. I thank my associate supervisor, Min Jiang, whose guidance and support was much appreciated. Both of you were always there for me with your advice, ideas, suggestions and passion about my work. You made this work possible and enjoyable for me.

I also appreciate Victoria University staff who was always responsive, helpful and cooperative. They were always more than happy to help and support in any way they could. My numerous emails and visits to the Graduate Research Centre and their endless smiles and careful behaviour and words were soothing and reassuring.

My family back in Iran who always supported me. They never let me feel alone. I feel their dedication and love even though they are thousands of kilometres away. I have reached this level in my life because of my dad’s ultimate support while he was alive and even after his death with his amazing legacy, because of my mom who I always count on during times of happiness and sadness and my sister who has always been an amazing friend for me. We went through the best and worst moments together, and it was our cooperation and love which helped us stay strong and proceed in life. I thank my cousins and my uncles, who although they don’t know exactly what this topic is about, without their help, I could not have finished this work.

I pay gratitude to my in-law family who filled my life with love and happiness. I thank them for all of their care about my work, and their passion and love about my education and our life, their unlimited help and respect. My lovely mother in law who always behaved me like my own mother, caring and kind. My father in law who is like my real father in the way he cares about my future and supports me in life. My great sisters and brothers in law who are always a happy part of my life. Their presence gives me a lot of energy and happiness. They are truly a real family for me, and without their support, I never could be in the place I am in now.
Last but definitely not least, my amazing husband, Julian. This journey started by visiting him and he became the most beautiful part of my life, he became my life. During the moments of uncertainty, the only person I could turn to was my husband. No matterhow difficult it was, he always was there for me even up to 3 am in the morning. With him, everything is better, everything is possible. He made me a better human being, a better person. With his constant support, finishing this thesis became possible. For me, he is the symbol of a wise man, a smart student, a constant learner, a passionate husband, a kind and understanding companion, a trustworthy citizen, an energetic friend, and a respectful person in the society. He is my love, my confidant, my best friend, my mentor, and my wonderful husband. I want to thank him for coming into my life, for turning my life into a dream that comes true every day.
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student declaration</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dedication</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of tables</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of figures</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of boxes</td>
<td>xviii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 1  INTRODUCTION

OVERVIEW

1.1. RESEARCH AIM AND OBJECTIVES  
1.2. SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY  
1.3. OVERVIEW OF THE RESEARCH DESIGN  
1.4. STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS

## CHAPTER 2  LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. INTRODUCTION  
2.2. TRANSFORMATION TOWARD GREEN ECONOMY  
  2.2.1. Sustainability  
  2.2.2. Green economy and green growth  
  2.2.3. Sustainable tourism  
2.3. IMPLICATION FOR EMPLOYMENT  
  2.3.1. Upskilling, new job creation and greening current jobs  
2.4. CONTRIBUTION OF JOBS TO TRANSFORMATION  
2.5. DRIVERS FOR, AND BARRIERS TO GREEN JOBS  
2.6. GREEN JOBS IN TOURISM  
2.7. CHAPTER SUMMARY
CHAPTER 3  RESEARCH DESIGN

3.1.  INTRODUCTION  36
3.2.  RESEARCH PARADIGM  36
   3.2.1. Used paradigm: Interpretive social science paradigm  37
3.3.  EPISTEMOLOGY  38
3.4.  THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE  38
3.5.  METHODOLOGY OVERVIEW  39
   3.5.1. Qualitative method  39
3.6.  RESEARCH METHODS  40
   3.6.1. Analysing secondary data  41
   3.6.2. Semi-structured interviews  41
   3.6.3. Self-interviewing  42
      3.6.3.1. Using videos for self-interviewing  42
   3.6.4. Summary of methods used in this study  43
3.7.  RESEARCH DESIGN OF THIS STUDY  44
3.8.  DATA COLLECTION  46
   3.8.1. The process of video selection  46
   3.8.2. The process of data collection  47
      3.8.2.1. Secondary data gathering  49
      3.8.2.2. The semi-structured interviews  49
      3.8.2.3. The self-interviewing using videos  52
3.9.  DATA ANALYSIS  53
   3.9.1. Secondary data analysis  53
   3.9.2. Semi-structured interviews  53
   3.9.3. Self-interviewing  56
3.10. ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS  56
3.11. LIMITATIONS OF METHODOLOGY  57
3.12. CHAPTER SUMMARY  58
CHAPTER 4  CASE STUDY

4.1. INTRODUCTION 59
4.2. RAFSANJAN AT A GLANCE 59
  4.2.1. Geography 59
  4.2.2. History 61
  4.2.3. Politics 62
  4.2.4. Economy 62
4.3. ENVIRONMENT IN RAFSANJAN 64
4.4. TOURISM IN RAFSANJAN 65
  4.4.1. Research objective one: To identify the current state of tourism, and the activities and preferences of tourists in Rafsanjan (Secondary data analysis) 65
    4.4.1.1. Type of tourism 66
    4.4.1.2. Time spent 66
    4.4.1.3. Type of accommodation preferred 67
    4.4.1.4. Expenditure trends while travelling 68
    4.4.1.5. Mode of travelling 69
  4.4.2. Main tourist attractions of Rafsanjan 70
  4.4.3. Overview of tourism jobs available in Rafsanjan 73
  4.4.4. The policies in regard to tourism jobs and activities 74
4.5 GREEN JOBS IN RAFSANJAN 75
4.6. CHAPTER SUMMARY 76

CHAPTER 5  FINDINGS 77

5.1. INTRODUCTION 77
5.2. RESULTS OF THE SELECTION OF THEMES, QUESTIONS AND VIDEOS 77
5.3. PARTICIPATION IN TOURISM JOBS IN RAFSANJAN 81
  5.3.1. Overview of participants in this study 81
  5.3.2. What motivates participants to do tourism jobs 82
  5.3.3. What impeded the participants to work in tourism jobs 85
5.4. OVERVIEW OF THE DRIVERS FOR DOING CURRENT TOURISM JOBS GREENLY IN RAFSANJAN

5.4.1. Detailed drivers for greening current tourism jobs in Rafsanjan about different aspects of those jobs

5.5. OVERVIEW OF THE BARRIERS TO DOING CURRENT TOURISM JOBS GREENLY IN RAFSANJAN

5.5.1. Detailed barriers to greening current tourism jobs in Rafsanjan about different aspects of those jobs

5.6. RESULTS OF SELF-INTERVIEWS ABOUT DRIVERS AND BARRIERS

5.7. PRELIMINARY AND META-CODING OF DRIVERS AND BARRIERS

5.8. CHAPTER SUMMARY

CHAPTER 6  DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

6.1. INTRODUCTION

6.2. DRIVERS FOR, AND BARRIERS TO, GREEN JOBS IN TOURISM

6.3. REVIEW OF RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

6.3.1. Research objective one: To identify the current state of tourism, and the activities and preferences of tourists in Rafsanjan

6.3.2. Research objective two: To investigate the drivers for Rafsanjani workers and professionals toward greening their jobs in tourism

6.3.3. Research objective three: To explore the barriers to greening tourism jobs by Rafsanjani workers and professionals

6.4. CONTRIBUTION TO KNOWLEDGE

6.4.1. Theoretical contribution to knowledge

6.4.2. Practical contribution to knowledge

6.5. LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEARCH

6.6. THE EXTENT OF FURTHER RESEARCH

6.6.1. Further research into workers’ and professionals’ perceptions of green jobs in Iran
6.6.2. Application of the methodology to other types of tourism studies 137
6.6.3. Further research into green jobs and the connection with global warming 138
6.6.4. Further research into green jobs and the connection with the fundamental principles 138

6.7. CONCLUDING STATEMENT 138

References 140

Appendix A: The analysis of tourism statistic data in Rafsanjan (Secondary data) 169
A.A DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SAMPLE 169
A.A.A Gender of participants 169
A.A.B Age of participants 170
A.A.C Education level of participants 171
A.A.D Participants type of service in tourism 171
A.A.E Longevity of Working in Tourism Jobs 173

Appendix B: The analysis of the profile and demographic characteristics of workers and professionals in the tourism industry in Rafsanjan 174

Appendix C: Semi-Structured Interview Framework for Workers and Professionals Working in Tourism Industry 176

Appendix D: Semi-Structured Interview Framework for Workers and Professionals Working in Tourism Industry in Persian 180

Appendix E: Self-Interview Questions in English 183

Appendix F: Self-Interview Questions in Persian 185

Appendix G: Self-Interview Texts in English 186

Appendix H: Self-Interview Texts in Persian 188

Appendix I: Information Sheet Used in Data Collection Process in English 190

Appendix J: Consent Form Used in Data Collection Process in English 192

Appendix K: Information Sheet Used in Data collection Process in Persian 193

Appendix L: Consent Form Used in Data collection Process in Persian 196

Appendix M: The Videos Which Are Used in Self-Interviewing 198
List of tables

Table 1.1: Research objectives and methodology 4
Table 2.1: Transition of economy sector to green economy 21
Table 3.1: Summary of weak points and strengths of the study’s methods 43
Table 3.2: Research method used in this study 48
Table 3.3: Demographic data about participants 50
Table 3.4: Sample of questions used in the semi-structured interviews 51
Table 3.5: The resources and topics from which the themes of this study were extracted 54
Table 3.6: Process for ensuring ethical conduct of this research 57
Table 4.1: Overview of tourism jobs available in Rafsanjan 73
Table 5.1: Themes and sub-themes presented in previous studies or standards 78
Table 5.2: Overview of participants in this study 81
Table 5.3: What motivates participants to do their job 83
Table 5.4: What impedes the participants to do tourism jobs 85
Table 5.5: General drivers for greening current tourism jobs 88
Table 5.6: Detailed drivers for greening tourism jobs 90
Table 5.7: General barriers to greening current tourism jobs 97
Table 5.8: Detailed barriers to greening current tourism jobs 99
Table 5.9: Preliminary coding and meta-coding of drivers 117
Table 5.10: Categorising the meta-codes and sub-codes for drivers 121
Table 5.11: Preliminary coding and meta-coding of barriers 122
Table 5.12: Categorising the meta-codes and sub-codes for barriers 125
# List of figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Chapter structure of the thesis</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>The relationship between GG, GE and SD</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Conventional economic model vs. green growth model</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Six building blocks in the transition to a green economy</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Environmental sustainability: The next economic wave</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>The evolution of a key concept from sustainability to greening</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Green job typology</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>Changes in skills and occupations for green jobs</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>Green skills checklist</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>Classification of skills needed for a transition to a low carbon economy</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Qualitative method research design for this study</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Rafsanjan – where the study was conducted</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Rafsanjan in relation to Yazd, Shiraz and Kerman</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>The most prominent producers of pistachio in the world</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Type of tourism</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Time spent</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Type of accommodation preferred</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Expenditure trends while travelling</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Mode of travelling</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>(Left) Rageh Valley and (Right) Mirza Cave</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>(Left) 1500 year old pistachio tree and (Right) Bahraman well</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>(Left) The oldest muddy house and (Right) Kabootarkhan caravanserai</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 4.12: (Left) Anahita castle and (Right) Old city of Rafsanjan

Figure 4.13: (Left) Rafsanjan Bazaar and (Right) Abbasabad water reservoir

Figure A.1: Gender distribution of participants

Figure A.2: Age distribution of participants

Figure A.3: Level of education of participants

Figure A.4: Participants type of service in tourism

Figure A.5: Longevity of working in tourism jobs
List of boxes

Box 5.1: Participant 13 – Transportation system worker 109
Box 5.2: Participant 14 – Honey bee tourism 111
Box 5.3: Participant 15 – Tour leader 112
Box 5.4: Participant 16 – Entrepreneur in handicraft jobs 113
Box 5.5: Participant 17 – Pistachio farmer 114
Box 5.6: Participant 18 – Organic farmer 115
Box 5.7: Participant 19 – Transportation system worker 116
Box 5.8: Participant 20 – Eco-lodge worker 116
Box 5.9: Participant 21 – Green designer and Advertising company 117
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

“I don’t know if there’s a green career. There are careers, and there are ways to green them.” — Dennis Macray, director of business practices, Starbucks

Overview

Globally, there are examples of jobs which are following the wrong path, environmentally; these examples also manifest in developing countries (United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) & World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) 2012). These jobs, as they are often highly paid, tempt people to take them up, but often have long term negative environmental and ecological impacts (Slocum 2015, Barbier 1987). Moving toward a more environmentally sustainable world, socially equitable and economically viable, is only possible if equal weight is given to all three of these aspects (Slocum 2015, Barbier 1987). This requires the creation of jobs that promote the health of the environment in which they are performed.

As well as creating jobs and economic growth, tourism promotes development by connecting the economic, social and environmental aspects (Jenkins & Schröder 2013; United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO n.d.; Management Association 2019). In 2007, tourism contributed 10% of the world’s gross domestic product (GDP). It accounts for 9% of employment around the world (World Travel & Tourism Council (WTTC), 2018), while also creating 5% of greenhouse emissions (GHG) (International Labour Organization (ILO) 2012a; Weaver 2006). In tourism, there is a huge competition for tourists’ money. In the past, a successful destination was one that could make more money. However, increasingly this is being judged by the degree to which a destination has transitioned to a green economy (ILO 2012a; Weaver 2006). To achieve this, tourism related jobs must balance the needs of the economy, environment and society by realising the interdependence of these domains (Chernyshev n.d.). Green jobs can satisfy these needs by connecting employment to environmental and social development, which promotes green growth (Winter & Moore 2013).
Following green growth leads to a green economy and one key aspect of a green economy is green jobs (Musango, Brent & Bassi 2014; Kasztelan 2017; Consoli et al. 2016). Green jobs are not only those in the renewable energy sector. Many jobs in various industries can be converted into green jobs by performing them in a more environmentally friendly way (Federal Public Service Employment Labour and Social Dialogue 2010). In other words, businesses that preserve or restore the quality of the environment, would be called “green jobs” (Bowen 2012; Battaglia, Cerrini & Annesi 2018; ILO 2018). Although some jobs in this transition would be eliminated, new jobs would be formed, and excuses for not following green job principles eradicated. To facilitate such a transition, governments should develop green policies, and businesses must adopt various green strategies (Yue, Xingzhu & Lin 2011; Kouri & Clarke 2014).

Such efforts from governments and business to generate greater environmental sustainability could lead to new opportunities for investment, economic growth and job creation (ILO 2013a, 2013d, 2013e). However, the only jobs that could guarantee environmental sustainability in the future, are green jobs. A green job is not necessarily a specific type of job. In a green economy, not only would there be more jobs in new areas, but the current job quality would be improved with a view to enhancing the health of society overall (ILO 2013a; Frondel et al. 2010).

Supporting the notion that a greener economy would lead to more jobs in new areas, findings show that by the year 2030, 24 million new jobs would become available globally, if certain green economic policies are implemented (ILO 2018a). Based on International Labour Organization statistics (2018a), of 163 economic sectors, only 14 would suffer from employment loss due to the greening of jobs. For example, petroleum extraction and petroleum refining industries stand to lose one million or more jobs. However, such losses would be offset by six million jobs being generated by a “circular economy”, which integrates activities such as “recycling, repair, rent and remanufacture, replacing”. This would replace the traditional economic model of “extracting, making, using and disposing” (ILO 2018a).

Such economic mechanisms are needed to green Iran’s tourism industry. This is important given that the effect of tourism on is increasing on the economy is growing. Indeed, it now represents 7.5% of GDP (WTTC 2018). Further, 6.1% of total employment in Iran was through the tourism industry in 2017, and this number was expected to rise
by 4.9% in 2018 (WTTC 2018). While helping to grow Iran’s economy, tourism is having a negative impact on the environment. Such negative effects originate from both the demand and the supply sides. For years, the former has been under investigation for detrimental environmental impacts (Jamshidnezhad 2016; Ghobadi & Verdian 2016; Mola, Shafaei & Mohamed 2012; Shahabian 2007; Mousazadeh et al. 2015), though less is known about the impact of the supply side of tourism on the environment in Iran.

Understanding the impact of the supply side is crucial, given that The World Bank estimated higher economic benefits for Iran and other developing countries, should they reduce environmental degradation (Worldbank 2012). Such estimates point to the importance for Iran’s economy of planning and implementing green job policies there.

In the Iranian province of Kerman, statistics reveal that the number of tourists in this state was 94440 in 2015 (Iran Statistical Year Book 2008–2018). Rafsanjan is the most prominent farming city in Kerman and Iran, and one of the biggest exporters of pistachio in the world (Eghtesad Online 2016). This city has an important role to play in various types of tourism (Federico, Magdalena & Mortaz 2011). Jobs and industries should be monitored so that they are based on an acceptable standard, because of how low the capacity of this city is for tolerating environmental challenges (Shafafnews 2017; Mehryar et al. 2015 & 2016; Khorasanipour & Aftabi 2010; Goudarzi et al. 2018).

With continuing climate challenges, and a lack of strategic policy planning, including for jobs in tourism, it is likely that Rafsanjan’s economy and tourism industry might be damaged (Goudarzi et al. 2018; Mehryar et al. 2015). As a part of Iran’s 20-year vision plan, policies have been developed to support environmental health (Shikhholeslami & Shobeiri 2016) in the tourism industry where opportunities for growth abound (Ministry of Economic Affairs and Finance (MEFA) 2016; Iran Cultural Heritage and Handicrafts and Tourism Organisation (ICHTO) 2017). It is thus of growing importance to create jobs that are eco friendly to improve economic development opportunities through tourism.

1.1. **Research aim and objectives**

This study aims to explore the drivers and barriers of green jobs in tourism in Rafsanjan, Iran. The general aim of this study may be communicated within more detailed objectives:
1) To identify the current state of tourism, and the activities and preferences of tourists in Rafsanjan

2) To investigate the drivers for Rafsanjani workers and professionals toward greening jobs in tourism

3) To explore the barriers to greening tourism jobs by Rafsanjani workers and professionals

It is intended that identifying drivers will cast a light on what drives workers and professionals to move toward green jobs. Highlighting barriers would hopefully lend insight into what obstructs people from greening jobs in tourism.

A combination of secondary data, interviews and self-interviewing was used to fulfil the objectives of this study. Using a qualitative approach, which incorporated semi-structured interviews enabled the researcher to “gain insight and understanding” (Newton 2010, p. 1; Gillham 2005, p. 11; Lewis & Ritchie 2003, p. 138; Ritchie et al. 2013), and to access rich data with proper explanations about what, why and how. Table 1.1 presents the aims, objectives, information sources and methods used to conduct the current study.

### Table 1.1: Research objectives and methodology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research objectives</th>
<th>Information required</th>
<th>Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To identify the current state of tourism, and the activities and preferences of tourists in Rafsanjan</td>
<td>Travelling preferences such as type of tourism in Rafsanjan, time spent, type of accommodation preferred, expenditure trends while travelling</td>
<td>Secondary data sources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To investigate the drivers for Rafsanjani workers and professionals toward greening jobs in tourism</td>
<td>Motivation and incentives for working in tourism jobs, drivers that encourage people for doing their job in a more environmentally-friendly way</td>
<td>Semi-structured interviews, self-interviewing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To explore the barriers to greening tourism jobs by Rafsanjani workers and professionals</td>
<td>Impediments and deterrents to working in tourism jobs, barriers that stop people from applying the green process in doing their jobs</td>
<td>Semi-structured interviews, self-interviewing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.2. **Significance of the study**

Existing studies have produced reports, assessments, and definitions to build a picture of the development of green jobs in countries around the world (United Nations (UN) 2016; Jarvis et al. 2011, p. 55; Welbergen, Williams & Goosen n.d.). Previous studies have also focussed on defining green jobs and green job assessment. However, a more comprehensive method, integrating verbal and textual statements, self-interviews and semi-structured interviewing, to understand the workers’ and professionals’ opinions of green jobs in the tourism industry, is yet to be developed (Jacob, Quitzow & Bär 2015; Department of Environment and Climate Change (DECC) 2009). Against this backdrop, this research study aimed to further understand workers’ and professionals’ preferred way of conducting their tourism-related jobs and businesses. The researcher hopes that the findings add to existing knowledge of the drivers of, and barriers to, developing green jobs in tourism. Such findings would provide professionals and workers with in-depth insight into the drivers for, and barriers to choosing green tourism-related jobs. As well, this would be one of the studies in which such depth of understanding of these types of jobs has been reached.

1.3. **Overview of the research design**

To help identify green jobs in tourism in Rasfanjan and their development, this study utilised qualitative methodology for the data collection and analysis. Qualitative data helps to describe people’s complex experiences and ideas about the topic in question, in the most manageable and simplified way (Hammarberg, Kirkman & De Lacey 2016). The methods used in this study are: analysis of secondary data, semi-structured interviews and self-interviews (Hammersley 2013; Tsene 2016; Tracy 2012; Allett, Keightley & Pickering 2011).

Each chapter of the thesis is described briefly in Figure 1.2 below to obtain an overall idea of the content.
1.4. **Structure of the thesis**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1</td>
<td>• Introduction: briefly explains the content literature, gaps in the information, destination overview, aims and objectives, methodology and a summary of the whole study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2</td>
<td>• Literature review: consists of five areas, including transformation toward green economy, implication of green economy for employment, contribution of jobs to transformation of economy, green jobs in tourism, drivers and barriers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3</td>
<td>• Research design: the reason for choosing the case study and how it was conducted; followed by an explanation of the data collection and analysis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4</td>
<td>• Case study: a destination overview starting with a brief history of Rafsnjan; the strong points and popular types of tourism; and environmental problems and challenges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5</td>
<td>• Findings: an extensive explanation about the results of the interviews and analysing them based on the global standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 6</td>
<td>• Discussion and conclusion: considering the situation in Iran and the way forward.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 1.2: Chapter structure of the thesis**

The central aim of greening jobs is to protect the global economy, society and the environment simultaneously. This involves a shift from a short-term, job-defensive, ecologically destructive focus, to a long-term view in which building a sustainable green economy is central. This is possible, by addressing two questions: what are the drivers for green jobs, and what are the barriers to green jobs? Answering these questions may
highlight why the economy is delaying a greener economy, jobs and skills in Iran (ILO 2018b), and importantly, what can inspire the economy to gain a green vision.
CHAPTER 2
LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. Introduction

An overview and the significance of this study were provided in Chapter 1. This chapter presents a review of the literature to position this research within the existing knowledge about green jobs. Section 2.2 discusses the transformation toward a green economy by giving a background on the broader issue of sustainability, green economy and green growth. Section 2.3 discusses the implications of a green economy for employment, upskilling, creating new jobs and greening current jobs. Section 2.4 focuses on the contribution of jobs to the transformation of the economy. Section 2.5 investigates the previous and possible drivers for, and barriers to greening jobs in tourism. Finally, Section 2.6 explores the implications of green jobs for tourism.

2.2. Transformation toward green economy

Threatening consequences of climate change call for critical action (Goods 2014; ILO 2013a, 2013c). The concept of green jobs emerged in the 1970s and 1980s in various countries, including the United States and Australia. This shows that green jobs is not a new concept; however, two relatively recent crises have led to this concept becoming more urgent than ever before (Goods 2014; Stoevska, Elezi & Muraku 2014; Jacob, Quitzow & Bär 2015; ILO 2018a; Rafferty & Yu 2009). The first crisis was the start of a long recession and the crash of the financial system in 2008. This global financial recession was triggered by various economic factors such as the destruction of the housing market bubble, the collapse of the stock market, bankruptcy of key financial institutions, job losses, and corporate bailouts, and government interventions into the affairs of financial institutions (Goods 2014; OECD 2017). The second crisis that highlighted the more urgent need for green jobs are the environmental impacts of climate change and the threat it poses to the survival of human beings (Goods 2014; OECD 2017). Other looming environmental threats include species extinction, desertification, water shortages, air pollution, deforestation, water salinity, resource depletion, and biological contamination (Goods 2014; Federal Public Service Employment Labour and Social Dialogue 2010). The principal challenge confronting societies around the world is the contribution of human beings to the aforementioned problems (Goods 2014, p.12). Despite the hard
efforts to reduce carbon emissions and recent economic downturns, these emissions are continuing to grow (Goods 2014; Consoli et al. 2016). Environmental and economic uncertainty needs to be solved, and one legitimate solution for that would be green capitalism, central to which is the creation of green jobs (Goods 2014; Jeenbaeva 2015). Section 2.2.1 provides an overview of sustainability. Section 2.2.2 investigates the green economy and green growth, and finally, Section 2.2.3 focuses on sustainable tourism.

2.2.1. Sustainability

The concept of sustainable development arose at a meeting of the United Nations in the twentieth century (Hák, Janoušková & Moldan 2016). Many countries came together to find a solution to numerous ecological problems. This gathering resulted in the development of policy agendas, which became the basis of sustainable development (Dernbach 2000). This agenda recognised that preventing environmental destruction would rely on acknowledging the interconnection of environment, society and economy (Strange & Bayley 2008). The term sustainable development would provide a framework, process and a final goal for carrying out development in a way that balances the needs of environment, society and economy, to prevent ecological destruction. Further to this, sustainable development is about meeting human need in a responsible way (Strange & Bayley 2008). It is defined as “a multidimensional concept, that relates economic, environmental and social development on the local, national and international level, with stakeholders in current and further generations that have to be recognized by all partners on local, national and international level” (Gorenak 2016, p. 960).

Every agenda including sustainable development seeks to achieve certain goals. Sustainable development follows UN Millennium development goals (Robert, Parris & Leiserowitz 2005). These represent the three main principles of sustainable development which includes environmental integrity, economic prosperity and social equity (Bansal 2005). Later in this chapter, it will be explained that green jobs follow the same goals as sustainable development, but in more detail.

2.2.2. Green economy and green growth

Sustainable development is a broad concept that can be misinterpreted. Thus, more recently the terms “green growth” and “green economy” have come to the fore (Kasztelan
Green growth refers to the function of the economy with regards to the environment and its utilisation. The relation between green growth, green economy and sustainable development is presented in Figure 2.1.

In the above figure, SD will stand for sustainable development and it will be achieved if green growth and green economy are reached. In this figure, green growth and green economy are described as GG and GE, respectively. The main elements of green growth are “valuing natural assets and environmental sustainability, making pollution costlier, reforming environmentally harmful subsidies, innovation and green technology development and labour market policies, leveraging private investment and greening consumer behaviour” (Kasztelan 2017, p. 495). Green growth is defined by various institutions and people. The OECD (2011) has the most reliable and understandable definition, that it “...aims to foster economic growth and development, while ensuring that natural assets are used sustainably, and continue to provide the resources and environmental services on which our well-being relies...” (Kasztelan 2017, p. 489). The OECD (2012a, 2012b) also elaborated on green growth strategies, which are fruitful tools for creating a green economy. Green job creation is one such tool. In practice, these strategies are designed to generate sustainable use of natural resources, energy and material efficiency, that ultimately values the environment (Kasztelan 2017).
Green economy is constituted by five dimensions: the first is inputs which produce goods and services, including labour and capital. Second is the way in which waste is managed. Third is how GHG and emissions are managed, and the fourth is how abiotic (mineral, water, land, and so forth.) and biotics (animals, plants, and so forth.) are managed. The fifth dimension is individual and organisational concerns and actions for the environment (Peters, Eathington & Swenson 2011).

A green growth strategy should facilitate four objectives. First, creating a new framework that includes the economy, the environment and society. Second, this strategy should come up with some policies for transferring to a sustainable economy. Thirdly, it should be a rich source of data and information that informs a transition to a green economy. Finally, it must focus on employment issues such as creating short-term and long-term jobs, training, learnings and opportunities (Schneider 2016). Figure 2.2 depicts the function of a conventional economic model compared to the green growth model. The figure shows that this model is more thorough and comprehensive, as it assesses both quantitative and qualitative aspects. This ensures that there is not a one-sided vision of the economy.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic-environment links</th>
<th>Conventional economic model</th>
<th>Green growth model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environmental protection viewed as competing with economic growth</td>
<td>Environmental protection and provision of ecological services viewed as key components of economic growth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning perspective</td>
<td>Short- to medium-term perspective</td>
<td>Long-term perspective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy perspective</td>
<td>Government policy interventions to correct market failures; encourage green technologies; management practices, structural changes, and changing consumer behaviour to facilitate adjustment</td>
<td>Government policy interventions to correct for market failures; encourage green technologies; management practices, structural changes, and changing consumer behaviour to facilitate adjustment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scope of environmental responsibility</td>
<td>Government environmental agencies and private sector units responsible for environmental management</td>
<td>All government agencies, private sector units, and wider societal stakeholders responsible for environmental management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental policy interventions</td>
<td>Improvements to existing modalities of consumption and production</td>
<td>Changes to patterns of economic activity to reduce environmental pressure, enhance provision of ecosystem services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic policy interventions</td>
<td>Taxes and charges on environmental externalities</td>
<td>Targeted support and fiscal incentives to green innovation, businesses and jobs, taxes and charges on environmental externalities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic indicators</td>
<td>Measure rate and level of economic growth, e.g. GDP, productivity</td>
<td>Measure quantitative and qualitative aspects of growth or well-being, including environmental quality, resource use efficiency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental indicators</td>
<td>Measure resource use and output of pollutants</td>
<td>Measure linkages between economic activity, resource and energy use and environmental damage, and provision of environmental goods and services, measure output of pollutants and GHG emissions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy indicators</td>
<td>Overall level of support and production effects of changing levels of support</td>
<td>Changes in composition of support and production and environmental effects of changing policy measures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 2.2: Conventional economic model vs. green growth model**

Source: OECD 2011.

Rio+20 shed some light on the notion of green economy. It was considered a significant means for reaching sustainable development and poverty alleviation (UNEP 2011). UNEP (2010) defined the green economy as “...a system of economic activities related to the production, distribution and consumption of goods and services that result in improved human well-being over the long term, while not exposing future generations to significant environmental risks or ecological scarcities…” (Kasztelan 2017, p. 491; United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) 2012 p. 51; ILO 2013c, p. 34; UNEP 2008; Rademaekers, Svatikova & Yearwood 2015, p. 104). Green economy and green jobs place emphasis on three pillars:
- Assessing the degree of investment in greening different sectors of the economy and improvement in these areas
- Measuring environmental degradation footprints by considering resource depletion
- Considering and assessing the well-being of the society as defined by people’s access to basic resources, education, health and social security (Bruvoll et al. 2012; Inderst, Kaminker & Stewart 2012).

Every economy has a pathway from a brown, dirty economy to becoming a green economy. This is illustrated in Figure 2.3.

**Figure 2.3: Six building blocks in the transition to a green economy**  
Source: Fedrigo-Fazio and Brink 2012.

The process to a green economy from a brown, dirty economy starts with avoiding unsustainable activities in everyday business approaches. It then moves to managing the environment in an active way through risk management and investment in natural capital. Lastly, economies should be greened through various mechanisms of eco-efficiency to ensure a sustainable future (Fedrigo-Fazio & Brink 2012).
Greening the economy can have various benefits for society, the environment and the economy. Conservation of natural resources, improving biodiversity and the ecosystem, reducing GHG and carbon emissions, and climate resilience are the main outcomes of a green economy (UNEP 2008a; Bayside City Council 2016; Peters, Eathington & Swenson 2011). The benefits in social and economic terms, include providing society with more jobs and skills; increasing the potential of production; providing people with more sustainable, and therefore efficient businesses; penetrating new markets and producing new goods; being viable economically and flourishing the rural economy; and lastly, including citizens in all decisions (Kőves 2015, Bushehri 2012).

The emergence of a green economy and green growth are aligned with global efforts to create sustainable economies and development (Kasztelan 2017). By encouraging these strategies, any society and economy would be successful in reducing pollution. This would involve more efficient use of natural resources, improving social welfare through green economics, and finally, by following the path of SD (Kasztelan 2017; Cai et al. 2011).

2.2.3. Sustainable tourism

Tourism is one of the biggest industries in the world. Given its effect on the global economy, it is considered as one of the pillars of a sustainable, albeit flourishing economy (Weaver 2006, OECD 2013). As the tourism industry developed and expanded around the world following World War II, the need to lead this industry to sustainability was inevitable. Thus, “sustainable tourism” started to evolve because of internal and external development in the tourism industry in the ensuing decades (Weaver 2006). To have an acceptable idea for solving problems in tourism, a holistic and systematic view is needed, though it has been argued that small-scale tourism is preferable to mass tourism (Weaver & Lawton n.d.; Weaver & Lawton 2014). Subsequently, the idea of sustainable tourism came to be more well known. UNWTO (2014) described sustainable tourism as “Tourism which leads to management of all resources in such a way that economic, social and aesthetic needs can be fulfilled while maintaining cultural integrity, essential ecological processes, biological diversity and life support systems.” (Zolfani et al. 2015, p. 3). The need for sustainable tourism comes from the need for a balanced relationship between the economy, the environment and society. Considering climate change and global warming,
the need for sustainable tourism is crucial. This point is particularly salient, given tourism’s massive global scale (Mola, Shafaei & Mohamed 2012; Ghabadi & Verdian 2016).

As we need to live on a planet with a healthy environment, it is necessary to prioritise environmental issues. Ignoring the environment in tourism planning can result in irrecoverable destruction (Jenkins & Schröder 2013; Bosak & McCool 2016). All components of the tourism sector need to be involved in striving for sustainability (Jenkins & Schröder 2013). This includes workers in the tourism sector who should also be managed to do their job sustainably. As well, SMEs, which dominate the tourism sector, account for 80% of all tourism businesses worldwide, and thus, pose a significant challenge to achieving sustainability in tourism (Lipman et al. 2012; Bosak & McCool 2016). UNEP has pointed out that green tourism awareness mostly exists among larger companies, yet they still face the challenge of behaving with hypocrisy (Lipman et al. 2012). Small companies though, must be prepared for and educated in environmental issues and the advantages of sustainability. In the research for this thesis, I focus on the role of workers or employees in the tourism sector, and how they can contribute to sustainability.

2.3. Implication for employment

The transition of the economy to a more sustainable model will bring major changes to the employment world (OECD 2017). Environmental deterioration and resource reduction have become a more urgent challenge, as the population and product demand increase (Hess et al. 2018; Cai et al. 2011). The careers that are committed to the protection of the environment and reducing on humanity’s environmental footprint, give societies reliable ways of moving to a green economy.

It is important to describe and measure green jobs to realise the interconnection between environmental sustainability and the labour market (ILO 2013c). A joint effort was launched by various organisations in 2008 to tackle the environmental problem by providing a comprehensive definition of green and decent jobs (ILO 2013d; Jarvis et al. 2011). These definitions are outlined later in the current section.

Green economy can have short, medium and long-term effects on employment (Jacob, Quitzow & Bär 2015). Short-term effects are the direct influence of green
standards on businesses. In a green economy, when a decision is required for increasing the prices of resources, businesses should work with more intensity to make up for the loss because of new and increasing expenses (Jacob, Quitzow & Bär 2015). Naturally, medium-term effects follow the initial direct effects on employment. These include changes to job processes and the development of new industries, jobs and markets. Some benefits might be taken away from certain jobs because of increasing energy expenses. However, on the contrary, new opportunities can emerge for producing and exporting environmentally-friendly technologies (Jacob, Quitzow & Bär 2015). Finally, long-term effects are those resulting from green innovation. They can create new jobs, processes and new opportunities. Predicting them is difficult, but the results can be rewarding (Jacob, Quitzow & Bär 2015).

The International Labour Organization (ILO), the United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP), the International Organization of Employers (IOE) and the International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC 2012) compiled a joint report about green jobs. That report insisted on the role of jobs in the transformation of an economy to a green economy. These organisations broadly describe a green job “as any decent job that contributes to preserving or restoring the quality of the environment, be it in agriculture, industry, services or administration” (Chernyshev n.d., p. 6). In other words, “green jobs reduce consumption of energy and raw materials, limit GHG emissions, minimize waste and pollution, protect and restore ecosystems, and enable enterprises and communities to adapt to climate change” (Chernyshev n.d., p.6).

The concept of a green job is described perhaps more comprehensively by the ILO as; “transformation of economies, workplaces, enterprises and labour markets into a low-carbon, sustainable economy that provides decent employment opportunities for all. Green jobs are decent jobs in any economic sector (e.g., agriculture, industry, services, administration) which contribute to preserving, restoring and enhancing environmental quality, either through production of environmental outputs, or through use of environmentally-friendly technologies or processes” (UNDP 2016, p. 6; Cecere & Mazzanti 2017, p. 87).

How the green economy and green jobs eventually came into being is illustrated in Figure 2.4.
Figure 2.4: Environmental sustainability: The next economic wave
Source: Goods 2014.

Figure 2.4 illustrates the first job wave as being driven by iron, water power, mechanisation, textiles and commerce. This wave came into being from 1785 till 1845. At around the 1800s, this wave started to change into steam power, railroads, steel and cotton. It was this second wave of economic development that followed the industrial revolution, which changed the face of cities and countries (Goods 2014). Electricity, chemicals, and the internal combustion engine came with the third wave from the beginning of 1900. At this time, automobile factories started to compete for making cars of various designs and types. In 1950, the fourth wave started with petrochemicals, electronics, aviation and space (Goods 2014). The fifth wave started by the late 1900s through digital networks, biotechnology, and software information technology. The new wave, which started from mid-2000, is moving toward sustainability, resource productivity, whole system design, biomimicry, green chemistry, industrial ecology, renewable energy, and green nanotechnology (Goods 2014). In addition, each economic wave requires certain jobs, which are the key part of that economy and essential for its vitality. Those jobs contribute, positively or negatively, to the environment. In the transition through these waves, some jobs disappeared, and new ones were created or substituted.

Green jobs can include a broad range, from highly skilled jobs to lower level roles (Jarvis, 2011). However, environmentally-friendly outputs are not based on green
processes and technologies (Esposto 2016; Dubois & Juwaheer 2012). Therefore, not just the final output, but also the process and necessary technology should be in line with green jobs. For example, green jobs can reduce water consumption or improve recycling systems. (UNDP 2016; Battaglia, Cerrini & Annesi 2018). Green jobs have become the main driver for economic and social development, as they conform to principles of environmental sustainability. Creating opportunities for new technologies, investment and jobs would be possible with moving toward a greener economy. The balance of triple economics, environmental and social areas, which is the main aim of green jobs and green economy, has evolved over time, as represented in Figure 2.5.

![Figure 2.5: The evolution of a key concept from sustainability to green economy](image)

Source: Adapted from Rademaekers, Svatikova & Yearwood 2015.

In the above figure, the shift from negative to positive discourse about environmental costs has changed the focus from sustainable development to green economy. In sustainable development, the aim was economic development, environmental protection and social equity. In green economy, however, the aim changed from economic growth to sustainable and green growth. However, it is difficult to distinguish the difference between green economy and green growth. The latter was used as a strategy to promote green employment and green skills, which enable the transition
to a green economy. Because “greening the economy will involve large scale investment in new technologies, equipment, buildings, and infrastructure”, it is seen as a “silver bullet to restore environmental prospects, economic growth, and also employment gains” (UNEP, 2008a; Cai et al. 2011, p. 5994; ILO 2013e, p. 21). There will be winners and losers, like any other new system, until workers and jobs can adapt to such a new system (Köves 2015).

Jobs accompanying the evolution to a sustainable economy have also evolved into different types of green. The concept of green jobs includes different “streams” or “classes”. It is a dynamic concept such that there are various shades of green job. Thus, the various typologies of green jobs that have arisen, are: deep green jobs, mid green jobs and light green jobs (Goods 2014, p. 12). Deep green jobs are like the construction of energy efficient homes; whereas light green jobs involve mining workers in land rehabilitation. This classification presented in Figure 2.6, was developed by Crowley in 1999.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th><strong>Deep green</strong></th>
<th><strong>Mid green</strong></th>
<th><strong>Light green</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mode</strong></td>
<td>Proactive</td>
<td>Integrative</td>
<td>Reactive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Scope</strong></td>
<td>Long-term</td>
<td>Intermediate-term</td>
<td>Short-term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nature</strong></td>
<td>Transforming</td>
<td>Reforming</td>
<td>Conforming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Objective</strong></td>
<td>Redefine growth</td>
<td>“Ecologise” growth</td>
<td>Enhance growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Operation</strong></td>
<td>Rejectionist</td>
<td>Reinventionist</td>
<td>Accommodationist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Aim</strong></td>
<td>Ecological sustainability</td>
<td>Ecological modernity</td>
<td>Sustainable development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Jobs</strong></td>
<td>Preserving nature</td>
<td>Greening industry</td>
<td>Remediying ecological decline</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 2.6: Green job typology**
Source: Goods 2014.

The target of light green jobs centres on land care, ecological restoration, and pollution control. Examples include tree planting and waste disposal (Goods 2014, p. 13). The main goal of light-green jobs is fulfilling employment and economic benefit rather than environmental concerns. Mid-green jobs, though, represent an attempt to balance environmental and economic purposes. Deep green jobs have a “vision for ecologically responsible, socially desirable, culturally feasible and ethically defensible jobs” (Goods
This framework of categorising green jobs can be a way to assess jobs and how they impact the environment and society. Crowley (1999) identified the mid-green approach as the ideal, which set societies on a greener path, by maximising the number of jobs created that preserve the environment (Crowley 1999).

It seems, however, that deep green jobs are suitable for future planning. Thus, planners and authorities should not be satisfied with mid green jobs as a cure-all for the career and environmental needs of societies. Each one of these approaches leads to a certain level of green economy (Bradbrook et al. 2013).

Green jobs target three main areas in their efforts. These are policy integration (integrating green policies into main national, local and business policies), capacity building (promoting dialogue in green jobs), and the employment model (direct intervention of green jobs in job training, learning, promotions and programmes) (ILO 2012b).

In today’s world, successful governance systems need to focus on the well-being of society and the environment, as much as the economy (Acey & Culhane 2013; Forstater 2014). Ignoring the need for governance that prioritises social and environmental sustainability can lead to sickness and dissatisfaction among the workforce. This could have harmful flow-on effects to the economic system (Pettinger 2017). Greening the economy can be beneficial for employees, providing opportunities for upskilling as new jobs are created or existing ones greened. This process is illustrated in Table 2.1, which includes best practices involved in creating a green economy and is explained later in Section 2.3.1.
Table 2.1: Transition of economy sector to green economy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Sectors most relevant for the green transition</th>
<th>New occupations identified/growing of old occupations (examples)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Energy, waste management, construction (brick manufacturing), transport, telecommunications, agriculture, fishery</td>
<td>In brick manufacturing, chimney sweep operators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barbados</td>
<td>Renewable energy</td>
<td>Electricians, electrical and mechanical engineers, solar PV designers, site assessors, PV installers,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>energy auditors, energy conservation and efficiency specialists, plumbers, specialists in construction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>standards, trainers for project managers, health and safety trainers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Agriculture, manufacturing, energy, building and construction, transport, environmental protection and pollution treatment, services</td>
<td>Wind turbine manufacture, equipment operators, renewable energy management, research and training, engineering, power technology, solar power generation, wind power generation, eco-design for buildings, construction inspectors, building retrofitting workers, electricians, roofers, building inspectors, equipment manufacturer, high-alloy construction workers, metro and e-vehicle bus drivers, recycling and waste management, waste management, solar washing and preparation, decontamination and denitrification equipment manufacture, research and training, energy conservation services, financial consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Costa Rica</td>
<td>Agriculture, food, construction, textile, wood, metalworking, plastics, chemicals, textiles, services</td>
<td>Environmental engineers, food scientists and technologists, environmental civil engineers, environmental designers, nanotechnologists, sustainability specialists, electromechanical technicians, software developers, commercial and industrial designers, industrial engineering technicians, agronomists, biotechnologists, biologists, forest engineers, veterinarians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>Renewable energy, solar and wind energy, energy efficiency, water management, agriculture, manufacturing/extractor</td>
<td>Solar installers, solar service technicians, solar plant managers, electricians with solar expertise, plumbers, heating ventilation and air conditioning technicians, wind turbine technicians, wind plant managers, quality engineers, energy efficiency managers, energy efficiency auditors, plate managers for cleaner production, cleaner production auditors, technicians, supervisors, waste management specialists, organic farm auditors and certifiers, pesticide operators, machine operators (bio-fuel generation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>Agriculture, forestry, industry, waste and the circular economy, construction, renewable energy and maintenance, technology development, geomatics, transport, education sector, green public procurement</td>
<td>Engineers, technicians, construction specialists, green architects and designers, harvesters, forage and crop operators, woodworkers, personnel dealing with eco-depleting substances, biology teachers and scientists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>Biodiversity, agriculture, energy, water, cold waste management, environmental education, climate change education, disaster risk management</td>
<td>New occupations identified in the energy sector and for the Guyana Energy Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Energy, construction</td>
<td>Industrial energy auditors and managers, construction building energy managers and auditors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyzstan</td>
<td>Agriculture, construction, mining, metalworking, ecotourism</td>
<td>Agronomists, agricultural engineers, machine operators, estimating engineers, watchmen, crane operators,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>mine workers, metalworkers, masons, welders, millers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>Renewable energy, tourism, private sector/green business, public sector</td>
<td>Technicians, PV installers, energy auditors, eco-tourism operators, eco-guides, eco-entrepreneurs, green public officials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Menecongo</td>
<td>Tourism, agriculture and energy sectors</td>
<td>Production and installation of energy-efficient windows and doors, organic production, mountain guides</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Public sector/green procurement, cold waste management and garbage collection, renewable energy, tourism</td>
<td>Green procurement managers, operators of sanitary landfills, project engineers, environmental and social safeguard focal persons, renewable energy experts, hydrologists, wind, solar and biomass experts, biologists, chemists and disposal officers, solar PV fitters, aerospace technicians, wind-turbine technicians, offshore oil/wind maintenance technicians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>Forestry, waste, services, energy</td>
<td>Forest and environmental agents, qualified workers in hunting activities, forest fire workers, qualified workers in forestry and natural environmental activities, prevention of labour and environmental risk agents, waste classification workers, environmental and forest technicians, vehicle cleaners, sweepers, power plant technicians, electricity technicians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Renewable energy, hydropower, agriculture, ecotourism, construction</td>
<td>Organic farmers, managers, energy auditors, engineers, operational and maintenance specialists in hydropower, solar and biomass energy, solar panel installers, tour operators, eco-guides</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Energy</td>
<td>Carbon-related project analysts, green marker officers, public relations officers, green engineers, green architects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Agriculture, industry, energy, oil and transport</td>
<td>Production and processing of organic products, soil fertility management, weeding and post-harvest handling</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Adapted from World Employment and Social Outlook (WESO) 2018.
As evident in Table 2.1, a number of countries have initiated a transition to a green economy. Specifically, Kyrgyzstan, Mauritius, Montenegro and the Philippines included in their strategies for creating sustainable economies relevant modifications to their tourism sectors (WESO, 2018).

### 2.3.1. Upskilling, new job creation and greening current jobs

By shifting to a greener economy, restructuring occupations and skills is the first move (CEDEFOP & ILO 2010). Greening the economy would change skill needs in many ways, such as: 1) Such major changes would increase the demand for employment in some sectors while reduce the demand in others; 2) The new economy would need new jobs that require new training and qualifications; 3) The process of greening the economy would happen in many industries and segments of the economy, necessitating various systemic adjustments (Martinez-Fernandez, Ranieri & Sharpe 2013; Esposto 2016).

The process of greening skills and jobs can happen in four different ways, as follows:

Top-down green jobs/skills projects: This concerns the decisions of managers and higher ranks in the system to adapt the business to green strategies. An example should be the green jobs approach currently being taken in China.

Bottom-up green jobs/skills projects: Developing green jobs and skills for workers and then making allies with stakeholders and managers to develop green strategies. The green job project in Asia was done with a bottom-up approach.

Project mainstreaming green jobs and skills: The focus of this approach to greening is on employment and education. Direct green jobs are in these projects. SMEs’ initiative in South Africa and the Jordan green job projects followed this approach.

Indirect approach: The projects that support green jobs and skills in an indirect way. Green jobs and skills were not the main drivers of the projects. The program of DIREKT in Europe was an indirect approach which mainly involved training for transferring into renewable energies; however, there was no green job documentation (Rademaekers, Svatikova & Yearwood 2015).
Transition to a green economy is possible by making sure that the labour force is transferring their skills into the new economy, with new requirements. Even small changes in skills can have a significant impact (Martinez-Fernandez, Ranieri & Sharpe 2013). However, there may be some challenges to greening skills. These could include skill shortages, difficulties with implementing green skills, fundamental shifts in employment resulting from green transition. Also, fundamental changes to green occupations could result in difficulties acquiring green skills (ILO, OECD, CEDEFOP, Eft & Unitar 2013). There are some recommendations provided to tackle these challenges.

The core principles offered by the industry skill council outline the following three specific characters of greening skills (Strietska-Iliina et al. 2011):

Industry-specific: the sustainability plans should be tailored to the specific job or industry in which they are located.

Appropriate timing: the time needed to acquire new environmental-friendly skills differ based on the type of industry affected. This should be planned for in advance to ensure a smoother transition.

Value adding: environmental skills should add value to enterprises. Acquiring these skills should not be a burden or an extra expense for them (Strietska-Iliina et al. 2011).

There are some challenges to greening skills that should be addressed by proper planning. This planning is categorised in three groups, namely greening existing jobs, training new workers for newer industries, and anticipating the future demand for green skills (Strietska-Iliina et al. 2011).

In the career world, competitive advantage is the main motivation for accepting a change (Martinez-Fernandez, Ranieri & Sharpe 2013). However, failure to adapt to green skills can jeopardise the process of greening the economy. Optimising economic policies, growing portable skills, fostering a culture of lifelong learning, investing in R&D to fill in gaps in knowledge and being transparent about environmental reports are sometactics to avoid the negative effects of transitioning the economy (Martinez-Fernandez, Ranieri & Sharpe 2013). The emerging green economy sets demands for upskilling and green jobs. Making green jobs implies create new jobs or greening current jobs. Some examples
of the types of skill changes required for transitioning to a green economy are provided in Figure 2.7.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Degree of skill change</th>
<th>Occupational change</th>
<th>Typical skills response</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>None or only quantitative</td>
<td>None or increased training in existing occupation</td>
<td>Bus driver in compressed natural gas (CNG) buses; national park ranger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Changing established occupation</td>
<td>On-the-job learning or short training courses</td>
<td>Welder in wind turbine production; organic farmer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>Changing or emerging occupation</td>
<td>Short courses or longer continuous training</td>
<td>Energy consultant in building; car mechanic for electric or CNG cars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>New and emerging occupation</td>
<td>Initial training, university degree or longer continuous training</td>
<td>Solar energy technician; eco-designer; biofuels technician</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 2.7: Changes in skills and occupations for green jobs**  
Source: Adapted from Jacob, Quitzow & Bär 2015.

Strietska-Irina et al. (2011) suggested a green skill checklist which consists of skills that need to be greened. These skills include design skills, waste skills, energy skills, water skills, building skills, transport skills, material skills, financial skills, management skills and finally, policy and planning skills. Figure 2.8 shows two levels of greening these skills. This general framework can be used for greening current jobs or creating a framework for any new job.

The new green economy demands new jobs, due to changes in technologies, as well as processes essential for these jobs. In addition, the changes required in qualifications, education and profile of workers add to the need for the creation of new jobs. Some organisations will change their work processes, while others will substitute old for new jobs. The birth of new occupations will lead to new employment opportunities (Erwin 2011; Keivani et al. 2010). Creating new jobs is a long-term effect of transferring to a green economy and requires the use of green innovation (Cecere & Mazzanti 2017). The number of new jobs created depends on the level of demand and degree of investment (ILO 2013e).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level 1</th>
<th>Level 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Design skills</td>
<td>Eco-design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Green manufacturing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Materials specification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Life-cycle assessment/costing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Waste skills</td>
<td>Waste quantification and monitoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Waste process studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Waste management systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Waste minimization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Waste technologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Energy skills</td>
<td>Energy minimization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Energy management systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Energy quantification and monitoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Energy costs and trading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Renewable energy (RE) technologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Non-renewable technologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Water skills</td>
<td>Water use minimization and water re-use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Water management systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Water quantification and monitoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Buildings skills</td>
<td>Building energy management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Integration of renewable energy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Energy-efficient construction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Facilities management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Calculating building energy efficiency and carbon ratings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Facilities management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Calculating building energy efficiency and carbon ratings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Transport skills</td>
<td>Transport impact minimization technologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport impact minimization processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transport management in business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Materials skills</td>
<td>Sourcing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Procurement and selection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Material use and impact quantification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Management systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Impact and use minimization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Financial skills</td>
<td>Investment models</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New/alternative financial models</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quantification of climate change impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Principles of low-carbon and resource-efficient economies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tools of low-carbon and resource-efficient economies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Management skills</td>
<td>Impact assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Business planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Awareness raising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Opportunities management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Risk management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Day to day management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Policy and planning skills</td>
<td>Built environment master planning and implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strategy implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strategy development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 2.8: Green skills checklist**

Source: Adapted from Strietska-Illina et al. 2011.
The most efficient way to create green jobs is to green current jobs. Upskilling is important as a unique factor for both creating new jobs or greening current jobs (Bruvoll et al. 2012; Gast, Gundolf & Cesinger 2017). Figure 2.9 shows that transitioning existing jobs to a green economy is of greatest importance. This is followed by the utilisation of generic skills such as those of a solar panel worker and also specialised skills such as those of a solar panel technologist (Bruvoll et al. 2012).

![Classification of skills needed for a transition to a low carbon economy](image)

**Figure 2.9: Classification of skills needed for a transition to a low carbon economy**
Source: Adapted from Bruvoll et al. 2012.

2.4. **Contribution of jobs to transformation**

Green jobs play an important role to ensure the sustainability of the environment and the inclusion of society. There is also a need for the economy to balance these elements (UNEP, 2008a). Addressing these three elements will help to solve the challenges of society and the environment with regards to the economy. The environment, society and economy are inextricably linked together (ILO n.d.a; Öjermark 2007; ILO 2013e, ILO 2018a; OECD 2017). Ignoring this will lead to a global crisis. The rate of growth in the economy, creating jobs and income depend on natural resources, which can also be degraded by them. Considering this, it is essential that these areas be viewed as interdependent. Indeed, union leaders have found green jobs to be a “win-win” solution for both industry and the environment (Carfi & Schilirò 2012; UNEP 2008a). Various problems of the decline in manufacturing and deterioration of the environment can be
solved by introducing green production, decreasing unemployment by introducing new jobs and underemployment by insisting on decent jobs (UNEP 2008; Jarvis, Varma & Ram 2011). Social protections would also be provided by decent jobs (Jarvis, Varma & Ram 2011).

The idea of green jobs facilitates the alliance between the environment, society and industry (Taylor 2011). The green job notion opens the way to create high-quality jobs in all industry areas. Labour and environmental movements are the key drivers of transforming jobs into green jobs. The coalition of labour- and the environment, which is famously known as the “blue-green” affiliation is generally associated with the difficulty of building and maintaining relationship (Masterman-Smith & Cottle 2014). This is a common reason why it is difficult to put environment and labour together; however, the green job notion is making it more possible and simpler to make this happen (Hess et al. 2018, p. 2; Penney 2002).

Transforming the economy toward a sustainable economy by greening jobs offers some major benefits:

1. It can bring about a great number of additional, premium and first-rate jobs with a career development path.
2. The quality of jobs would be lifted which could assist millions of people currently living in poverty.
3. Clean energy, energy-efficient living facilities would be more efficiently provided to ordinary people in society (Hess et al. 2018; Bowen 2012; Martinez-Fernandez, Hinojosa & Miranda 2010).

Despite the major benefits involved in transferring to green jobs, there are also some challenges. First, the transformation of jobs may cause job losses in some sectors. Second, climate change has already started affecting the livelihood of people, societies and economies. Third, some environmental policies can affect society in an adverse way such as through loss of jobs.

1. By differentiating “green” jobs in the market, the potential to increase market share exists for producers. Essentially, they would contribute to economic growth while improving environmental practices and helping to guarantee the long-term sustainability
of the resource (ILO 2012b; Borasan & Xinyi 2016). This would typically involve the following processes:

(i) Setting some standards as best practices;
(ii) Setting up an auditing process to assess the adaptability of products to green standards;
(iii) Having a tracing process to show the products’ or services’ place in the market; and
(iv) Labelling products to display to the market their adherence to green standards and differentiate them in the marketplace (OECD 2012b, p. 15).

Green jobs involve a wide range of skills, educational backgrounds, and occupational profiles (UNEP 2008a; OECD & Cedefop 2014; OECD 2010). This can be envisaged in the delivery of services, as both the services, processes and technologies used to produce it must all be green. Green jobs can be created in all sectors and types of enterprises, or in any area, through three types of work: direct, indirect and income-induced jobs (Bradbrook et al. 2013). Direct jobs are created with the production of green goods and services. Indirect jobs are created by the essential processes in the making, handling and selling of goods and services. Income-induced jobs are created when savings from energy-intensive sectors become more labour-intensive investments (UNEP 2008a; Bradbrook et al. 2013). Both developed countries and developing countries have the potential for green jobs, with this potential sometimes being higher in developing countries. Employment will be affected in at least four ways as the economy is oriented toward green jobs:

1. New jobs will be created such as adding pollution-control devices to existing production equipment.
2. Some jobs will be substituted, for instance changing the from fossil fuel to renewable energies.
3. Certain jobs may be eliminated without direct replacement. A classic example is coal mining jobs.
4. Many existing jobs would change their skill set, methods or profiles (UNEP 2008a; Bradbrook et al. 2013; Strietska-Iлина et al. 2011; Peters, Eathington & Swenson 2011; Martinez-Fernandez, Hinojosa & Miranda 2010; ILO 2017c).
“The pace of green job creation will accelerate in the years ahead. A global transition to low carbon and sustainable economy will create large numbers of green jobs across many sectors of the economy and indeed can become an engine of sustainable development” (UNEP 2008a, p. 3; Martinez-Fernandez, Hinojosa & Miranda 2010, p. 18).

2.5. Drivers for, and barriers to green jobs

It is commonly argued that green jobs are not yet the priority of job holders (Hardcastle 2014), and that both workers and professionals are not yet engaged. There have been various quantitative studies into this issue (Perrett 2011; Bradbrook et al. 2013; Bond, Pacifici & Newman n.d.; Ghazilla et al. 2015; Kasim & Ismail 2012). Others have taken the perspective of production rather than services (Leff 2000; Tsai, Liu & Li 2017). In addition, drivers and barriers were mostly assessed from a demand point of view rather than from a supply side perspective (Brécard et al. 2009; Ma et al. 2015; Sardianou & Genoudi 2013; Zarnikau 2003; Baker, Davis & Weaver 2013). Some studies have taken a supply side point of view to discover drivers and barriers to a sustainable supply chain (Walker, Sisto & McBain 2008; Sarkis, Zhu & Lai 2011; Diabat & Govindan 2011; Ahi & Searcy 2013). However, there have been limited efforts in the field of tourism and green services more broadly. Previous studies also approached this topic by publishing multiple reports about the jobs done in various countries and continents around the world (Battaglia, Cerrini & Annesi 2018; Bozkurt & Stowell 2016; Cai et al. 2011; Cecere & Mazzantic 2017; Connolly, Allan & McIntyre 2016; Elliott & Lindley 2017).

Knowing about drivers of green employment is important because some companies either disregard sustainability. Even worse, some attempt to greenwash the public about their unsustainable practices. An increasing number have announced “ambitious goals” to “reduce their carbon footprint or make their operations carbon neutral” (UNEP2008a, p. 5). However, it is not obvious how many of these goals will become a reality. Perrett (2011) believes that although there is a lack of enthusiasm for greening jobs, there is also a lack of awareness about the value to business of making such changes. Providing compelling proof of any of these benefits could accelerate the process of greening jobs (Perrett 2010). Therefore, identifying drivers of this process is crucial.

Lee (2015) discovered a comprehensive set of drivers which included: 1) Financial drivers; 2) Strategic drivers, which include a long-term greening strategy; 3)
Informational and supportive drivers, which raise or maintain awareness; 4) Human resource drivers, which include commitment from top management, staff training, green demands from customers and even pressure from environmental NGOs; and 5) Situational and environmental drivers which include working conditions, corporate environmental responsibilities, or international competition (Lee 2015, p. 21). The Environmental Investment Organisation (EIO 2015, pp. 7, 8) mentioned that the three main drivers considered as most important to greening jobs are: a “Well-established, fast-growing and innovative environmental technologies sector; high environmental standards; significant increase in funding in the area of company-related research and technology development” (Giljum 2015, p. 7, 8).

Others have unearthed various barriers and drivers to greening jobs. According to Rohdin, Thollander and Solding (2006, p. 8), the main barriers are: “access to capital, technical risks, lack of budget funding and difficulty in obtaining information about energy consumption of purchased equipment”; while the main drivers are: “long-term strategy, people with real ambition and environmental company profile”.

UNEP (2008) compiled the drivers of green jobs in a joint report. The report points out several drivers being effective to greening jobs from the government’s point of view. These include forward-thinking government policies, general goal and standard setting, providing essential infrastructures, creating and maintaining a suitable environment for all stakeholders. This report also contains some policies, which may incentivise reaching green job goals. These are subsidies, a carbon market for fixing the current problems and facilitating green projects and employment, tax reform by scaling up eco-taxes, targets and mandates, energy alternatives, product takeback for taking back products at the end of their useful life, ecolabelling, increasing R&D budgets and having more international aid (UNEP 2008a).

Drivers measured by the European Agency for Safety and Health at Work (Bradbrook et al. 2013) were government controls, government incentives, environment, renewable energy technologies, economic growth, energy efficiency improvements, public opinion and growth in waste management and recycling. It is important to point out that this study was done in Europe and it was a quantitative survey. UNEP, however, in another report in 2008, mentioned that the most significant driver of green jobs is “the
substantial growth in investment necessary to achieve internationally agreed climate mitigation and adaptation objectives” (UNEP 2008a, p. 8).

Interestingly, a study in Sri Lanka found that two main drivers of the adoption of sustainable practices in manufacturing were awareness and commitments from executive management, and economic benefits (Kulatunga, Jayatilaka & Jayawickrama 2013). This study also mentioned the top three drivers of green production were pressure from the market, the potential of the concept of sustainability as a marketing tool, government promotions and regulations (Kulatunga, Jayatilaka & Jayawickrama 2013). In addition, according to most surveys, the availability of funds for green projects, is considered a big incentive.

In contrast, the main drivers in the study by Dvořáková (2016) were low cost or no cost, demand from investors, staff wellbeing, company image and corporate social responsibility. This study was conducted in Prague on sustainable offices, and not directly on green jobs. Still, it is a significant study as one of the aspects of green jobs is a green workplace. The results of two other studies suggested that the drivers can be external or internal. Examples of the latter were: “organisational values, value champions and cost reduction and external drivers can be access to environmental information, regulatory compliance and monitoring environmental performance” (Walker, Sisto & McBain 2008, p. 79).

A further study, which categorised several drivers was conducted by Ghazilla et al. (2015). This work, which focused on green manufacturing, identified the following driver categories: “legislation, organisational style, eco-knowledge, business environment, societal influence, financial incentives and innovation” (Ghazilla et al. 2015, p. 660).

Some previous studies also explored the barriers to participating in greening jobs. These studies used quantitative methods to capture participants’ ideas about barriers to greening their job processes. Kulatunga, Jayatilaka and Jayawickrama (2013, p. 175) pointed out that workers and professionals’ barriers to engaging in greening job processes include: lack of awareness of the concept, no tax benefits or other rewards from the government, lack of awareness of programmes conducted locally. They suggested that from the manufacturers’ perspective, the barriers were: “lack of awareness of local customers in green products, negative attitudes toward green concepts, less support from
the employees, lack of funds for green projects and difficulties for operation and maintenance”. Again, similar to the drivers, and interesting to note, lack of funds is placed in the last position.

Walker, Sisto & McBain (2008, p. 80) concluded that barriers to participating in greening job processes include internal barriers such as “costs, local nature of the project and lack of resources, and external barriers such as exposing poor environmental performance, lack of information, and fragmented industry”. Dvořáková (2016) suggested insufficient knowledge and education about the benefits, lack of availability of life cycle data, and unstable and unsupportive legislation, as barriers to sustainability.

“Unwillingness to pay additional costs, lack of developer awareness, high cost and low benefit, lack of owner awareness, poor access to the information, low customer demand, limited availability to new technology, unreliable technology and perceived detriment to aesthetics” were discussed as barriers by Bond, Pacifici and Newman (n.d., p. 14). Weak organisational structure, existence of attitude and perception issues about green jobs, weak market position for green job-based products and services, lack of regard for greening throughout society, inadequate R&D and green design, lack of environmental enforcement for green jobs, existence of sunk costs in green jobs and supply difficulties were the barriers pointed out by Ghazilla et al. (2015). They put these barriers in various categories, similar to drivers.

Additional difficulties cited included “lack of information, lack of time, ineffective dissemination of regulatory or legislative information, Slow and cumbersome regulatory systems, lack of capital, attitudes, and lack of customer demand for environmental practices and staff awareness” (Herren & Hadley 2010, p. 4), “lack of technology, low priority” (Lee, 2015 p. 22). Keivani et al. (2010) suggested enough time and resources might help to overcome these difficulties (Keivani et al. 2010, p. 35).

Research on barriers to green jobs in developing countries highlighted various impediments. These include subsidies for energy efficiency projects, limitations of technology, electricity pricing, nature of key players (Keivani et al., 2010, p. 46) and regulatory barriers. Other barriers include identified market-based barriers when the economy does not recognise the value of green jobs, competing philosophies that can be seen in the traditional market environment, “which is against sharing information in and
between businesses” (Moscardo & Moscardo 2013; Moscardo et al. 2013), risk of new ideas, and commercial viability (Moscardo & Moscardo 2013; Moscardo et al. 2013).

2.6. Green jobs in tourism

Competition for tourists’ dollars is high because tourism is integral to successful economies. Thus, it is important that the tourism sector support new economic services that will assist in the transition to a ‘green economy’ (Chernyshev n.d.; Mazilu 2013). As tourism is a major industry around the world, it is effective for countries’ social, economic and environmental wellbeing (Chernyshev n.d.; Hermantoro 2012; Dzhusibalieva et al. 2016; Mazilu 2013). As tourism creates significant employment and wealth, it is crucial that this sector becomes a green industry to ensure its future prosperity (Mazilu 2013). Sustainable tourism and a green economy will not be achievable without green jobs, as tourism is one of the major employers around the world. Tourism’s potential for creating employment makes it even more crucial for transferring to a green economy. There is solid evidence that broad economic, social and environmental benefits for the host and guest communities come from greening tourism jobs (Chernyshev n.d.; Hermantoro 2012; Mazilu 2013). Green jobs in tourism businesses operate according to principles of sustainability (Moscardo & Moscardo 2013; Moscardo et al. 2013). It is not a special form of tourism; rather, all businesses and jobs in tourism should be done based on sustainability principles. These principles include: a long-term commitment to change the way in which business is conducted, balancing the needs of current and future generations, recognition of businesses as complex systems which are interdependent with the environment, society and the economy, management and awareness of natural resources, acknowledgement of multiple sources of capital necessary for improving quality of life and people’s well-being, and special programmes to improve natural capital due to its specific characteristics (Moscardo & Moscardo 2013; Moscardo et al. 2013). Unfortunately, most tourism enterprises are yet to seriously commit to such sustainability principles. This leads to tourism products and services neither meeting the minimum quality standards of green jobs nor being able to nurture the livelihoods of those operating within the industry (ILO 2012b; Gorenak 2016; UNEP 2015).

SDG and MDG (UN Sustainable and Millennium Development Goals) and all other types of environmental programmes are directly and positively linked to green jobs in tourism. Moving to green jobs in the tourism industry will be possible through education
and awareness among workers, professionals, host and guest communities and of course tourists. Government at the local and state levels is of great importance as well (Chernyshev n.d.; Mazilu 2013).

Tourism is made up of a range of sub-sectors. Some sub-sectors are more advanced in following a green path than others. Hotels which were one of the first sub-sectors of tourism to move toward sustainability, started with green labelling and related green standards (Mbasera et al. 2015, 2016; Graci & Kuehnel n.d.). Graci and Kuehnel (n.d.) identified best practices for green hotels. These considered the following aspects: energy, water, waste, green meetings, green building practices, purchasing, promoting the local economy, employee engagement, and social responsibility (Graci & Kuehnel n.d.). Every hotel offers various services which can have an effect on the environment.

Food, beverage and related agricultural systems require specific hygiene and health standards (Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (DEFRA) 2006; Bekele 2017; OECD 2011). Greening food, beverage and agriculture involves major challenges and adjustments (OECD 2011). Producing food uses significant land resources, and this sub-sector, in particular, is crucial in developing countries (OECD 2011), especially for employment.

Ertel et al. (2008) reported that travel agencies are also taking a green path. Korkmaz and Atay (2016) argued that sustainable management, sustainable supply chain management, staff awareness, projects and certification, having sustainable goals and performances, and having natural resource concerns are the main considerations for greening travel agencies. Travel agencies can be categorised into four groups; opportunists - those who are unaware of environmental issues; sensitives - who are tour operators with the intention of contributing to the environment, but for whom money comes first; constructionists - who put environmental and social concerns first; and pro-actives - who play a significant role in conserving local destinations (Korkmaz & Atay 2016).

Retailers play a very significant role in every economy, but also in the tourism sector (Sinha & Dhumes 2014; Sinha 2011). Retailers’ functions can change the mindset of customers. In fact, retailing has powerful promotional power (Sinha & Dhumes 2014; Sinha 2011). Retailers in developed countries have started moving toward sustainability,
while those in developing countries are lagging. Sinha and Dhumes (2014) suggested that eco-literacy, shopping orientation, attitudes and green stores can have a positive effect on green retailing.

Transportation is a key component of the tourism industry. Li (2016) stated that greening transportation is an effective way to help address climate change. Panday and Bansal (2014) highlighted challenges to green transportation in various countries. These included public awareness, smart charging infrastructure, insufficient quality of infrastructure and costs. They claim that to address these problems, the following are necessary: policy changes, increased investment in green infrastructure, and improving the emission standards of vehicles (Li 2016).

In all countries where tourism is a vital part of the economy, it is essential for green jobs to be included in sustainable tourism policies. This includes policy pertaining to employment and business (Chernyshev n.d.). Committing to green jobs and sustainable business can help in cost reduction, increased revenue, better risk profile (reducing the risk of being involved in accidents and litigation), enhanced brand reputation and finally, innovation (UNEP 2009, UNEP & UNWTO 2012). According to UNEP and UNWTO (2012), the main environmental challenges that a green job strategy in the broader tourism sector needs to address include (1) energy and greenhouse gas emissions; (2) water consumption; (3) waste management; and (4) loss of biodiversity.

2.7. Chapter summary

Chapter 2 has dealt with the literature relevant to the aim of this research. This review of the literature considered the importance of tourism in the global economy and the need to focus on the sustainability of the tourism system. It then focussed on how the wider economy, including businesses, can create greener jobs, and the barriers and drivers likely to influence this process. Examples of best practices were also outlined. Further, the challenges for various tourism sub-sectors of becoming ecologically sustainable were discussed. This included discussion of what might be involved in establishing green jobs in these sub-sectors. Finally, this review revealed that there is scant research regarding the greening of jobs in tourism.
CHAPTER 3
RESEARCH DESIGN

3.1. Introduction

The literature review in Chapter 2 focused on previous research on greening tourism jobs and how the current study will extend this literature. Chapter 3 discusses the approach and methods used in this study to achieve the aims stated in Chapter 1. Chapter 3 presents the theoretical paradigms adopted in this study (Section 3.2). This research used the qualitative method which is presented in Section 3.3. Section 3.4, explains the theoretical perspective of this study. Section 3.5 provides an overview of the methodology used in this study. Section 3.6 presents the research methods employed in this study. A clear idea of research design is provided in Section 3.7. The data collection process is presented in Section 3.8 which involves the utilisation of secondary information gathering, one to one semi-structured and self-interviewing with a sample of workers and professionals in tourism jobs in Rafsanjan, Iran. Then data analysis methods are presented (Section 3.9). Ethical considerations are provided in Section 3.10. Finally, the limitations of the research design are discussed in Section 3.11.

3.2. Research paradigm

Neuman (2011) described the paradigm as a “general framework for theory or research” (Neuman 2011, p. 94). A more comprehensive description was offered by Schwandt (2001). This posits that a paradigm is defined as a “shared world view that represents the beliefs and values in discipline and that guides how problems are solved” (Chilisa & Kawulich 2012, p. 1). Certain factors influence choosing a research paradigm: (1) the assumptions about the nature of reality and knowledge, (2) theoretical framework, literature and research practice, and (3) value systems and ethical principles (Chilisa & Kawulich 2012, p. 3). Various approaches are used in tourism studies including critical theory orientation, the participatory paradigm, the interpretive social science approach, positivism and post-positivism (Jennings 2010). The paradigm which the research is grounded in has an effect on different aspects of the research (Guba 1990; Neuman 2011; Chilisa & Kawulich 2012), as follows:

1. Ontological basis: What exists in this world? Our perception of the world and the realities around us.
2. Epistemological basis: How do we know the world in that way? The relationship between the researcher and the research.

3. Methodological basis: How should we study the world? The valid way of collecting data.

4. Axiological basis: What do we believe is true? Valuing the knowledge and the influence of values on the research process.

3.2.1. Used paradigm: Interpretive social science paradigm

The existence of multiple realities is the basis of the interpretive social science paradigm. Based on this assumption, the researcher and the participants create a realisation together about the real and natural world as they experience it (Denzin & Lincoln 2000). This means that for studying and understanding humans, we have to realise “how people construct subjective social reality” (Neuman 2011, p. 48). Four research aspects, under this paradigm, are the following (Denzin & Lincoln 2000; Jennings 2010; Ladyman 2007; Slevitch 2011):

1. Ontological basis: There are multiple realities in this world. Human interactions and meaningful actions can help to explore and construct meanings. Various experiences of human beings create many social realities. These experiences can include people’s knowledge, views, interpretations and experiences. An inductive approach was used in this study which means that the description of the phenomenon was developed in the empirical world.

2. Epistemological basis: The phenomena are understood through the mental process of people’s interaction with social contexts. This comes with experiencing the phenomena in real life or natural settings. The researcher and participants are in a subjective relationship, rather than an objective one; which means that there may be some influences from the researcher on the findings. The data collected are more personal and interactive.

3. Methodological basis: Research under this aspect is the product of the values of the researcher. The qualitative method is used in order to recognise different realities and describe the phenomena from a subject’s perspective.

4. Axiological basis: Knowledge under this dimension is obtained subjectively by the researcher. Propositional knowledge is of great value in this research. It is
connected to social transformation and liberation and is based on instrumental and transactional values (Permilovskiy 2012).

This study took an explanatory approach, which aims to “explain” the tourism phenomenon by examining the “how” and “why” (Jennings 2010). Quantitative methodology, qualitative methodology, or mixed methods can be utilised by the explanatory approach. Using a qualitative approach, under the governance of the “interpretative social science” paradigm is the methodological basis of this work.

Crotty (1998) stated that some elements need to be explained at the start of developing a research design: Epistemology, theoretical perspective, methodology, and methods. It is suggested that epistemology underlies the theoretical perspective. The theoretical perspective determines the rules of the methodology and the methodology is the choice of methods (Crotty 1998, p. 4). Sections 3.3 to 3.4 define the development of these elements in this study.

3.3. Epistemology

Epistemology provides a philosophical basis for deciding what the nature of reality is. This is used to guide what methods will be used to capture that reality. It also enables the researcher to justify those methods (Crotty 1998). Various epistemologies have been identified. These include objectivism, constructionism, and subjectivism. This study was based on constructionism. Crotty (1998) defined constructionism as “the view that all knowledge, and therefore all meaningful reality as such, is contingent upon human practices, being constructed in and out of the interaction between human beings and their world and developed and transmitted with an essential social context” (Crotty 1998, p. 42). Considering this definition, the researcher believes that the meaning is not created; we construct meaning. By re-creating a dialogue between the interviewer and interviewee, the meanings can be developed (Curtis & Curtis 2011; Sarantakos 2008).

3.4. Theoretical perspective

Theoretical perspective is made up of the “assumptions which we bring into our research”, and about our view of the “human world and social life”. These assumptions help to justify the methodology and methods chosen (Crotty 1998, p. 7). Positivism, critical inquiry, feminism, interpretivism, and postmodernism are different theoretical perspectives. In this study, interpretivism was the theoretical perspective adopted. In this
approach, the researcher tries to understand social and human reality. Three streams of interpretivism have been developed. These are hermeneutics, phenomenology, and symbolic interactionism (Crotty 1998). In this study, symbolic interactionism was followed. Three assumptions are underpinning this theoretical position:

1. Humans interact with the world around them based on perceived meaning.
2. Perceived meanings come from social interaction with other people.
3. The process of handling, modifying and interpreting the meanings is to enable one to deal with this world and its phenomena (Crotty 1998).

By undertaking such an approach, shows that this study values tourism workers’ and professionals’ voices.

3.5. Methodology overview

The methodology refers to the research design and helps the researcher to make choices for desired outcomes (Crotty 1998). The methodology determines how the problem can be analysed, and how to make a rational connection between the problem, data gathering, analysis, and conclusion (Jackson, Drummond & Camara 2007). This study adopted a qualitative method.

3.5.1. Qualitative method

A qualitative method approach involves “interpreting, theorizing, or making sense of data by first breaking it down into segments that can be categorized and coded, and then establishing a pattern for the entire data set by relating the categories to one another” (Jackson, Drummond & Camara 2007; Gubrium & Holstein 1997).

Qualitative methodology describes this world from the “inside out”. This means that reality is described from the perspective of participants (Gubrium & Holstein 1997). Interviews are used to collect the data. The sampling method is non-random sampling. Purposive sampling was the non-random sampling method used in this study for the self-interviews. Indeed, this approach to sampling is suitable for gaining a deeper understanding of the phenomena of interest, rather than aiming to generalise the results to a larger population (Neuman 2007, Tongco n.d.). The other reason for using this sampling method is that there were certain criteria that the researcher applied when choosing participants. Convenience sampling was applied to the semi-structured
interview. After choosing the first group of participants, others were also selected by snowballing or chain sampling. This involves interviewees introducing the researcher to other participants.

Data analysis involves the identification of themes from the participants’ interview responses. The findings are usually presented as a written narrative (Jennings 2010).

When using a qualitative methodology, the data is collected in a natural setting through personal interaction. Multiple resources may be used to enrich the results. This type of methodology typically works inductively. The whole process is focused on the meanings in participants’ minds and trying to present a holistic picture of the problem or issue under study (Creswell & Creswell 2018).

There are possible combinations of qualitative methods (Creswell & Creswell 2018, p. 13): (1) Narrative research - studying the life of individuals and their stories; (2) Phenomenological research, which describes individuals’ lived experiences of a phenomenon; (3) Grounded theory, which comprises abstract theory of processes, actions or interactions based on the perspectives of participants. In this research, theory is developed from the data collected; (4) Ethnography, in which a shared culture, language habits and patterns of life of a certain group are studied; and (5) Case studies, developing an up-close, in-depth and detailed analysis of a case by narrowing down a very broad field into a researchable area. Other methodologies include experimental research, survey research, heuristic inquiry, and action research and so forth. (Crotty 1998).

This study used the qualitative method, case study and secondary data, and content analysis to make sense of the data. Using a qualitative framework, method and data as well as secondary data, facilitated a more in-depth exploration of the research questions.

3.6. Research methods

Methods enable data collection and analysis. In other words, gaining information about the world, and to make sense of this information systematically. The methods used in this study (analysing secondary data, semi-structured interviews, and self-interviews) are explained in this section. The strengths, weaknesses and limitations of these approaches are also discussed. Advantages and disadvantages of each method discovered while conducting this study are presented at the end of this section.
3.6.1. Analysing secondary data

Secondary data analysis allows the researcher to collect data through technological advances, which lead to the gathering of a vast amount of data. These data, which are compiled, archived and now easily accessible to researchers, can assist them in obtaining better results (Johnston 2014). Secondary data analysis is not analysing pre-existing data; rather it involves the process of using data for re-contextualising information again (Bishop 2006). To gather statistical data about tourism from the case study, this study made use of secondary data analysis. Secondary data was gathered from various formal governmental websites such as the Iran Statistical Centre. The researcher was able to compare previous data with those captured by using this method (see Section 5.3 and further sections). The advantages and disadvantages of this method are addressed in Table 3.1.

3.6.2. Semi-structured interviews

Kvale (2007) described the interview as an in-depth exploration of a topic from the interviewees’ perspective. It aims at gaining a description of the subjects’ lived experience. The semi-structured interview utilises open conversation to gather in-depth responses to a series of questions, or discussion themes (Kvale 2007). The use of interviews in tourism research is well established (Jennings, 2005; Veal 2017; Picken 2017; Phillimore & Goodson 2004).

Initially, the researcher planned to conduct fieldwork in Rafsanjan. Face-to-face interviews had been planned. However, this was deemed by the university ethics committee as an unacceptable safety risk to the researcher. Subsequently, it was decided that telephone interviewing would be the ideal method. However, given that the researcher was based in Australia, the time difference with Iran became a problem for recruiting participants. This, however, was minimised through self-interviewing. With this method, interviewees provide answers independently of the researcher using electronic means such as the internet, writing their answers or recording themselves. This enabled the interviewees would be able to participate in their own time, nullifying the problem of the time difference between Australia and Iran. Thus, as stated in Chapters 1 and 2 the qualitative approach adopted in this study enabled the researchers to gain a nuanced understanding of tourism jobs in Rafsanjan. This included gaining rich insights into the drivers for, and barriers to, greening the jobs in tourism.
3.6.3. **Self-interviewing**

According to Allett, Keightley and Pickering (2011), in self-interviews, participants respond to a specific topic by recording or writing their responses (Jennings 2005; Douglas 1985; Ritchie, Burns & Palmer 2005). This is a recent development, which has been proposed for further use in social science. Self-interviewing was used previously to gather data on sensitive topics. Formats adopted previously include the computer-assisted self-interview (CASI) or the audio-computer-assisted self-interviews (ACASI). Using a computer, respondents read the questions and provide either typed or audio recorded answers (Harling et al. 2017). As well as for sensitive topics, this method has been used to compensate for lack of time, or to provide anonymity, or make participants feel more comfortable. Participants are able to complete the interview in their own time. Clearly, this is more convenience and may enable them to think more freely. The advantages and disadvantages of this method are further explained in Table 3.1.

3.6.3.1. *Using videos for self-interviewing*

Video is a familiar technology to most people in modern life. It is, therefore, no surprise that it is an increasingly popular technology employed in academic research (Jewitt 2012). In research, it has been used to stimulate reflection and unearth memories and ideas of the subject at hand, that may otherwise have remained dormant. In addition, “videos can be used in a number of ways including participatory video, videography, the use of existing video data, video interviews and elicitation and video-based fieldwork” (Jewitt 2012, p. 3).

The current study used existing videos to give participants a clear illustration and hopefully, a better understanding of the research topic. It was hoped that this might lead to richer responses. It was used to stimulate the participant’s mind and elicit more spontaneous answers. Indeed, according to Jewitt (2012), this method can help arouse participants’ awareness of day to day phenomena that usually go unacknowledged (Jewitt 2012). This method was used in the self-interviews because the researcher was not present to explain and clarify the questions. The videos enabled the researcher to convey what the questions meant by way of visual example.
The advantages and disadvantages of using video for extracting data are presented in Table 3.1. Despite these disadvantages, using photographs and videos is albeit a reliable method of data collection.

3.6.4. Summary of methods used in this study

The three methods used during the data gathering process are presented in Table 3.1. In this table, the advantages and disadvantages of each method are discussed (Irwin 2013; Johnston 2014).

Table 3.1: Summary of weak points and strengths of the study’s methods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Advantages</th>
<th>Disadvantages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gathering and analysing secondary data</td>
<td>Fast collection of data, low costs, data processed quickly, certainty in the data gathered, and results and flexibility in this approach in using various ways to analyse the data.</td>
<td>Restricted statistics of small cities, lack of in-depth analysis of the data, generalised or biased information from the government, and being framed more broadly rather than detailed enough.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semi-structured interview (telephone-interviewing)</td>
<td>Conducive to rapport building and mutual participation can gain rich data from a deep understanding of the participants’ values, attitudes and beliefs, a wide range of possible responses, being able to clarify and explore ambiguities, and maximise description and discovery.</td>
<td>Participants’ openness or honesty is not guaranteed, flexibility of the interview might reduce the reliability and relevance of data to the research questions, and analysing data can be difficult.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-interviewing</td>
<td>Participant may pause and resume as they want. They have more freedom and flexibility from not being trapped in a polite conversation, being able to re-record themselves and re-write their responses</td>
<td>Not being able to ask for more explanation from the researcher, which can cause a lack of clear guidance and understanding of the task.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method</td>
<td>Advantages</td>
<td>Disadvantages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using videos for doing self-interviewing</td>
<td>Facilitates a richer explanation of the research topic or issue of interest and can be a rich way of augmenting written or verbal explanation of the phenomena/issue/topic. It can reawaken memories and experiences of participants, and provoke ideas which may not have come to mind in the absence of the video stimulus</td>
<td>There is a risk that the video does not entirely convey the details of the phenomena/issue/topic. Video may place too much focus on material or external issues, they can be time-consuming to watch and review. Sometimes a video can evoke false memories.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3.7. Research design of this study

In this section, the research design of the current study will be outlined. Research design is described as: “plans and procedures of every research which involves various decisions for their implementations and research design is informing the overall decisions which should be philosophical assumptions and procedure of inquiry that the researcher brings into the study” (Creswell & Creswell 2018). Figure 3.1 shows the qualitative method used for this study.
Figure 3.1 shows that the primary research was comprised of analysing secondary data sources. These included government reports, books, journal articles and other publications. It was intended that this data be used to build a picture of the characteristics of tourism jobs in Rafsanjan, Iran. The results gained at this stage were explained in detail in Chapter 2 of this paper. Semi-structured interviews were conducted during September 2018. This stage involved the administration of qualitative semi-structured interviews, followed by qualitative self-interviewing. Section 3.8 presents the description and justification of these methods.

Three methods were used to select participants and collect the data. Participants for the semi-structured interview and self-interviewing were recruited through convenience and purposive sampling. Convenience sampling is valid for explanatory studies or when the researcher is not able to obtain a representative sample. Therefore, participants who were easier to find and ready to participate, were chosen. Purposive sampling involved “a deliberate choice of participants due to the quality they possess” (Etikan, Musa & Alkassim 2016, p. 2). Snowballing was used for both the semi-structured interviews and self-interviewing when needed. Being a non-probabilistic sample made this study more limited. Therefore, to identify the variability of the population, the researcher conducted the research in two different interview modalities (semi-structured and self-interviewing).
As well, a wide variety of tourism jobs were examined: a) jobs directly related to tourism such as hotels, and b) jobs indirectly related to tourism such as pistachio farms. Finally, the following procedure was used: as soon as the researcher was ready to begin, the first participant was contacted by calling phone numbers in the Yellow Pages in Rafsanjan. Once the process with one participant was finished, the next one was chosen in the same way or through snowballing. If any individual was unwilling to participate, another person was called using the strategies just outlined.

Qualitative data was collected during the interviews. Section 3.9 presents a detailed analysis of the data. Finally, the research findings are presented as a qualitative research report (see Chapter 5).

3.8. Data collection

This section provides an explanation of, and justification for, the data collection methods used. As information was gathered from various levels of workers and professionals in different jobs in the tourism field, three different data collection methods were used (secondary data analysis, semi-structured interviews and self-interviewing by using the videos). Section 3.8.1 describes the process used to choose the four representative videos used in the self-interviews. Section 3.8.2 explains the data collection process by providing more details of the three methods utilised.

3.8.1. The process of video selection

You-Tube was utilised to select useful, easy to access videos. Eight videos were chosen based on various aspects they represent about the topic. To validate the usefulness of the videos, they were shown to undergraduate students in a class taught by the research supervisor. Specifically, their reactions to the videos were sought. Videos which received the most relevant reactions to the topic being examined were selected for use in the study. They were then cross-checked through peer-review and then video selection was further refined (Morse et al. 2002). Six Videos were published by the OECD and the ILO, The Supply Chain Sustainability School, University of St. Gallen (Switzerland), National Geographic, The Economist and the Supply Chain Sustainability School. Participants were asked to watch the videos and then talk about them in the context of their job (HSGUniStGallen 2016; Los Angeles County Office of Education (LACOE)/ETN 2015; National Geographic 2015; OECD 2012c; The Economist 2017; The Supply Chain
Sustainability School 2017). Finally, four videos were selected. These were the General Introduction To Green Jobs from the ILO and the OECD (Video 1); the Implication of Green Jobs at Workplaces from The Supply Chain Sustainability School (Video 2); The Job Negative Effects in Today’s World and Their Way to Change from University of St.Gallen (Switzerland) (Video 3), and The Experience of Some Countries and a Tourism Job in Transforming and Greening Their Jobs from the National Geographic (Video 4).

3.8.2. The process of data collection

After the selection of videos, texts and questions, secondary data on tourism jobs or green tourism jobs in Rafsanjan was collected. This process lasted from May until December 2018. Choosing Rafsanjan enabled the researcher to examine the types of jobs being created in a tourism industry that is newly developed and growing.

Participants were selected on a random and convenient basis and then invited to participate. Some were recruited from local directories and contacted by telephone or email. This method was convenient because participants who were available and willing to participate were chosen. It was also purposive because tourism workers were targeted to provide insights into the nature of tourism jobs in Rafsanjan. Other participants were chosen through snowballing. A total of 21 participants agreed to participate in with the semi-structured interview (12 participants) or the self-interviewing (9 participants). They consisted of five participants from the food industry, five working in the accommodation industry, two from travel agencies, one tour leader, an entrepreneur in handicraft work, two involved in tourism transportation, five in honey bee tourism, a participant who ran a pistachio farm, another an organic farm, a subject working in an eco-lodge, and another from a green designing and advertising company. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with those participants who were new to the tourism industry. Due to the flexibility of time and location, the workers and professionals with more job experience were able to complete the self-interview. The researcher determined the sample size by monitoring for data saturation. This was determined when considerable repetition of themes became apparent. When this occurred, data collection was ceased (Saunders et al. 2018; Fusch & Ness 2015; Francis et al. 2010). Additionally, the fact that the semi-structured interview uses a relatively small number of participants (Bertaux 1981; Mason 2010; Morse 1994; Bertaux 1981; Guest et al. 2016; Creswell 1998) was an important factor in deciding the number of participants. During the data collection process, the
ethics requirements were taken into consideration (ethics approval reference number HRE18-025). Data collection followed the ethics requirements and process. The researcher performed thorough research on secondary data through various archives and databases. Once the secondary data gathering stage was finished, participants were directed to answer the questions in the semi-structured interview. They were asked to discuss the themes of interest (each ranged from between 20 to 40 minutes in length), in particular, what they considered to be the drivers for, and barriers to making their job more sustainable. Self-interviewees were sent four videos and text-based stimuli. They were asked to talk about their jobs, based on the videos and the text. The interview ended whenever the participants wanted to finish the interview.

Table 3.2 below lists the methods used to collect and analyse the data, and ultimately achieve the study’s aims. This includes the approaches to data analysis used, and how they contributed to accomplishing the aims of the study.

Table 3.2: Research method used in this study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Deployment</th>
<th>Data analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Secondary data              | 1. To identify the current state of tourism, and the activities and preferences of tourists in Rafsanjan | 1. Data was gathered from the archive and database in Iran and international organisations outside Iran. | 1. Excel  
2. Text and quote |
| Semi-structured interview   | To investigate the drivers for, and barriers to doing a green job or greening the jobs in tourism by workers and professionals in Rafsanjan. | Participants were asked to talk about their job based on the themes of green jobs which was brought up by the researcher in the middle of interview. | 1. Data was gathered and coded  
2. By using Nvivo10 qualitative data analysis software, a qualitative analysis was undertaken based on quotes and the text method. |
| Self-interviewing using videos | To investigate the drivers for, and barriers to doing a | Participants were asked to talk about their job based on the | 1. Data was gathered and coded. |
Section 3.8.2.1 explains the details of the three methods used during the process of gathering data.

3.8.2.1. Secondary data gathering

The researcher collected general data about tourism in the Rafsanjan region from the archive and database centres. In this section, the nature of the tourism sector in Rafsanjan was examined. This helped to better understand the preferences of tourists to that city. Data collected in this section pertained to the type of tourism engaged in, the duration of time tourists spent in the region, type of accommodation utilised, expenditure patterns and mode of travel.

3.8.2.2. The semi-structured interviews

After completing the secondary data collection, semi-structured interviews were conducted. Participants were asked to provide information about their work and personal details related to their identity. The first section of the interview included five closed questions (gender, age, education level, type of tourism service, length of time working in the tourism industry) and three open questions (ideas about expenditures, motivation for working in tourism, ideas about impediments to working in tourism). These questions were designed to capture demographic and job preference data. Participants were asked to evaluate and give ideas about “tourism expenditure” involved in tourism jobs. All 21 participants responded to these questions. Table 3.3 summarises these data.
Table 3.3: Demographic data about participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Closed questions</th>
<th>Open questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>1) Participants’ opinion about the expenditure habits of tourists in Rafsanjan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>2) Participants’ motivation for working in tourism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>3) Participants’ opinions about the impediments to working in tourism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of job</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of time working in the tourism industry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The second section of the semi-structured interview was done by examining the general drivers (what are the most significant drivers for and barriers to greening your jobs?) and some specific drivers were examined in more depth. Specifically, this focused on detailed aspects of their job and workplace (which one of your bills is mostly more expensive? Why do you think it is like that?). In addition, Table 3.4 presents an example of the general interview framework. The researcher used the semi-structured interview method for capturing drivers for, and barriers to, greening tourism jobs in Rafsanjan. The interview framework was constructed following various resources for developing interviews.
Table 3.4: Sample of questions used in the semi-structured interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research questions</th>
<th>Questions to participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| What can drive people to do their job more greenly? | I can see that you are really interested in doing such an eco-friendly activity in your tourism job  
   a) What encouraged you to do it?  
   b) What would you like to receive by doing such an activity?  
   c) Who do you think would benefit most by it?  
   d) How do you describe your job? Why you do your job in this way?  
   e) Does it help your job or benefit you in any way? |
| What are the barriers to greening the process of the job? | (When a participant was talking about an unsustainable activity)  
   a) What is the reason for avoiding doing that in an eco-friendlier way?  
   b) What makes you dislike this job?  
   c) Why you decide to do this activity in such a way?  
(When doing a sustainable activity in their jobs)  
   a) Why do you think people avoid doing that? |

With the participants’ consent, the researcher used an Olympus DM720 digital audio recording device to record the answers. To avoid loss of data, notes were taken during the interviews.
During the data collection process, the participants were asked to describe their job, their ideas, opinions and preferences about drivers for or barriers to doing their job in an eco-friendlier way.

Each interview lasted between 20 and 40 minutes.

3.8.2.3. The self-interviewing using videos

Once the semi-structured interviews had been completed, the self-interviewing method described above (Jewitt 2012) was implemented. It was used to collect tourism job workers’ and professionals’ ideas about drivers and barriers influencing their working more greenly, and what their job might look like if it was greened. The process consisted of four steps:

1. Four videos were chosen from the previous selection process. The videos depicted how to green jobs and the implications of green jobs discovered by the ILO in the course of their work. The content of the videos comprised: General Introduction To Green Jobs from the ILO and the OECD (Video 1); the Implication of Green Jobs at Workplaces from The Supply Chain Sustainability School (Video 2); The Job Negative Effects in Today’s World and Their Way to Change from University of St.Gallen (Switzerland) (Video 3), and The Experience of Some Countries and a Tourism Job in Transforming and Greening Their Jobs from the National Geographic (Video 4). The text comprised a paragraph about the importance of doing jobs in a more environmentally-friendly way.

2. Participants were asked to view these four videos and read the text stimulus.
3. Participants were informed that they could talk or write about their own job in the light of what was explored in the text and videos. They were asked to explain whether their job functions in the same way or differently. If their job did not match what they watched, they were encouraged to explain the reason for that and provide a suggestion for doing the job in an eco-friendlier way. They were also given a list of closed questions (age, gender, education, and so forth.) and five open questions. The latter invited them to reflect on their job concerning how it could be greened. Additionally, they were asked to consider drivers and barriers influencing whether it could be made more sustainable.¹

4. Once the participants had answered all the questions, these answers were sent to the researcher by fax, email or through social media.

3.9. Data analysis

Qualitative data was collected during the data collection process. Section 3.9.1 describes the analysis procedures for analysing the data collected.

3.9.1. Secondary data analysis

Secondary data was collected by the researcher from formal Iranian and international archives and databases. It was transferred to word-processing and Excel documents. Then it was sorted, categorised and presented in this study, after using Excel to calculate the percentage of each category. This data was compiled in various forms – numerical, statistical and quotes.

3.9.2. Semi-structured interviews

Data about tourism jobs in the Rafsanjan region was collected using an audio-recorder and hand-written notes taken by the researcher. This was transferred to Microsoft Word and Excel documents. This data is presented as general information in the graphs and figures in this study. Data about the participants’ profiles is presented in graphs and figures, following the same format as the secondary data. Presenting participants’ profiles in this way, enables the reader to understand the results more clearly. Graphs attract the attention of the reader and are retained in their memory (Bavdekar 2016). No percentages

¹ Questions of semi-structured interview and self-interviewing were similar in general structure. Subtle differences (in the structures not in the main objectives) were because of two various types of interviewing (the presence/absence of interviewer).
were calculated in this section, because of the low number of participants. The graphs and figures are presented with the real number of participants. In the following section, participants’ ideas about certain secondary data, and the motivations and impediments to holding a tourism job presented. This information was collected using audio-recording and note taking. Using a word processing document and Nvivo 10, data were coded, organised, and presented in tables in the form of quotations.

The researcher collected qualitative data concerning drivers for, and barriers to, greening tourism jobs in Rafsanjan. In the semi-structured interviews, participants had to explain the way they function in their jobs, how they prefer to do their jobs, and drivers for and barriers to greening their job. Each interview was audio-recorded, and the researcher took hand-written notes. The researcher transcribed the interviews into word-processing documents and coded them in the Nvivo 10 qualitative analysis software. The elements applied in the coding analysis is presented in Table 3.5 below:

**Table 3.5: The resources and topics from which the themes of this study were extracted**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource topic</th>
<th>Resources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Green skill checklist</td>
<td>Strietska-Illina et al. (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety and health at work</td>
<td>Bradbrook et al. (2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green hotel standards</td>
<td>ASEAN Secretariat (2016), Graci and Dodds (2008), Hsiao et al. (2014), Mbasera et al. (2016); Mbasera (2015), Tzschentke et al. (2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green service model</td>
<td>Bayside City Council (2016)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Coding is defined as assigning labels to quotes that represent certain themes of interest (Jennings 2010; Auerbach & Silverstein 2003; Chowdhury 2015; Thomas 2006). According to Neuman (2011), Blair (2015) and Jennings (2010), coding can take various forms, which may be descriptive, interpretive or pattern-based. This study followed the interpretive approach. This is a deeper level of describing the data acquired. The coding process followed three phases: 1) open coding: scrutinising data and creating first code categories, 2) axial coding: this coding arises out of initial coding by connecting them together and organising them, and 3) elective coding: codes are inspected to determine data that will support the conceptual coding categories that were created (Jennings 2010; Neuman 2011).

The three stages of coding outlined above (Neuman 2011; Blair 2015) were adopted, and the main themes from previous resources extracted. For open coding, the 12 interview transcripts were examined, and general themes identified. For example, branding the job, strict environmental rules and cooperation with the council were selected as potential drivers. Through template coding, transcripts were re-examined. This involved examining previous studies’ codes through template coding (Alyami, Rezgui & Kwan 2014; Ludwig Design Consulting (n.d.) and Amstel, Driessen and Glasbergen (2008); Sirbu et al. 2015; Inderst, Kaminker & Stewart 2012, and so forth.). Code labels were assigned to participants’ text-based descriptions. Finally, selective coding was applied to all the transcripts to obtain meta-codes, and to determine whether they were external or internal.

Along with coding, thematic analysis was also carried out. Thematic analysis is the best method for finding patterns or themes through the interpretation of the data (Alhojailan 2012). Alhojailan (2012) explained that thematic analysis is appropriate for identifying patterns in actions and thoughts, which are then coded and categorised into
themes (Alhojailan 2012). In this study, thematic analysis was used for interpreting, coding and categorising the collected data.

3.9.3. Self-interviewing

In the self-interviews, participants were sent four videos and text-based stimulus to gain further insight into the topic at hand. As with the semi-structured interview, they were asked to explain the way they function in their jobs; indicate drivers for and barriers to greening their job; or if it was a green job, to state what drives or impedes them from performing this job. Each interview was recorded or hand-written by the participants and sent back to the researcher. The researcher typed the transcriptions of the interviews, transferred them into word-processing documents and exported them to Nvivo 10 for coding. The framework was the same as that for the semi-structured interviews (Section 3.9.2). Coding and thematic analysis were done at the same time, on data acquired from the participants. The information is presented in this study as boxes, in the participants’ language, to support the themes extracted.

3.10. Ethical considerations

Ethical considerations are paramount, given that this study involved humans. For research involving humans, the researcher should consider potentially harmful risks when planning and implementing human research safely. These include planning for reducing the risk of (1) physical harm from any intervention into people’s lives that might threaten their physical health, (2) psychological harm, in particular excessive anxiety, embarrassment or any other significant distress in participants (3) legal harm, which includes protecting the participants from increased risk of legal consequences, and (4) other harm including any indirect negative effect of the research on participants’ lives (Jennings 2010; Neuman 2011).

Victoria University Human Research Ethics Committee granted ethical approval to proceed with this study on the 4th of June 2018. The reference approval ID number is HRE18-025. Table 3.6 is a summary of the process of applying ethical conduct in this research.
Table 3.6: Process for ensuring ethical conduct of this research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consideration</th>
<th>Semi-structured interview</th>
<th>Self-interviewing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Informed consent</td>
<td>The researcher provided the participants with an oral explanation and written information sheet. Participants were asked to sign a consent form if they agreed to attend the interview. They were given time to think about that.</td>
<td>Participants were provided with an oral description first, and after considering the interview, they were given a written information sheet. They were asked to sign a consent form before their participation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security of data</td>
<td>All data is kept in a locked file (encrypted content) on the researcher’s computer. The computer is password-protected.</td>
<td>All data is kept in a locked file (encrypted content) on the researcher’s computer. The computer is password-protected.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anonymity of participants</td>
<td>Anonymity was ensured through using a code for every participant (e.g. Participant 2).</td>
<td>Anonymity was ensured through using a code for every participant (e.g. Participant 22).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minor protection</td>
<td>No persons under the age of 18 were involved.</td>
<td>No persons under the age of 18 were involved.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.11. Limitations of methodology

This section explains the limitations of the present study. The limitations are based on an analysis of the data, the research implications, and the practical and theoretical applicability of the research.

1. Sample size: the sample size was too small for purposes of generalising the findings to the broader population because qualitative methods were applied.

2. Potential bias in the sample: that tourism workers and professionals’ opinions formed the basis of the data, their vested interests and experiences might have biased the results. For example, a small business owner may have wanted to present his business in a positive light for branding purposes, offering unrealistic advice about how to green jobs.

3. Sampling bias of participants based on their originating from Rafsanjan: what constitutes as the correct path to greening jobs in Rafsanthan might not apply to other geographical locations. Thus, when drawing conclusions from the current data, this bias should be taken into consideration.
4. Trustworthiness of the data: data analysis was based upon the participants’ subjective views and may not be an accurate reflection of reality.

5. Applying findings to other tourism activities: The reported results of this study are only relevant and usable for the tourism jobs under examination (tourism jobs in Rafsanjan). The results may not apply to other types of tourism activities and jobs, including those of other geographical locations.

3.12. Chapter summary

The approach, methodology, methods and procedure for conducting the present study was presented in this chapter. The chapter commenced with a discussion of the qualitative method used in addressing the research objectives. The self-interview semi-structured interview methods were described. This was followed by an outline of the method used for analysing the secondary data, and the participants’ job profiles. Finally, the main data analysis process was presented. Chapter 4 presents the case study, while Chapter 5 will focus on presenting the results and findings of the data collection and analysis.
CHAPTER 4
CASE STUDY

4.1. Introduction

Chapter 3 presented the methodology undertaken to collect, categorise and analyse the data. This chapter (Chapter 4) presents an overview of the case study. This chapter first presents a general overview of Rafsanjan, including, its geographical, historical, political and economic characteristics. In Section 4.3, the researcher focuses on Rafsanjan’s environment. This is followed by identifying the characteristics of Rafsanjan’s tourism industry, and the activities and preferences of tourists there, which helps to address objective one of the studies (Chapter 4.4). In the last section (Section 4.5), the degree to which green jobs exist in Rafsanjan is examined, and the potential for improving the situation discussed.

4.2. Rafsanjan at a glance

4.2.1. Geography

Rafsanjan is the city of pistachio farms. It is in Kerman province in the south-east of Iran (Figure 4.1). This town had a population of 161,909 in 2016. Figure 4.2 shows what Rafsanjan is like in relation to its neighbouring cities. Rafsanjan is along the route from Kerman to Yazd and Shiraz. It has a semi-desert climate (Statistic Centre of Iran 2018; Rafsanjan City Council 2018) with relatively warm summers and cold winters. As mentioned, this city is in Kerman province, which is famous for its mines and underground resources (Mosafer Salam 2018). That is the reason for the name of Rafsanjan, which comprises two words: “Rafsang”, the meaning of which is copper, and “Kan”, which means mine. Mountains enclose Rafsanjan which makes this city different from its neighbouring areas. Sarcheshme is a town in the Rafsanjan area with the highest altitude. It has cool summers and cold winters (Mosafer Salam 2018, Rafsanjan City Council 2018).
Figure 4.1: Rafsanjan – where the study was conducted
Source: Adapted from Google map 2018.
The lowest temperature recorded in Rafsanjan was -17°C and the highest recorded temperature was + 43°C (Masafer Salam 2018; Accuweather 2018). The last months of autumn, all three months of winter, and the first month of spring usually have the highest amount of rainfall in Rafsanjan. This weather is what makes it such a prosperous agricultural city (Mosafer Salam 2018; I.R. of Iran Meteorological Organization (IRIMO) 2018).

4.2.2. History

Rafsanjan is mentioned in many traditional books, and the importance of this area is mostly geographical. It is located between Yazd and Kerman which are two important cities in Iran. Many years ago, the imported products from the south port were taken to the Silk Road through Rafsanjan. Remains of an old castle, telephone and telegraph house, and mosques, distinguish this town as an important area in Kerman province (Rafsanjan City Council 2018).

Figure 4.2: Rafsanjan in relation to Yazd, Shiraz and Kerman
Source: Adapted from Google map 2018.
4.2.3. Politics

Although Rafsanjan is a small city in Iran, it plays a vital role in Iran’s political system. Several people from Rafsanjan have played pivotal roles in politics, culture, business and the media.

In addition to the influential people that have originated from Rafsanjan, it is an important city because it is the largest pistachio producing city in Iran. This is highly significant, given that pistachio is one of Iran’s key export products, up there with the famous Persian rug (Rafsanjan City Council 2018).

4.2.4. Economy

Rafsanjan is one of the most developed and populated areas in Kerman province. Eighty-five per cent of Rafsanjan’s economy is dependent on agriculture, and 98% of that, is pistachio. With more than 88 thousand hectares of pistachio farms, Rafsanjan is a major centre of pistachio production in the world. Other agricultural products are saffron, walnut, almond and wheat (Bemani 2013b; Mehr News 2017). This city is the largest producer of pistachios in Iran and the world, which make up a large share of non-oil exports (Young Journalists Club (YJC) 2017, 2018a).
Another economic feature of this city is the Sarcheshme copper mine, which is one of the largest copper mines in the world. The industrial area of Rafsanjan started operating around 2010, and currently, 29 factories are operating in this area (Mespress 2018).

Academic centres are another part of the economy of this city. Numerous students are attracted to these centres every year. An example is the Rafsanjan University of Medical Sciences. Boasting 1400 students, this institution is indicative of the importance of such academic centres in the regional and national economy (Iranian Students’ News Agency (ISNA) 2015a, 2018c). Eleven academic centres are active in Rafsanjan with 25000 students studying at these centres every year. Half of these students are from other cities or countries (ISNA 2015a, 2018c).

In summary, the major significant economic activities of Rafsanjan are the following:
• Pistachio farms located all around Rafsanjan, which make it one of the biggest producers of pistachio in the world, competing with the USA.

• Industrial town with 29 active factories.

• Sarcheshme copper mining complex known as the “Turquoise eye” located 55 km south of Rafsanjan.

• Significant academic centres in medicine, dentistry, law, accounting, and management.

• Ceramic and tile production, which is significant in Rafsanjan and Iran more broadly because of the quality of the soil there.

• Numerous touristic monuments including the biggest muddy house in the world with 110 rooms, which attracted almost 32,000 tourists in 2017.

• One of the largest motorcycle tracks in the nation. Used for hosting national and international competitions and training.

• A significant number of mining activities and valuable geology scenery.

4.3. Environment in Rafsanjan

Rafsanjan has a fragile environment. It is a hot and arid area. Farming that applies irrigation methods is the main industry there. This puts Rafsanjan in a vulnerable situation because of the risk of drought caused by global warming. Having said that, there are some other environmental issues which are placing this city under serious threat (Mehryar et al. 2015; Islamic Republic News Agency 2018; YJC 2018b).

Rafsanjan is located beside the Sarcheshme copper mine, and the Khatun Abad and Shahrbabak industrial areas causing significant pollution, (Khajepour & Abbas Nejad 2009, ISNA 2018a). Pistachio farms are regularly sprayed with pesticides. (Islamic Republic News Agency (IRNA) 2017; Khane Kheshti News 2003). The major fertilisers used in pistachio production in Rafsanjan are banned in many countries (Connelly 2003). The overuse of inorganic fertilisers and pesticides in pistachio farms has increased the risk of pollution (Hamshahri Online 2016).

The crisis of water resources in Rafsanjan has been exacerbated due to the decrease of rainfall from extended droughts in recent years. This has resulted in continuous
declines in water levels (Dana Information Network 2018). Exacerbating this is the irresponsible use of water wells in Rafsanjan as well (Hamshahri Online 2012).

Although the Sarcheshme copper mine is one of the major causes of environmental degradation in Rafsanjan, other mining issues should not be overlooked. In addition to the Sarcheshme copper mine, the Davaraan mountain ranges in the eastern parts of Rafsanjan, due to the extraction of minerals, have caused many problems to Rafsanjan. Exploration activities have destroyed most of the vegetation, animals, flora and fauna (Khane Kheshti News 2017). These explorations also had a significant effect on adventure and sport tourism in this area. Sport tourism activities are in danger because of the dumping of garbage and debris from mining excavations (Khane Kheshti News 2017). The area that has been used for many years by tourists, people and animals is today a place for garbage and illegal mining (Khane Kheshti News 2017). Land subsidence and the crisis of the groundwater conditions are additional environmental problems that are consequence of water extraction. Another serious problem is caused by agricultural wells in Rafsanjan (Hamshahri Online 2012).

4.4. Tourism in Rafsanjan

In this section, the general trends in tourism are presented. Section 4.4.1 investigates travelling preferences and activities in Kerman, Rafsanjan, in the form of statistics. These trends were found in the analysis of secondary data which is the first objective of this study. Section 4.4.2 explores the main attractions of Rafsanjan. In Section 4.4.3, tourism jobs in Rafsanjan and their ranking related to tourism expenditure is given. Finally, in section 4.4.4 the policies in regard to tourism jobs and activities are outlined.

4.4.1. Research objective one: To identify the current state of tourism, and the activities and preferences of tourists in Rafsanjan (Secondary data analysis)

Section 4.4.1 presents an examination of the travelling preferences in Kerman, Rafsanjan. Some of the information dealt with in this section includes the type of tourism for this state, the duration of time tourists spent in the region, the types of accommodation they used, their expenditure patterns while travelling and the mode of travelling.
4.4.1.1. Type of tourism

Most trips to Kerman are for visiting friends and family (see Figure 4.4). This trend has held for over 10 consecutive years. Leisure and business followed in importance, with lower percentages allocated to shopping, education and training (Statistical Centre of Iran 2018). Almost all participants agreed that many tourists come to Rafsanjan to visit friends and family, and for business tourism. In addition, they indicated that a significant number visit Rafsanjan on their way to the port of Iran – another popular tourist destination. They felt that this type of tourism is unaccounted for in tourism statistics. They also said that shopping mostly takes place in the free trade zone of Sirjan and not in Rafsanjan. This statistic seemed controversial to them based on the type of tourists they face in their jobs.

![Figure 4.4: Type of tourism](source: Statistical Centre of Iran 2018)

4.4.1.2. Time spent

Most of the tourists (almost 56%) reported being day-trip visitors, with 44% being overnight visitors to Rafsanjan (see Figure 4.5). Participants mentioned that in 2018, many travellers were transit passengers or one-day business passengers. They attributed this as the reason for having more day-trip than overnight visitors. Participants said they believe that in March 2018, economic sanctions on Iran led to opening the borders to many products, which resulted in people travelling to the port of Iran for shopping trips. The semi-structured interviewees attributed visiting friends and family, and business tourism to the high number of overnight visitors in Rafsanjan. These two types of tourists

66
tend to stay in an area for a longer time. On the contrary, self-interviewees said they believe that Rafsanjan has an equal number of day-trip visitors and overnight visitors staying for more extended periods. They did, however, indicate that in the long run, it is possible to attract more day-trip visitors compared to overnight ones. This is consistent with the Statistical Centre of Iran (2018).

![Figure 4.5: Time spent](source)

4.4.1.3. *Type of accommodation preferred*

Figure 4.6 shows that most tourists preferred accommodation in Rafsanjan in the form of friends’ and family’s houses (72%). A total of 4% of tourists preferred hotels, motels, eco-lodges and so forth. The same percentage chose organisational accommodation, while 7% indicated camping as their accommodation of choice. 13% stayed in personal or rental apartments (Statistical Centre of Iran 2018; Iran Touring & Tourism Organization 2019). Participants in both groups agreed on these statistics. Participants opposed to attracting more overnight visitors were sceptical about these statistics, yet they did not disagree completely. They mentioned that many of their customers who are transit passengers usually camp in Rafsanjan.
4.4.1.4. Expenditure trends while travelling

It is evident from Figure 4.7 that most of the tourists’ expenditure was for transport (22%), followed by food and beverage (21%). They spent 20% on health care and 16% on goods and products (Statistical Centre of Iran, 2018). The amount spent on goods and products shows that, unlike what some workers and professionals believe to be true, shopping tourism is significant in Rafsanjan. This is also borne out by official expenditure statistics. Interestingly, after souvenir expenses (10%), accommodation represented 7% of spending, which was one of the lowest expenses. This is indicative of people visiting friends and family in Rafsanjan. Tour expenses are low. The reason for that is the dominant tourism type in Rafsanjan. Not much money is spent on culture, leisure and sports activities. These kinds of activities are mostly free of charge in Rafsanjan, which explains the lower amount of money spent on them. Participants expressed their agreement with this expenditure trend, and they did not add any extra comments.
4.4.1.5. Mode of travelling

Most people travel in private vehicles (see Figure 4.8). Only 9% of travelling takes place on public transport which includes: aeroplane, train, bus and mini-bus. Rental vehicles and friends’ cars are also important types of transportation, utilised in 17% and 11% of cases respectively (Statistical Centre of Iran 2018). According to The Statistical Centre of Iran (2018), the cost of public transport, especially aeroplanes, is high. Participants mentioned that these data made sense to them, because of the high number of cars travelling to and from Rafsanjan. They supported this trend, given that it contributes financially to the vehicle repair industry in Rafsanjan.

Figure 4.7: Expenditure trends while travelling
Source: Statistical Centre of Iran 2018.
4.4.2. Main tourist attractions of Rafsanjan

In section 4.4.1, tourism activities and preferences were detailed. In section 4.4.2, the tourist attractions of Rafsanjan will be described. Tourism attractions in Rafsanjan are divided into two categories: natural and historical. In addition to pistachio farms, which are the main attraction of Rafsanjan, there are other prominent natural attractions.

Rageh valley, Mirza cave, Bahraman well and the oldest pistachio tree in the world are the main natural attractions of Rafsanjan. Bahraman well is a fascinating geological site. Indeed, the air pressure blowing out of the well is intense enough that light objects do not fall into it. Instead, the well blows them back out. There are also natural springs around Rafsanjan, which are famous for their healing properties. These attractions are depicted in Figures 4.9 to 4.10.
Other tourist attractions in Rafsanjan include the largest muddy house in the world. There are several caravanserais and several old castles including Anahita castle which originates from the first millennium BC. There is an ancient bazaar, several water reservoirs, an ancient wall, a lost city that was buried by a dust storm, among other sites. In figures 4.11 to 4.13, some of the historical monuments of Rafsanjan are presented:
Figure 4.11: (Left) The oldest muddy house and (Right) Kabootarkhan caravanserai

Source: Khane Khshti News 2017

Figure 4.12: (Left) Anahita castle and (Right) Old city of Rafsanjan

Source: Khane Khshti News 2017
4.4.3. Overview of tourism jobs available in Rafsanjan

The types of tourism of jobs available in Rafsanjan are presented in Table 4.1. Each sector has been given a ranking score according to the level of tourist expenditure it represents. This data is also provided in Table 4.1 and is based on the WTTC model (2018) and statistics obtained from the Statistical Centre of Iran.

Table 4.1: Overview of tourism jobs available in Rafsanjan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tourism job</th>
<th>Related expenditure (a)</th>
<th>Ranking based on their role in expenditure (b)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accommodation</td>
<td>Accommodation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food and beverages</td>
<td>Food and beverages</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail trade</td>
<td>Goods and products/ souvenirs/tours</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>Transport</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural, recreational and sport services</td>
<td>Culture, leisure and sport</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-</td>
<td>Health care(^2)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^2\) Health care is mentioned in the Statistical Centre of Iran as an expenditure for tourists, but not as a tourism-related job based on the World Travel & Tourism Council model. This expense has nothing to do with medical tourism. It is the expenses of health care services while travelling, if anything happens unexpectedly.
Agriculture and industry\textsuperscript{3} & - & - \\
Advertising and promotion\textsuperscript{4} & - & - \\

(a) Refer to Figure 5.9 for the tourism expenditure in Rafsanjan  
(b) Refer to Figure 5.9 for the ranking of tourism expenditure in Rafsanjan

The more tourists spend in a certain part of the tourism industry, the higher the impact on the economy and the environment.

### 4.4.4. The policies in regard to tourism jobs and activities

Rafsanjan has an interesting tourism policy compared to other cities in Iran. Most of the attractions are free of charge to visit, and income is produced through accommodation, food, and souvenirs (See Iran 2018; Kojaro 2018; Jazebehha 2018). Historical monuments have recently been the centre of attention in this city. Some Rafsanjani people who migrated to other countries and succeeded financially have since invested their wealth back into the tourism industry (Golestan Amin 2018). This led some researchers to believe that the next growth opportunity in this city could be tourism. Indeed, statistics indicate that tourism is increasing there. In 2016, 52 000 tourists visited various monuments in Rafsanjan, of whom 600 were from other countries (YJC 2016). Generally, there is rising interest among the broader population for tourism to this city. Added to that, there are a growing number of exclusive hotels being established there, which could help build the city’s brand as a tourist destination. In addition to industrial tourism, business tourism, sport tourism (national motor riding contest), agitourism, geology tourism, visiting friends and relatives, and staycation, more general forms of tourism like cultural, historical or even alternative tourism (Statistical Centre of Iran 2017) have become popular.

\textsuperscript{3} This type of tourism job is only suitable for Rafsanjan, as one of the main types of tourism (Business Tourism). It is important to know the role of this tourism job in the economy, and how environmentally-friendly this job has been practised. It is not ranked, because it has not been mentioned in the Statistical Centre of Iran as an expenditure.

\textsuperscript{4} Advertising and promotion are not mentioned in tourism expenditure expenses, but they do play an important role in the tourism industry.
4.5. **Green jobs in Rafsanjan**

Green jobs are divided into two major categories: forming new jobs in clean industries and greening current jobs (Renner, Sweeney & Kubit 2008). Green jobs in Rafsanjan are being developed. However, there is still a long way to go before business and the community become more eco-friendly there. The Government’s vision for green jobs there, has only just begun. While new projects in renewable energies have been established, there have been no substantive efforts to make existing jobs environmentally sustainable (Islamic Republic of Iran Broadcasting (IRIB) News 2018).

Regarding forming new jobs in clean industries, Rafsanjan is known as one of the best areas in Iran for establishing solar power plants. Its Renewable Energy Region started its work in 2016 with the cooperation of Austrian and Iranian companies (Barghnews 2017). This project is currently running and getting into the second level of installing panels. Some local researchers, entrepreneurs, academic and governmental centres are participating in this project (Vali-e-Asr University of Rafsanjan (VRU) 2018; INFU, 2016). Rafsanjan is also regarded as one of the best places in Iran for wind turbine factories (Sadeghi, Esfahani & Hori, 2012). Indeed, Sadeghi, Esfahani and Hori (2012) recognised this city as one of the best for installing clean energies.

Much more needs to be done to green current jobs in Rafsanjan (IRIB News, 2018; Saba Energy, 2016). While there have been some efforts, progress is slow, and it is not the government’s primary focus. Businesses and workplaces are generally not yet implementing sustainable practices systematically (Energy Today 2017; Barghnews 2017). Recently, expressions of “sustainable agriculture” or “problematic environment” have appeared in research literature related to the Rafsanjan economy (Bahrami et al. 2017). While these may be signs of hope, national and regional policies are not yet aligned with this concern. There is still no waste management system operating in Rafsanjan. People view sorting their waste as useless because the council processes all garbage in the same way. Clearly, governmental plans are needed to introduce green jobs to people. The lack of knowledge about what is needed to green the economy is a barrier to the government acting. The start of new projects such as solar panel plants is a good way of starting green jobs in the region. However, greening current jobs is of crucial importance to help avoid further environmental deterioration (Energy Today 2017).
One of the main aims of tourism in Rafsanjan is creating new jobs for unemployed people. This would give them new opportunities for advancement and skill development. Focussing on green jobs is the way of the future as it will help create such opportunities (Energy Today 2017; Hamshahri Online 2016).

4.6. Chapter summary

In this chapter, the case study has been presented. The chapter commenced with a general overview of Rafsanjan. Various aspects of Rafsanjan like geography, history, politics and the economy were discussed. Finally, an overview of the city’s environment, tourism and movement towards greening industry was introduced.
CHAPTER 5
FINDINGS

5.1. Introduction

Chapter 3 provided a detailed description of, and justification for, the methods and procedures used in this research. Chapter 4 presented various aspects of the case study in detail and the analysis of secondary data in Section 4.4. Chapter 5 presents the results of two stages in the data collection process. The findings presented in this chapter pertain to objective two: to investigate the drivers that might encourage Rafsanjani workers and professionals to green their jobs; and objective three: to explore the barriers likely to impede Rafsanjani workers and professionals from greening their jobs. This chapter presents data from the responses of 21 Rafsanjani workers and professionals in the tourism industry. Their responses pertain to what drive or dissuade them from working in tourism broadly, and with regards to particular jobs in that sector. The findings of this study are compared to previous similar studies that have examined either drivers, barriers or preferences of tourism workers in other countries. Twelve participants attending semi-structured interviews responded to three main themes: the current situation of their jobs, drivers for, and barriers to greening their jobs. Nine participants completed a self-interview, which included their views about drivers for and barriers to greening their jobs and how their job is performed. This chapter firstly presents the results of the process of choosing the semi-structured interview themes, questions and videos used in the data collection process (Section 5.2). Then, an explanation of the participants’ motivation and incentives, for engaging in tourism jobs, followed by an explanation of the impediments to doing tourism jobs (Section 5.3). (Section 5.4). In Sections 5.4 and 5.5, an explanation of the drivers for and barriers to greening jobs is presented. Findings related to the drivers for and barriers to green tourism jobs in Rafsanjan are put into perspective in Section 5.6. Finally, in Section 5.7 the results of the coding process of the preliminary coding and meta-coding are presented.

5.2. Results of the selection of themes, questions and videos

This section provides the results of the process conducted to select valid themes, questions and videos used in semi-structured telephone interviews and self-interviews. Table 5.1 presents the themes and questions of telephone interviews. These were
approved by a verification exercise with supervisors, through a pilot study with participants, peer debriefing and review, as well as previous similar projects. At the 19th International Conference of Labour Statisticians (ILO, 2013c), a proposal was written in order to assess, not only the final output of jobs, but also the process of jobs in order to be eco-friendly. Following that, the Australian publication of Sustainable Tourism Strategic Plan (Tourism Victoria 2009), and other resources were used to find the best theme for assessment. The themes are described in Table 5.1.

Table 5.1: Themes and sub-themes presented in previous studies or standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
<th>Study in which the theme was found</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Shading systems like shutters, light-tight blinds or suitable curtains to reduce the energy use</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Time-switches or motion sensors</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Energy and water waste</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Sub-theme</td>
<td>Study in which the theme was found</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Using regional/seasonal and organic products</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Sub-theme</td>
<td>Study in which the theme was found</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Monitoring, Evaluation and Management (People, External context) | - Department or person responsible for environmental issues and the regularity of energy register  
- Checking up heating/cooling/lighting by the owner  
| Policy, Training and Reporting (People)    | - Environmental policy and training to find any solutions for doing the jobs in a more environmentally-friendly way and the effects on jobs and arrivals | ASEAN Secretariat 2016; Strietska-Iлина et al. 2011; Green Hotelier 2011; Tourism Victoria 2009; ILO 2013b, 2013c; Amstel, Driessen & Glasbergen 2008; UNWTO 2016a, 2016b; ILO 2017a, 2017c; DEA 2011; Graci & Dodds 2008; Hsiao et al. 2014; Mbasera et al. 2016; Mbasera 2015; Tzschentke, Kirk & Lynch 2008 |
The video and questions used for self-interviewing were verified through a pilot study. This involved a series of reviews of the materials by the supervisor, with the participants themselves, and through peer reviews. Videos were about the history of jobs and how they reached a greening point, changing the job processes to be more environmental-friendly, and the countries which have already started this trend, followed by the effects of these changes.

5.3. Participation in tourism jobs in Rafsanjan

Section 5.3 provides the participants’ motivation regarding their participation in tourism jobs in Rafsanjan. Based on an overview of the tourism jobs provided in Section 4.4.3, an overview of the participants of the study is provided in Section 5.4.1. Sections 5.4.2 and 5.4.3 provide a close-up examination of what motivates and encourages workers and professionals to work in the tourism industry. Also, presented are factors that can impede them from taking up this work.

5.3.1. Overview of participants in this study

Table 5.2 provides an overview of the participants of this study. From this section onward, there will be participants referred to with the code names presented in Table 5.2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants’ codes</th>
<th>Job</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participant 1</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 2</td>
<td>Café and restaurant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 3</td>
<td>Restaurant and takeaway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 4</td>
<td>Café and restaurant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 5</td>
<td>Hotel, restaurant and cafe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 6</td>
<td>Travel agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 7</td>
<td>Hotel and fast food</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 8</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 9</td>
<td>Motel and sandwich shop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 10</td>
<td>Hotel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 11</td>
<td>Travel agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 12</td>
<td>Budget hotel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 13</td>
<td>Transportation system worker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 14</td>
<td>Honey bee tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 15</td>
<td>Tour leader</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 16</td>
<td>Female entrepreneur in handicraft jobs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 17</td>
<td>Pistachio farmer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 18</td>
<td>Organic farmer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 19</td>
<td>Transportation system worker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 20</td>
<td>Eco-lodge worker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant 21</td>
<td>Green designer and Advertising company</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 5.3.2. What motivates participants to do tourism jobs

Participants were asked to explain their motivations for working in their jobs. These are tabulated in Table 5.3. Table 5.3 displays the participants’ main motivations for participating in the jobs they hold. The biggest motivation is being in touch with society and people, as well as being able to contribute to the community. Personal interest and income were also stated as reasons. These findings are important because previous studies (ILO 2010, 2012b) have not distinguished between “what I love about my job” and “what I hate about my job”, and also “how do I like/dislike to do my job” when analysing the data. Assessing these dimensions of motivation may reveal the extent of workers’ and professionals’ likelihood of greening their jobs. They indicate, for instance, that material and financial reasons are weaker motivations, whereas the tasks of the job, or being connected to society or nature are stronger. Commitment, satisfaction, efficiency, innovation and creativity to perform the job sustainably, increase motivation for doing the job (Borzaga & Tortia 2006). Based on the human need hierarchy (Health Knowledge 2018), the more intrinsic the incentive, the more motivation to innovate green jobs increases. Based on what was said, Table 5.3 displays motivations and incentives for working in tourism jobs. This table illustrates that in some cases motivations differed, while in other motivations remained consistent with the same finding category of the University of Wisconsin-Stout (Themduangkhae 2002). This is a significant finding - indicating that reasons for working in tourism could differ within a particular tourism category.
Table 5.3: What motivates participants to do their job

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tourism job</th>
<th>Main incentive for doing the jobs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Restaurant</strong></td>
<td><em>I love cooking; it makes me happy.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Café and restaurant</td>
<td><em>I have a personal interest in this job, and I love to be in touch with people. This job would be more successful if you have a personal interest in it. In Rafsanjan, the number of cafes is more than supermarkets. Why? Because of the high financial benefits of the cafes. As the owners didn’t have any personal interest in this job, they face a big disappointment, after a while. They should look for a good barrister and deal with many challenges at their work.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant and takeaway</td>
<td><em>I had patience and a real vision about my job. I was not a confused person who jumps into jobs. I have continued the same jobs for years. First, I was a purchasing officer in my workplace, and then I could get a promotion and work in the kitchen after a while. I started with a low wage, and now I am a business partner. One-third of the benefit in our workplace is mine.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Café and restaurant</td>
<td><em>Being social, being in touch with the customers, being nice to them and responsible for the customers’ needs. Giving good quality food and service to them. I want them to smile at me when they are ready for paying. A smile out of satisfaction from customers is my main motivation for this job.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel, restaurant and cafe</td>
<td><em>Being directly in touch with people is my main motivation. I love to be involved in the community.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel agency</td>
<td><em>I don’t like this job; I have to work in this area because I need money. It is a really well-paid job.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel and fast food</td>
<td><em>I am in touch with people; it is a lively work. People come and go, it is crowd everywhere, and I enjoy all this. We didn’t have a similar business to what I establish, in Rafsanjan. So, by doing thorough research, I realised that this job could benefit both my city and me, at the same time.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Restaurant</strong></td>
<td><em>It is a money maker job. I am a master chef; cooking gives me a peaceful feeling.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motel and sandwich shop</td>
<td><em>Well ... when you live in a small city like Rafsanjan, you always like your life to be different. You want a change, and sometimes you are the one who must make that change.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism job</td>
<td>Main incentive for doing the jobs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel</td>
<td>Rafsanjan didn’t have such a hotel at this level. In fact, it is the first luxury one in Rafsanjan. I love my city to shine and be prominent in the tourism industry.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel agency</td>
<td>Assisting with one of the friends and cooperating in making new business. Because it is a new idea in Rafsanjan, so, it is unique. Unique jobs are always great ideas, I reckon.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget hotel</td>
<td>Dealing with people and the challenges related to that and of course the good money that this job has.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation system worker</td>
<td>My job is a fundamental job. It changed the whole civilisation. By transporting people and products, societies were connected. I am happy that I am a part of this connection and communication.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honey bee tourism</td>
<td>This job is peaceful and amazing. Helping the farmers to spread the pollen for a better result is something I never forget when I do my job.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tour leader</td>
<td>Besides showing your local area to people and let them know about a part of their past, the best part of my job is how much you can change people’s minds and let them know how much they can be effective on this planet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female entrepreneur in handicraft jobs</td>
<td>I am happy ending up in this job. It is a piece of culture, besides doing a job. I am giving the inheritance of culture to the next generation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pistachio farmer</td>
<td>Farming is not just a job, it is feeding the society, and I love to be a part of that.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organic farmer</td>
<td>Every minute of doing this job I feel like doing a good job for my community health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation system worker</td>
<td>I love transportation jobs. That is my passion. I love to work in airports and seeing people coming and going for various reasons. Transportation is always alive, and that is what I love about this job.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eco-lodge worker</td>
<td>Being in touch with nature and with real life, I hate to be involved in fast-paced city life, and this job keeps me away from any crazy city life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green designer and advertising company</td>
<td>Being a part of making the society and tourism industry more reliable and beneficial for society.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.3.3. What impeded the participants to work in tourism jobs

Participants were also asked about the impediments of doing tourism jobs. Some impediments to working in tourism jobs were similar to barriers to greening those same jobs. In addition, some reasons for not wanting to do this work were environmental, for example, lack of water for farmers. In fact, such findings vindicate the significance of the current study and the urgent need to green jobs. Other deterrents were aspects of the job role that were unsustainable and therefore in need of greening (e.g. *everything is about speed, long working hours*). According to Table 5.4, these included problems with the government and associated organisations, and customers’ expectations or ignorance. Other barriers were problems internal to the company for whom they worked, such as working hours.

Table 5.4: What impedes the participants to work in tourism jobs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tourism job</th>
<th>Main impediments to doing a tourism job</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>Sometimes people unreasonably criticise the food, I can say at that moment I hate my job.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Café and restaurant</td>
<td>I hate that our town does not have the café culture, for example people bring their babies or 5 or 6 kids to the café, and they make much noise which bothers the other people or they talk loudly on their phones or almost scream when talking together which is trespassing to other people’s territory, these things makes me think whether I am doing a good job in Iran?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant and takeaway</td>
<td>I tell you that there is nothing I don’t like about my job; nothing can stop me from doing a tourism job.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Café and restaurant</td>
<td>Some customers who are fussy and they criticise even if the best service is offered to them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel, restaurant and café</td>
<td>Working hours is really annoying in tourism jobs, long hours.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel agency</td>
<td>Being in touch with the tax department is the most difficult part. They are trying to charge you for anything. They think tourism jobs are sweeping money out of the streets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel and fast food</td>
<td>Nothing makes me feel bad, it can sometimes be a difficult job, and it is very difficult to provide our place with the best service and the best quality ingredients. We have a lot of different customers, and each one of them has their unique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism job</td>
<td>Main impediments to doing a tourism job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>Customers can be really needy and unfair.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motel and sandwich shop</td>
<td>In the way of making a change in the tourism industry, sometimes I came across high expectations from the government. They totally ignored the fact that I am doing something for this city; they just tried to be as strict as they can.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel</td>
<td>You should pay huge respect to everyone; sometimes it can reduce from your self-respect because, at the end of the day, the customer is always right.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel agency</td>
<td>Being a partner of a company can be tricky; sometimes, decisions about the environment are not the ones that your partners always like, and that is our biggest responsibility in the tourism industry.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget hotel</td>
<td>Dealing with the wrong people or sometimes even criminals is annoying. You cannot say anything. Some guests ruin our brand, or I have to be worried about the quality of the food all the time. Price fluctuations is another issue I don’t like about my job, and it is very difficult to be in a job which is demanding. I have so many staff and dealing with them is such a cumbersome responsibility.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation system worker</td>
<td>How much government can ignore the pollution problem from transportation system is unbelievable. That is what makes me hate this job.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honey bee tourism</td>
<td>Going to a new market and new business model is a challenge, even other tourism jobs and travel agencies ask me how my job can be interesting for tourists.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tour leader</td>
<td>Coming across people, who are more interested in personal issues of me rather than the environment and history, can be annoying.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female entrepreneur in handicraft jobs</td>
<td>Explaining the value and importance of this job to some administrative is something that makes me tired sometimes. Why should this amazing job be this much neglected? This job is the culture of a country; you know how much money it can make?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pistachio farmer</td>
<td>Lack of water can be the main barrier to doing my job. There is no water management in the country and for doing agriculture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism job</td>
<td>Main impediments to doing a tourism job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organic farmer</td>
<td>The lack of knowledge between people, and sometimes, the way they underestimate the organic products and don’t value how much we stay away from chemicals and unhealthy fertilisers and methods, makes it very annoying. You feel like working for some people who don’t care about that.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation system worker</td>
<td>In the transportation system, sometimes, everything is about speed. How fast this system is going to deliver is a matter of assessing everything in the transportation industry. Being responsible for contributing to society and environments easily can be lost in this industry. This makes people working in this industry to be like a robot, without feeling, that is bad.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eco-lodge worker</td>
<td>Sometimes people come to an eco-lodge and throw their rubbish around or smoke, you know I am not going to say what people should do but really? Going to an eco-lodge means that you are interested in nature and then doing the activities which contribute negatively to the environment can be very irresponsible.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green designer and Advertising company</td>
<td>I hate that people ignore quality and care about quantity. I mean it is understandable that people will be worried about spending money, but sometimes they ask me to ignore the quality in designing to have a lower price.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.4. Overview of the drivers for doing current tourism jobs greenly in Rafsanjan

Participants were asked about general and specific drivers for greening their current jobs. General drivers (what are the most significant drivers for and barriers to greening your jobs?) and some specific drivers were examined in more depth. Specifically, this focussed on detailed aspects of their job and workplace (which one of your bills is mostly more expensive? Why do you think it is like that?). Table 5.5 shows direct quotes from participants about the general drivers to perform their tourism jobs in an eco-friendlier way. Most of the participants insisted that external drivers are the main reason for working more greenly.
Table 5.5: General drivers for greening current tourism jobs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants’ general ideas about the drivers</th>
<th>Type of driver</th>
<th>Participant’s number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Any financial and non-financial encouragement from government or any other NGOs. The presence of fine or punishment</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If there is based on punishment or supervision, I don’t do it for the sake of the environment then. I do it for avoiding those punishments. If there is a reward, I do it because of that encouragement. Supervision always makes everything worse, and people just do it out of obligation. The best way is educating people. Talking to them about the consequences of their work and giving them the freedom to choose the best way. Make it culture for higher levels of the system, and then ordinary people will follow that as well</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Participant 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The driver should be an inner driver, and when around us is cleaner, and the job is done in a very environmentally friendly way, we feel better about our job</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Participant 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think if the government starts to supervise, it has a better effect. Maybe so many business owners don’t like it, but I think it is very effective. Because people behave more responsible when they have a fear of being fined and punished, and I also think that the government should introduce the business of the month. That business should do the best environmentally friendly work, comparing to the other works. The government can also promise to advertise for that good employment to increase the customers; so, that will be as an incentive for us to do our job in a more environmentally friendly way, competitively</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I believe nothing works as a driver, except for making the common culture between people of such kinds of behaviours, about the environment</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Participant 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I reckon financial reward is good. However, if the government wants to make it compulsory, fine and punishment works well</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giving the reward and helping with improving the ideas, doing researches and providing us with the facilities for doing our jobs in a better way</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants’ general ideas about the drivers</td>
<td>Type of driver</td>
<td>Participant’s number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making a good culture of caring about the environment between people is the best driver</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Participant 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think strict supervision can be so much helpful</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any governmental help and support is the best driver. Fines never work. If they want to fine, they should fine the whole country. They should support and give a bonus. If I am part of the society, all other people are also a part of that, why I should be the only one who does that? We are in a competitive society we can spend on our customers, rather than for the environment. I can spend money on my customers’ satisfaction, rather than buying a new solar panel or timer shower. There should be a support</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making a common culture is the best, with the cooperation and help of the council. If all these didn’t work, they could make it an obligation. When they don’t do anything for people, they cannot expect people to follow these ideas voluntarily</td>
<td>Internal and External</td>
<td>Participant 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giving more money as an encouragement, that is the only thing which works</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.4.1. Detailed drivers for greening current tourism jobs in Rafsanjan about different aspects of those jobs

Drivers for participating in greening current tourism jobs are offered in Table 5.6. Also included is whether they believe in external or internal drivers. This table also indicates which theme each participant referred to. Participants’ quotations for each driver are shown descriptively after this table. There were 17 drivers identified by participants.
Table 5.6: Detailed drivers for greening tourism jobs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Drivers</th>
<th>Type of driver</th>
<th>Participants’ comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Concern about the maintaining of property, plant and equipment</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Monitoring, evaluation and management – participants 1&amp;5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(fixed assets)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concern about customer satisfaction</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Health and well-being and toxic reduction – participant 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earning money from sustainable activities</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Waste minimisation and recycling – participant 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concern about extra expenses</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Monitoring, evaluation and management, green Materials and green purchase participants 2 &amp; 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customers’ sustainable expectation</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Policy, training and reporting – participant 2; Green design and energy efficiency monitoring, evaluation and management participants 4 &amp; 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regular check-ups of energy and function of the system</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Monitoring, evaluation and management – participants 1-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More efficiency and lower expenses</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Green design and energy efficiency – participant 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsible and conscientious behaviour</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Waste minimisation and recycling, green design and energy efficiency – participants 4 &amp; 7 &amp; 9; Monitoring, evaluation and management – participants 6 &amp; 7; Waste minimisation and recycling – participant 7; Health and well-being and toxics reduction –participant 7; Green materials and green purchase participant 7&amp; 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear of losing the brand name or customers</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Green materials and green purchase –participant 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encouraging innovative ideas</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Green materials and green purchase –participant 4; Policy, training and reporting – participant 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drivers</td>
<td>Type of driver</td>
<td>Participants’ comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Branding the job</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Waste minimisation and recycling green materials and green purchase – participant 7; Green design and energy efficiency – participant 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strict environmental rules</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Green materials and green purchase – participant 1; Health and well-being and toxics reduction – participants 3 &amp; 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High energy expense</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Monitoring, evaluation and management – participant 8; Green design and energy efficiency – participant 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation with the council</td>
<td>Internal and External</td>
<td>Waste minimisation and recycling – participant 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aesthetic or luxury driver</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Green design and energy efficiency – participant 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distributing the responsibilities</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Green materials and green purchase – participant 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Having an internal look rather than an external look</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Policy, training, reporting – participant 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As can be viewed in Table 5.6, the participants provided input regarding drivers for engaging in performing their jobs sustainably. Responses indicated that customers’ expectations, regular check-ups of the energy system and responsible and conscientious behaviour are the main drivers for working sustainably. What is significant is that some participants appreciate environmental-friendly ways, while others only preference their personal interests, rather than environmental interests. The first three quotations show a personal interest of customers. The last quote illustrates that Participant 4 has some customers who are considerate about the environment.

*It is better for our job to consider using green material and doing green purchasing, for example, we have customers who ask whether our ice creams are locally-made, or they are made from pasteurised milk, or it is just powdered milk? We even have some customers who wear gloves when eating, or some customers use the disinfection tissues before eating (Participant 2)*
Our lights don’t have timer, but they have dimmers. Sometimes customers like less light as they are eating dinner or more romantic atmosphere, so we did it because of customers’ needs (laughs)... well it was not quite because of energy efficiency (Participant 4)

We use some wooden shades. They are so effective. They don’t let the sun and hot wind to bother our customers (Participant 9)

Some customers stop coming to my place if I don’t behave in a responsible way about the environment. I had my rubbish, and I was blamed as an irresponsible person by one of the customers. Environmental activists are increasing every day, and they are very concerned about these issues (Participant 4)

Regular check-ups of energy and function of the system is another important driver for jobs in Rafsanjan. The reason for this suggested by Participant 2 was particularly noteworthy:

Check-ups of the energy system in our workplace are done very regularly because they are very hungry for money (Participant 2)

Participant 4 seemed satisfied with the regular check-ups:

They work properly. Every two months they come to register the energy use, if we are not there, they will send us a letter of notice, I am happy with their work (Participant 4)

Participant 7 even asked for more check-ups, to remain informed about his responsibilities:

They came every two months, and we asked them to check our workplace every month because we wanted to be informed about our energy use and be able to improve it (Participant 4)

This suggestion for more check-ups is a sign of responsible and conscientious behaviour as well. The function of workplaces is also under constant supervision and participants mentioned various check-ups for different parts of their work. Although some were proud
to be supervised every month, Participant 8 said that if the workplace is checked regularly, it means there is something suspicious about the job:

*We have officers who supervise our function monthly, but if the officers control workplaces every other day, it means they are suspicious of the function of those jobs (Participant 8)*

Participant 10 was satisfied with cooperating with governmental supervisors which makes him proud. From the participants’ quotations, it can be seen that there are two different opinions regarding check-up regularity. Some viewed the check-up as a bonus. They welcome it and even ask for more. However, others regarded it as a negative point, indicating there is something suspicious about the job and the system.

Responsible and conscientious behaviour is the next driver mentioned by participants as important. These behaviours and activities are wide-ranging. Participant 4 talked about his decision to install a shading system as soon as his working hours change:

*We don’t have shading system right now, because our place is not open in the morning. However, as soon as we decide to open our place in the morning, I have to think about installing some window shades, so it doesn’t let the energy to be wasted. We have to care about wasting energy if we are a good human and citizen of this society (Participant 4)*

Participants 6 and 7 emphasised reducing chemical usage, managing waste and littering. Participant 7 was managing waste in a standard way. Participant 7 mentioned his concern about wasting water and energy, as well as the importance of conscientious behaviour:

*We really care about wasting energy. A burnt light has a waste of energy, and it should be changed less than 24 hours. We try to be considerate about it, especially about water. Because Rafsanjan has a drought problem and I think if every job can use even a bit less water, then it would be a huge amount of saving (Participant 7)*

Participant 7 also said that he is trying to replace non-recyclable with recyclable disposable dishes even if it means spending more money. The other participants were considerate about some aspect of their jobs being environmentally-friendly. Participant 7
cared about whether almost all aspects of his job were sustainable. He showed a responsible and conscientious mindset and indicated that he does not want anything to impact negatively on the environment.

More efficiency and lower expenses were also identified as important drivers as they benefitted both the environment and business:

*The reason that I install a gas heater is that it is mostly hotter. The central ducted heater is not that much effective. Checking and setting the heat is more difficult as well but the gas heater is easier to work with. More efficient and less expensive* (Participant 7)

Financial concern is another driver that led to more environmentally-friendly approaches at work. This driver is linked with the high expense of neglecting the check-ups:

*We mostly buy our ingredient locally, previously we bought them from Tehran, but it is not working financially* (Participant 2)

*It is very important to check the heating and cooling system regularly because we pay a lot for our appliances and we should be sure that electrical fluctuation doesn’t destroy them* (Participant 4)

Participant 4 talked about fear of losing brand loyalty and customers as a driver to conduct business sustainably:

*If we want to use bad ingredients in our food, customers realise it. Then we won’t have any loyal customer who is the main source of any business success. We cannot use high quality and bad quality ingredients on and off. As you know, Iran is not a stable country and prices are going up all the time, regardless of what we always use high-quality ingredients. It increases our prices, but at least I can tell the customers the truth* (Participant 4)

Concern about the maintenance of property, plant and equipment (fixed assets) is another driver urging participants to behave more responsibly. Participants indicated that they pay a large sum of money for their facilities, so they do not want them to stop working:
We check our cooling systems every day, because the water pressure is low, and we need to check evaporative air conditioner to be sure that they work properly (Participant 1)

According to Participant 1, concern about customer satisfaction led him to stop using chemicals and toxic sprays in his workplace:

We even don’t use insect spray in our place. We installed insecticide lamps, insect spray is smelly, and makes our customers unhappy. We don’t wash the workplace with chemicals because some customers can be annoyed with its smell even the next day. You cannot imagine what sensitive customers we have (Participant 1)

Earning money out of sustainable activities was mentioned by Participant 2. He said he believes that no one does environmental activities for the sake of it, without getting any financial benefit out of it:

No one does it for the sake of environmental issues; for instance, I recycle the wastes because I earn the employees’ salary through selling recycling rubbish (Participant 2)

Encouraging innovative ideas was identified as being one of the main drivers by participants for doing a greener job:

We make our new dishes out of fabrics, and that is getting very popular. They are recyclable and environmentally-friendly (Participant 4)

We do our job in an innovative way not in an Iranian way. This innovative method exposes our workplace in front of the customers’ view. Nothing can be hidden. This obligate us to abide by standards (Participant 5)

Some participants indicated that branding their jobs (in particular, Participants 7 and 10) drives responsible work practices as follows:

Our place is a brand; we try to keep it high up on the list. We really care about the quality and health of our place. Every night, we do a survey from the customers, and any small, weak point should be addressed very
meticulously. I worked for years in Europe, and I try to keep my job at an international level, and suitable with my own personality as well. Our name was written in all brochures as the best in Rafsanjan in March 2017. We had some experts from Spain, Italy and the USA and also some governmental authorities came to our place and approved of our quality. We even had some customers who came from Tehran to have dinner in our place and have an overnight stay just because they heard about our brand. We spent four times more on our design to make it more suitable with eco-friendly approaches (Participant 7)

Before expanding upon the other drivers, it is prudent to highlight that Participant 10 renovated his hotel based on green hotel standards. He announced that with much pride.

Having strict environmental rules in the workplace can have a significant effect on their functioning at work. It was mentioned as a driver by Participant 7 who said that he does not hire people who smoke cigarettes. Plastic containers were banned by Participant 1. High energy expenses were the next driver mentioned by Participants 8 and 9:

Because we are so sensitive about our expenses, we must control everything and care about the waste of energy, don’t take me wrong, the only reason is expenses (laughs) (Participant 8)

We don’t let any energy to be wasted because of high expenses (Participant 9)

Cooperation with the council is another driver for Participant 10, who tries to encourage environmentally-friendly plans in cooperation with the council:

The council started a new mission in Rafsanjan 3 months ago, and the hotel is supporting that by following the council rules. All big organisations should manage their wastes. There are some recycling bins in front of all these places and in front of our place as well (Participant 10)

For participant 10, luxurious aesthetics was an influence on adopting green standards at work:
Bulbs in the corridor have the timer; it is classier. All 5-star hotels use this system. It helps to manage the light in a standard way. Motion sensors are also used in the yard (Participant 10)

Participant 10 outsourced some environmental responsibilities to experts to ensure certain tasks conformed to green standards:

We have an expert who is in charge of buying the ingredients and should work based on standards. His job is green purchasing ... well you know I didn’t know much about it, so I hired someone to help me in this way (Participant 10)

Some viewed taking personal responsibility for sustainability as more important than looking to external help, such as from government, as important for maintaining sustainable work practices. This was the last driver in this study which was raised by Participant 4 as follows:

The government cannot do much more than just collecting rubbish. I think the most important thing is how people behave, think and what is their common culture (Participant 4)

5.5. **Overview of the barriers to doing current tourism jobs greenly in Rafsanjan**

As it was stated in Section 5.4, the general barriers and more specific and detailed ones are included. General barriers are quoted directly from participants in Table 5.7. Two of the participants did not provide any input, positing that the lack of drivers is itself a barrier to performing green jobs. Most barriers were external from the participants’ point of view. High expenses and lack of government support were the main barriers identified.

**Table 5.7: General barriers to greening current tourism jobs**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants’ input about the barriers</th>
<th>Type of barrier</th>
<th>Participant’s number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High expenses for installing solar systems, also lack of supervision are the main barriers</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants’ input about the barriers</td>
<td>Type of barrier</td>
<td>Participant’s number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High expenses, you know ... one solar panel is not useful, so we have to install several ones, at the same time I pay a lot for the rent, let me tell you without governmental help it will be so difficult and even impossible</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nothing mentioned</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Participant 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Some business owners don’t like the system and the government, so, they behave stubbornly. They never want to abide by the system when they are always ignored. However, in my opinion, environmental issues are the matter of being conscientiousness, and we have to care about it for our future generations.”</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Participant 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“The barriers can be in people’s mind and the society context. We never learn to care about such an important issue which is a huge discussion around the world and very complicated.”</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Participant 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“The barriers can be in people and society common culture, which never believe in the importance of environmental issues.”</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Participant 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“The barriers? There is no information and help and no governmental support.”</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“The lack of a strict rule, rules are not that much strict enough to keep all of the business owners away from environmental damages.”</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“The lack of a strict rule and a very inefficient system that never cares about business owners and their challenges.”</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nothing mentioned</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Participant 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“High expenses and not having any support from the government, doing the jobs in an eco-friendlier way is very expensive and not worth it.”</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“High expense of new energies is the biggest barrier.”</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Participant 12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.5.1. Detailed barriers to greening current tourism jobs in Rafsanjan about different aspects of those jobs

Table 5.8 presents the barriers to participating in greening current jobs. The information was extracted from participants’ comments during the interviews. Twenty barriers were stated of which 14 are considered as external challenges for tourism workers. Participants commented about each one of these barriers which are presented later in this section.

Table 5.8: Detailed barriers to greening current tourism jobs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Type of barrier</th>
<th>Participants’ comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of enough knowledge</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Green design and energy efficiency – participants 1, 6 &amp; 12; Waste minimisation and recycling – participant 3; Green design and energy efficiency monitoring, evaluation and management – participant 4; Health and well-being and toxics reduction participants – 11 &amp; 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of facilities</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Green design and energy efficiency – participants 1, 7 &amp; 11; Waste minimisation and recycling – participant 2; Waste Minimisation and recycling – participant 6; Policy and training and Reporting – participant 11; Waste minimisation and recycling – participant 5;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of support</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Environmental support – participants 1, 7, 8, 9, 10 &amp; 12; Monitoring, evaluation and management – participant 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buying specific brands and materials</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Health and well-being and toxic reduction – participant 1;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of internal motivation</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Waste minimisation and recycling – participant 2; Policy, training and reporting – participant 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barriers</td>
<td>Type of barrier</td>
<td>Participants’ comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic instability</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Green design and energy efficiency – participant 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of ownership</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Green design and energy efficiency – participant 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aesthetic or luxury barrier</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Health and well-being and toxics reduction – participant 2; Green materials and green purchase – participant 5; Green design and energy efficiency participants – 8 &amp; 10;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of supervision</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Monitoring, evaluation and management – participants 2 &amp; 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underestimating negative effects of the job</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Monitoring, evaluation and management – participants 2 &amp; 3; Waste minimisation and recycling – participant 4; Policy, training and reporting participant 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High expenses</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Green design and energy efficiency – participants 3, 5, 8, 9 &amp; 12; Monitoring, evaluation and management – participant 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customers’ irrational expectations (customers need to prioritise environmental issues)</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Waste minimisation and recycling – participant 3; Health and well-being and toxics reduction policy and training and reporting – participants 5 &amp; 10; Health and well-being and toxic reduction – participant 12; Monitoring, evaluation and management – participant 11; Green design and energy efficiency – participant 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrong perception of helping society</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Waste minimisation and recycling – participant 4;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of attention and care and proper management or strict rules</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Policy, training and reporting participants – 1&amp;12; Waste minimisation and recycling participants – 10, 11 &amp; 12; Monitoring, evaluation and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Type of barrier</th>
<th>Participants’ comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>management health and well-being and toxics reduction green design and energy efficiency – participant 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of trust in the system</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Environmental support – participants 8, 9 &amp; 11;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concern about income and expenses over the environment</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Policy, training and reporting – participant 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of conscientious attitude</td>
<td>Internal</td>
<td>Green materials and green purchase –participant 1 &amp; 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of regular check-ups</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Monitoring, evaluation and management – participant 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old system</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Green materials and green purchase – participant 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of enough customers</td>
<td>External</td>
<td>Policy, training and reporting – participant 12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.8 shows the participants’ views about barriers to greening their jobs. This table indicates that more external than internal barriers exist. The answers of some participants indicate that the external barriers are interrelated (lack of facilities, economic instability, lack of supervision, and so forth.). For example, Participant 2 mentioned various external barriers for not greening his job. The majority of participants indicated that doing a green job is at odds with customer needs and expectations. For example, participant 5 talked about how his business produced significant waste to keep customers satisfied, in the following excerpt:

“We use a considerable amount of energy; we have four air conditioners which are working during the day and at night time, non-stop, well ... you know it is boiling here if I don’t do that, customers will be angry and don’t come back. Two dishwashers are all the time washing the dishes, our workplace is very spacious, and we have many lights which are on all the time, customers love sitting in a bright area. We use many dangerous chemicals because our customers are so meticulous about the hygiene of the
place. Non-recycling disposables are used a lot in our work because this is what customers expect from us. The irregular and wasteful use of energy and ingredients for keeping the customers happy is what we do, unfortunately” (Participant 5)

Participant 10 also said that some of their wasteful and inconsiderate behaviours were to keep customers satisfied:

“Although the hotel always uses eco-friendly cleaning agents, unfortunately, we have to abide by the customer's demand for cleaning their clothes and using non-standard detergents. We are a restaurant, coffee shop and hotel. We can reduce waste, but because of our brand and customer satisfaction, we don’t do that. The customers don’t expect us to reduce from the comfort and luxury. My customers are VIP and special, they got used to our system, and I cannot make so many changes” (Participant 10)

Participant 11 mentioned that because his customers were used to the wasteful system, changing that system would result in losing these customers. Participant 12 echoed the same dilemma here:

“Smoking is forbidden in public places, but not in hotel rooms. If customers smoke in public places though it is difficult to ask them to stop, they are customers I never want to bother them. We use evaporative air-conditioner because of dry weather. These air-conditioners use a significant amount of energy and water. If we do not use that system though, customers will be unhappy” (Participant 12)

Some participant indicated that lack of knowledge of sustainable practices was a barrier for not working more sustainably. For example, participant 3 said believed that his practices of waste management, was sustainable, though, in reality, they were not sustainable. This indicated that lack of knowledge and information could be a barrier to sustainable work practices. This is revealed in the following quotation:

“We have our own type of sorting and managing wastes, for example, we take the meat remaining for our cats and dogs, and the rest goes to the rubbish. I
think this way I am really doing a better job comparing to other workplaces”
(Participant 3)

In the next quote, participant 4 displayed erroneous perceptions of solar panel usage and waste management, further supporting the notion that lack of knowledge is a barrier to greening jobs:

“I believe that solar panels are used for public places like mosques or public toilets for warm water. I never heard any business uses a solar panel, here even we don’t see traffic lights to work with a solar panel, so we don’t use solar panel at work … (he added). We definitely sort and manage our wastes, we really care about it. This is how we do it: We put our rubbish out at the right time, so, the rubbish won’t be scattered around” (Participant 4)

Participant 6 felt that they don’t have any waste because they just use as much as they need. There was a lack of knowledge about “what is waste”. Participant 12 mentioned that there is still no better system than evaporative air-conditioners for dry weather. This displayed a lack of knowledge as green building advisors (2013) and smart house (2015) provided the public with better systems for cooling dry places. She also said that she has no idea about an environmentally healthy cleaning agent, which again highlights how a lack of knowledge of sustainable practices is a barrier to developing green jobs.

Lack of facilities or access to the facilities was mentioned by other participants as a barrier:

“Sorting the waste is not yet established properly. We have recycling bins in several spots in the city (almost 5 or 6 places), but it is not enough. I cannot drive to bins to throw my rubbish out” (laughs) (Participant 5)

Participant 2 and 6 thought that because there were no recycling facilities in the street, they should not try to set up a recycling solution. Participants 7 and 11 mentioned their ideas about this barrier as well:

“Well … we don’t have such facilities in Rafsanjan. I mean using solar panels and wind turbines. If there were such facilities with reasonable prices, people used it like energy saving bulbs that everyone uses” (Participant 7)
“We can be considerate about the rubbish and the amount of that, but I don’t think it works properly. We can try to reduce it or manage it, but still, there is no such facility around the city, so, it does not matter how much I sort them out finally they all would be mixed because of the lack of enough facilities” (Participant 11)

Lack of support from external organisations was something that almost all participants complained about:

“Unfortunately, we are just paying from our own pocket, we even asked for some help as a kind of loan, but no organisation took it seriously. We wanted to make a new area in our place, as VIP which is going to be made totally eco-friendly, but no organisation helped, so, we had to keep it unfinished for now” (Participant 7)

“There are always some ways in saving energy, like installing a timer on the showers, but they need the organisational or governmental help or sponsors. Installing the solar panels was very costly for us, so, I cannot do any eco-friendlier job without help. I spent a lot already for different aspects of the hotel to be based on green standards, like double glazed windows and solar panels, somewhere should aid us” (Participant 10)

Furthermore, some participants indicated that they regard a lack of internal motivation an impediment to working sustainably:

“No one does this job for the sake of environmental issues; I manage my wastes to earn money” (Participant 2)

“For my workplace, it is just important to keep the customer happy and satisfied with words, not real actions. Even if the customers ask for more careful environmental issues, the manager just says: yes ma’am/sir. And then ... nothing will be done in practice” (Participant 5)

According to Participant 2, economic instability is another barrier to do an eco-friendly job:
“Solar panel or wind turbine is the matter of expense; we have to work hard and earn a little bit which is just enough for buying ingredients. It happens a lot that we have to buy the ingredients two or three times more expensive, the next day. Even people with much money don’t tend to do so. People prefer to follow a very ordinary lifestyle in their work, and they don’t want to think about the environmental issues let alone spending their revenue for that” (Participant 2)

Lack of ownership, also mentioned by Participant 2, is another barrier:

“We don’t have any insulation system, because I rent my shop and whatever I pay for this shop, will be beneficial for someone else not for me. Why I have to spend on someone else’s shop?” (Participant 2)

Aesthetics or luxury were regarded as a big barrier, which plays a significant role in so many jobs and workplaces. As soon as a job becomes well-known as a highly rated job, environmental considerations drop because of a wasteful or erroneous mindset:

“We always buy our raw material from Kerman or Tehran, never from local or seasonal products. Our customers don’t like the taste of the products in Rafsanjan” (Participant 1)

“Our place is a high-level hotel, and all of our ingredients are from Tehran and Kerman” (Participant 5)

“Our job is complicated and highly-rated, for example, Kebab cooker should be hot all the time even when we are not using it. We also have a waste of water to some extent, because of the fountains outside, which work all the time. These fountains are for an aesthetic purpose. I also never use any shading system in my workplace; I prefer to use more of the air-conditioner rather than destroy the beautiful atmosphere of my place. Our place is traditional, and the sun makes it beautiful, so, we don’t use shading system. Well … our plants are also in need of sun” (Participant 8)

“The design of our work is in a way that for attracting more customers we have to use a huge source of light. We cannot avoid it. You know how much we paid for our designing company?” (Participant 10)
Lack of regulatory supervision was identified by Participant 2 as a barrier to maintaining environmentally sustainable work practices:

The main problem is that which means the higher levels of the system don’t care and supervise. There is no supervision or punishment. What they actually do, which is not even that much linked to the environment (oh well it is connected a bit actually) is that they send the health supervisors to workplaces. They care about very unimportant issues mostly related to human health but not environmental health” (Participant 2)

Underestimating the negative effects of the job was revealed as a barrier in this quote:

“I don’t think my job plays a huge negative role in the environment because we are an SME. If we were a big business … maybe we were more effective on the environment negatively” (Participant 2)

Both participant 3 and participant 4 acknowledged that jobs in large organisations were a barrier. They felt that the sheer size of jobs would result in greater environmental damage. Participant 6 identified how management could negatively affect the degree to which employees work greenly

“The manager doesn’t think that our job is a lot in touch with the environment, so, we don’t have any training for that. Anyway I think he is right … we are not effective on the environment that much” (Participant 6)

High expenses were identified by a number of participants as a barrier to doing a green job:

“We don’t have any solar or turbine because the expenses are so high. Our electric bills are expensive, because of the big fridges and a high number of lights. We have back breaking bills. We are mostly at work at the peak time of use, and that adds a lot to our bills. So, we cannot spend on the solar panels or wind turbines, no way” (Participant 8)

“We use a solar panel on a small scale outside because it doesn’t have financial justification for us to do more than that” (Participant 10)
“We don’t have any solar panel; it is expensive if it was cheaper, we could buy it. As heating and cooling system, we use the ducted heater and evaporative air-conditioner, although we are going to change our heating system to a better one, I mean more efficient one if the bank gives us a loan. You know if I have money I can change my systems to better ones and work more sustainable, but everything is so expensive. Not logical, I cannot afford it” (Participant 12)

Wrong perceptions of helping society were identified as another barrier for one of the participants to better manage waste at work, in the following passage:

“We don’t need to sort and manage our wastes. As soon as we put the rubbish out, some poor people take them to sell those recycling ones and earn some money. They can sell them at a reasonable price. Some shops sell the recycles themselves, but this is my good deed for the society (Participant 4)

Lack of attention, care, ineffectual management or strict rules were further impediments raised by participants 10, 11 and 12. Sometimes the participants became angry by the questions and asked the interviewer whether it was important at all, or they explicitly expressed their lack of care. Sometimes they wondered whether they were doing anything wrong:

“We don’t have any sorting rubbish, is it important at all?” (Participant 9)

“We hold a meeting for general issues, but it is not specifically for the environment, there is no such rule for these kinds of gatherings ... Our electricity and water usage are high; we cannot do anything about it” (Participant 10)

“We don’t have anyone to supervise the environmental issues in our workplace, why we should? ... We put all the rubbish outside together; it is not illegal. ... The door is always open, and energy is wasted, the ovens are always working even sometimes for a small kebab skewer so energy would be wasted a lot in our place. It is how it works! (angry). Do you expect me give raw food to my customers?... we use strong chemicals in our bathrooms, I cannot let the toilets to remain dirty for the sake of the environment, what a
shame ... Mostly we talk about salary and money and never about the environment, is it a new law that we should talk about the environment?” (Participant 11)

“We don’t pay much attention to the environment; we cannot afford such extra things. If there is no rule about it, it means that it is not important; otherwise, the government was more considerate than you, wasn’t it?” (Participant 12)

Another notable barrier was a lack of trust in the system, which motivated opposition to do anything helpful for the system, as pointed out by participants 9 and 11:

“This government never helps, why I should care about what makes the government happy?” (Participant 9)

“They always take money from us, never give us anything. I am not going to spend my money for their benefit” (Participant 11)

Concern about income over the environment created another barrier for Participant 12:

“In our meetings, mostly we talk about repairs and bringing down our expenses (laughs) ... sorry, I know it is not appropriate; but we cannot gather together and just talk about the environment when our pocket is empty” (Participant 12)

Lack of conscientious attitude was highlighted as a barrier in the following quote:

“We just try to use fresh ingredients, that is all. I cannot all the time look for making my job greener, why should I if I don’t need it and it doesn’t give me any benefit? If my customer asks for that, I use organic ingredients” (Participant 1)

For participant 6, lack of regular check-ups was cause for not caring about energy efficiency, in the next excerpt:

“They never come for checking, why I have to be bothered by that anyway?” (Participant 6)
Another barrier mentioned by Participants 11 and 12, was an outdated structure and infrastructure that is incompatible with sustainable materials and technologies:

“Insulation in our workplace is impossible; everything is old when we try to insulate it, everything just gets worse” (Participant 11)

“Using time-switches or motion sensor are not used in our hotel, because our system is old” (Participant 12)

According to participant 12, lack of customers was an impediment to adopting green work practices:

“Energy efficient systems require newer facilities and equipment. They need heaps of money. Because Rafsanjan tourism is mostly visiting friends and families, visitor takes their friends and families’ houses as accommodation. We don’t have many customers we don’t have enough revenue. Mostly our revenue is from the wedding celebration saloons we have in the hotel, or business meeting ...” (Participant 12)

5.6. Results of self-interviews about drivers and barriers

Box 5.1 presents the input of Participant 13 who works in the transportation system. Their responses identified more drivers for and barriers to managing transportation sustainably. Lack of proper infrastructure, citizens’ habitual behaviours, financial issues and lack of practical actions and plans that would facilitate sustainable practice, were identified as the barriers to a greener transportation industry. Better policies, rules and regulations, planning and sponsoring plans were mentioned as the drivers of eco-friendlier transport jobs.

| Box 5.1: |
| Participant 13 – Transportation system worker |
| “I think most of the transportation policies are not in sync with the environment ... you know, it easily can be seen that air pollution is one of the problems in most of Iran’s cities even Rafsanjan. I know that a considerable amount of that can be because of Sarcheshme Copper Mine, but we cannot put all of the responsibility on that factory and just forget about the role of transportation on the environment. Well, I guess even cities can span unreasonably because of current transportation policies. Destroying the Ozon layer is also another adverse effect of the transportation system on the...” |
environment. I even heard that the old wall of Rafsanjan, which is a prominent monument, is prone to destruction because of the unsustainable type of transportation. I think there are various barriers in the way of a more environmentally friendly transportation system. The first one can be when councils decide for or talk about a better transportation system and then don’t do that in practice. Sometimes the infrastructures are not suitable for a sustainable system of transportation like Rafsanjan which does not have any bike lane. If one day you wish for proper cycling, maybe it will be the last day of your life because you easily can be hit by a car. Even the pavements are not suitable for pedestrians. You can fall over easily. I tell you that the next barrier can be the citizens’ habitual behaviours. They get used to using their private vehicle and if any other way would be offered to them, maybe even a better or more sustainable way; they feel uncomfortable with it. The last barrier can be the financial one which is the most important one as well. Sometimes there is no budget for such plans, and these startup plans will be put out before beginning. There can be some drivers toward a better transportation system; I mean some issues can work as drivers in this way and accelerate this issue. A better policy for encouraging better use of land and a better transportation system, a policy to renovate public places to be suitable with a sustainable transportation system and better infrastructures. The rules and regulations should support and facilitate this goal. Planning is another driver which can facilitate sustainable transportation. The first step in every work is planning. I mean without planning we can get to nowhere. Using the latest techniques in the world, with asking for help from the statistic department and using useful data we can move to the next step. Sponsoring the plans is a very big driver; without financial help, any plan can crash. By finding a good source of financial help, all these plans will be possible, and then the last driver can be constant public education to people and keeping the system up to date with the latest changes in the world.

Anyway, this is my experience from working for thirty years in the transportation industry.”

Box 5.2 presents input from Participant 14 about drivers and barriers influencing the success of a novel type of green tourism – honey bee tourism. Drivers identified were providing visits by the government to honey bee farms, appealing to health authorities to use honey as a medication, and the use of honey in the food industry. According to this participant, governmental support and help is the most important driver. He believes that government can do a lot to improve his job.
Box 5.2: Participant 14 – Honey bee tourism

“I was working in the agriculture industry and then after that with the cooperation of one of the colleagues we could establish a new type of tourism business which is honey bee tourism. It is a very green type of job. I know what is a green job, and I really believe in that. Have you ever heard that because of our special geography we are in the top ten for making honey in the world? Why can we not turn it into a green tourism industry? Well maybe because we never think about maximising the use of our potentials. Maybe because the only type of industry we are interested in, are the ones which have the most detrimental effects on the environment and community. It can help our rural regions and provide people and tourists with a healthy food habit. Bulgaria is making a huge amount of money just out of this industry, and then we just ignore it. Whenever I talk about starting this industry, people start to laugh; it is like they never realised tourism is one of the biggest industry in the world and you can offer anything in this industry as a product if there is a buyer. Well, I can say we are in a very infant level of our work, and there are a lot of barriers and challenges in front of our work, besides all of the wrong mentality of the government and society around it. Talking of drivers, well I have my own ideas about drivers, maybe they are not similar to other people’ opinions. I think providing visits by the government facilities of honey bee farms can be a significant driver. It needs a very low investment, maybe just a bus and then as tourists get here, I take the responsibility to provide them with the best experience. Facilitating and counselling with the health system to use honey as a medication … I know it seems funny, but it is practical and straightforward. I am not a man of big words. I make everything simple. The next driver can be the use of honey in food and sweet industry which is a big industry in Iran. It is healthier and even can provide rural people with new jobs. I say, it is not just a green job; it is a decent job.”

Box 5.3 presents input from Participant 15, who is a tour leader and very conscientious about environmental issues. Educating hosts and guests were the main drivers underscored. Lack of sustainable policies, underestimating tour leader jobs in educating society, and lack of proper management were mentioned as the main barriers to providing greener tour leader services.
“I am a tour leader for years. First, when I got into this job, it was all rainbow and sunshine for me. Then I realised it is not just important to work in this beautiful tourism industry. This alone does not change people’ mind to the value of the environment and society. There should be some drivers to do this job in an eco-friendlier way. I think society vision should change, and citizens should know that their role is even more important than ten types of advertisement and marketing. If a citizen cares about the cleanliness of the city, a tourist never let himself/herself to throw rubbish out. Well ... maybe they do, but conscientious citizens have the most impact on my idea. Another driver to do this job more greenly is how we educate the tourists. The better we educate them, the better- behaved they will be. Well as we always say, if a child shows some bad behaviours, we should watch what parents did — the same in a tour leader job. I told you, it is not just an easy job; you are responsible for anything that happens in the host society. Our job is not just memorising some numbers and names and give them to the tourists. Sometimes our job is to knock on people’s door and talk to them about how tourism can benefit them and listen to their complaints about that and try to get to a win-win solution. Let us say educating host and guest are the main drivers of doing this job in a better way. The lack of sustainable policy, considering tour leader job just a simple job without giving it enough value in educating people, and the lack of proper management which is environmental oriented can be the main barriers in doing this job in a greener way, as you mentioned.”

Box 5.4 contains responses from Participant 16 who describes their work as a handicraft entrepreneur as green. She believed that help from external organisations to maintain and improve the results of her work is the best driver for continuing this green job.
Box 5.4:
Participant 16 – Entrepreneur in handicraft jobs

“My job is a green job; I mean green job creation is my job. People come to me, and we go from A to Z together. Any handicraft is related to tourism. We start with a business plan, and then financial support should be sorted out. Sometimes people have a good amount of money to invest themselves, you know in Rafsanjan it is easy to save money through selling pistachios. Although it is not always the case, sometimes, people don’t have enough money, or the project is very big and costly. So, we have to look for a financial sponsor. This financial help even can be from the government, if it seems fundamental for the city. The drivers for this job can be sustaining the results of every green job by the government, private sectors and NGOs’ support, and their participation in keeping and improving these jobs and making the younger generation aware of any opportunity to invest or work in handicraft jobs or even doing volunteer jobs. Some of these jobs are dying, and just because they are more cultural rather than a money maker, no one wants to do them. Media and education systems have an important role, in transferring the awareness. About the barriers .... Well anything can be a barrier, any lack of support, any ignorance, any lack of knowledge. The parliament’s priority is not this issue when they are passing the laws; they sometimes can totally ignore this mentality. They can totally forget about how that law should be in line with the environment. As a woman, every day I think about what culture, I am going to hand over to my children? I guess everyone should do the same.”

In box 5.5, participant 17, a pistachio farmer, said lack of facilities and support, lack of water and natural resources, and lack of knowledge and new technologies as barriers to doing greener work. He considers the driver of doing a better job to be a personal interest in greening jobs.
Box 5.5: Participant 17 – Pistachio farmer

“I am a pistachio farmer and have been in this job for almost 30 years. How you put it as “green job” title, is interesting because I always thought about how I can greenly do my job. Well, sometimes we had some people coming from other cities or even other countries and wanted to have a look at the farm. Well, you know, it was never like a very organised tour, but there were always interested people or businessmen who came to do trading with us, as you put it “business tourism”. Sometimes even people bring their kids in order to let them know about the value of these farms. You know pistachio is always the first or second export of Iran. Anyway ... sometimes when people come to my farm, I become concerned about their health. The reason is because we use so many dangerous chemicals for fertilising the farms. You know I want to tell you what doesn’t let me have a better way of work is lack of facilities and support, maybe lack of water and natural resources these days, lack of knowledge and new technologies. I love this job though I always want to do it in a better way what a better driver than personal interest is? I love this job.”

Box 5.6 displays the response from participant 18, an organic farmer. He saw the barriers to doing a greener job as lack of knowledge about sustainable practices, lack of support from external organisations and green work standards. The biggest driver for doing his job was being able to learn the essential technical skills required.
Box 5.6:  
Participant 18 – Organic farmer  

“I think based on what I saw in the video and the explanation you gave me, I can call my job somehow a green job. You know why? Simply because my job is organic. It means that I shouldn’t use any chemical or harmful fertilisers, chemicals sprays, genetically modified plants, preservatives and using artificial rays for growth. The ways that we should use for our work all should be natural and always keep the biologic balance of nature. I started this job 15 years ago when people even didn’t know what it means. I did much advertising, and then I actually realised one of the ways to improve my job is attracting tourists to my farm. This way I can earn some money as well as educating people. Drivers for doing my job more sustainably... well, my job is sustainable, so, I guess I am telling you the drivers for my job. Making people more aware of the role of this type of agriculture on soil, water and other natural resources, the attitude of people toward this job is very important. Learning about essential technological skill for this job, this is a big driver because as you can see how much you can save by using all of your resources less wastefully, you feel so much more encouraged to do that. Being able to care about social issues including yourself and your family’s health. Just imagine a person who does not care about the general health of his society, and how this person is going to do a green job? Or doing his job in a greener way? Of course, the fundamental and institutional factors are effective as well such as laws and regulations, market and governmental support. Barriers to this job can be the lack of knowledge by farmers or people, lack of support from any helpful organisation and the lack of standards for doing this job in a greener way. I mean, everyone can say I am doing organic farming, but is there any standard to measure that? Not yet, so it can be totally wrong what is offered to the market as organic. I tell you that farmers don’t do their job more sustainably if there is not a proper market for these products. It can easily lead them to lose their positive view to do their job eco-friendly. I feel pleased when I see people come to my farm and buy some organic products passionately. Well by doing that, I mean when tourists come to the farm as a visitor, I should not spend much money for packaging, advertising, transporting the products to market, so I can sell the products at a better price. Having tourists on my farm is always a bonus for me. A win-win relationship. I think any organic farmer should do that as a priority of sale.”

Box 5.7 highlights the views of participant 19 who works in transportation. According to him, the main barriers to do a more sustainable job in this industry is ignorance of government and others about the industry’s environmental impact. The drivers he mentioned were subsidising greener vehicles and improving infrastructures.
Box 5.7:  
Participant 19 – Transportation system worker

“I do a job in transportation system for almost 20 years. I can tell you that this job can be the most pollutant job ever. I make sure that this system should be modified. The drivers for doing this job in an eco-friendly way can be: subsidising electric vehicles, improving better infrastructures. By that, I mean better roads. You know how much making our roads with tar, can be dangerous to the environment? It is really irresponsible making our roads in this way. Another driver can be special permission to hybrid and electric cars, reducing the tax on these green cars, increasing the budget and investment in start-up companies in the green transportation industry. Barriers to making transportation more sustainable? I put it simply: ignorance and being careless, from both government and people.”

Box 5.8 presents the input of an eco-lodge worker. He stated that the main driver for his job is government incentives. Two main barriers he mentioned were lack of a better informed and educated workforce and making more use of information technology.

Box 5.8:  
Participant 20 – Eco-lodge worker

“I work in Eco-lodge for some years, the money is not big, but at least you know that you are doing something valuable for this planet. I tell you that two main barriers of establishing more of these green lodgements are: the lack of better informed and educated workforce and using more information technology. We surely should not forget about the financial part which is only possible with government support or foreign investment. Eco-lodge or hotel business plan is an expensive area. It needs much money to run it, and if you want to run it in a green way without the government support, it is impossible or just short term. I say the biggest driver is the government encouragement and subsidies.”

Participant 21’s response is shown in box 5.9. This participant is a green designer and owner of an advertising company. For them, lack of standards in this area and misconception of people about green products and services were significant barriers to greening his line of work. They saw the main driver of a greener design and advertising industry being what is good for society. In other words, taking a “thinking about all” rather than an “all about me” mindset.
“My job is really unique in Rafsanjan; I do green advertisement and cooperate with green designers if there is any demand. Actually, I have to say, it is a very difficult job, and we are not that much successful in this area. However more efforts are done by people and activist, jobs and groups to make greening as a mentality; we have not succeeded yet. I can say the barrier to that can be the lack of standard in this area. I mean some jobs are done just by greenwashing and that is what eliminates people’s trust in GREENING LABEL. The second barrier can be the misconception of people about the green advertisement. They mostly think that I am trying to convince them of using certain products or services. Whenever I talk about using a green hotel service, they ask me how much I gain from advertising this hotel. They never see that as something we are doing for our own future, and that is a big barrier. The driver to the success of our job is thinking of society. I mean thinking about what is good for everyone rather than what is good for me. That is a big mentality that can lead us to a better future.”

5.7. Preliminary and meta-coding of drivers and barriers

In this section, Tables 5.9 and 5.11 represent the coding of this study. Coding generally involves two phases. The first level is “open coding” or “line by line coding” which is identifying initial themes and ideas. Following that, the second phase is to put the identified themes into a bigger and deeper framework (Smith 2010). In the meta-code phase, the over-arching impacts reflected in themes are identified. Similarities and differences among the subjects can help in meta-coding the data (Smith 2010).

Table 5.9: Preliminary coding and meta-coding of drivers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preliminary codes – Drivers</th>
<th>Drivers’ meta-codes (Doing the job in a greener way, is a matter of …)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Better policies</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of policies and regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rules and regulations</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of policies and regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning and sponsoring the plans</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of comprehensive and proper planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governmental support</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of governmental attitudes and support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preliminary codes – Drivers</td>
<td>Drivers’ meta-codes (Doing the job in a greener way, is a matter of …)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educating host and guests</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of educating and awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help from any organisation to maintain and improve the results of the work</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of governmental attitudes and support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning about essential technological skills</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of essential knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subsidising greener vehicles</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of governmental attitudes and support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improving infrastructures</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of proper infrastructure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government encouragements and subsidies</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of governmental attitudes and support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Thinking about all” rather than “all about me” mindset</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of opening up to new ideas and mind change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal interest</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of internal motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concern about the maintaining of property, plant and equipment (fixed assets)</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of financial opportunities and constraints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concern about customer satisfaction</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of customer’s concerns, satisfaction and expectation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earning money out of sustainable activities</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of financial opportunities and constraints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concern about extra expenses</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of financial opportunities and constraints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customers’ sustainable expectation</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of customer’s concerns, satisfaction and expectation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More efficiency and lower expenses</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of financial opportunities and constraints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsible and conscientious behaviour</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of internal motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear of losing the brand name or customers</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of branding the job and job class level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preliminary codes – Drivers</td>
<td>Drivers’ meta-codes (Doing the job in a greener way, is a matter of …)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encouraging innovative ideas</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of opening up to new ideas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Branding the job</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of branding the job and job class level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strict environmental rules</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of policies and regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High energy expense</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of financial opportunities and constraints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aesthetic or luxury driver</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of jobs’ class level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distributing the responsibilities</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of comprehensive and proper planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Having an internal look rather than an external look</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of internal motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation with the council</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of the tendency to cooperate with environmental policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permits for green cars and technologies</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of policies and regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax-cuts on green cars</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of policies and regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment in start-up companies in green areas</td>
<td>Doing the job in a greener way is a matter of financial opportunities and constraints</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on Table 5.9, the main drivers for doing a greener job are the items listed below, with each also indicating whether they are external or internal:

- Policies and regulations (External)
- Comprehensive and proper planning (External)
- Governmental attitudes and support (External)
- Educating and awareness (External)
- Essential knowledge (External)
- Establishing proper infrastructure (External)
- Internal motivation (Internal)
• Financial opportunities and constraints (External)
• Customer’s concerns, satisfaction and expectation (External)
• Branding the job and job class level (External)
• Opening-up to new ideas and mind change (Internal)
• The tendency from the job holders to cooperate with environmental policies (Internal)
As illustrated in Table 5.10, financial opportunities and constraints; governmental attitude and support; and finally, policies and regulations are the most effective drivers for greening jobs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5.10: Categorising the meta-codes and sub-codes for drivers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Policies and regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better policies,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rules and regulations,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strict environmental rules,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permits for green cars and technologies,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax-cuts on green cars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensive and proper planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning and sponsoring the plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distributing the responsibilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governmental attitudes and support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governmental support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help from any organisation to maintain and improve the results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of the work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subsidising greener vehicles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government encouragements and subsidies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educating and awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educating host and guest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essential knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning about essential technological skill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establishing proper infrastructure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improving infrastructures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsible and conscientious behaviour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial opportunities and constraints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concern about maintaining property, plant and equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(fixed assets)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earning money from sustainable activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial concerns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More efficiency and less expenses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High energy expense,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment in start-up companies in green areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customers' concerns, satisfaction and expectation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concern about customer satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customers’ sustainable expectation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Branding the job and jobs’ class level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear of losing the brand name or customers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Branding the job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aesthetic or luxury driver</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation with the council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The tendency to cooperate with environmental policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening-up to new ideas and mind change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encouraging innovative ideas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Thinking about all” rather than “all about me” mindset</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 5.1: Preliminary coding and meta-coding of barriers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preliminary codes – Barriers</th>
<th>Barriers’ meta-codes (The barrier to greening jobs is a matter of …)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of proper infrastructures</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of facilities, infrastructure and equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of practical actions and plans</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of management, policies and plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens’ habitual behaviours</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of inappropriate habits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of sustainable policies</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of management, policies and plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underestimating tour leader jobs in educating society</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of sharing the responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of proper management</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of management, policies and plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of support</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any ignorance or lack of knowledge</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of knowledge, technology and standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of facilities and support</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possible lack of water and natural resources</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of natural resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of knowledge by farmers or people</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of knowledge, technology and standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of support from any helpful organisation</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of standards</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of knowledge, technology and standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ignorance of both government and people about their effect on the environment</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of ignorance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preliminary codes – Barriers</td>
<td>Barriers’ meta-codes (The barrier to greening jobs is a matter of …)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of better informed and educated workforce</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of awareness and education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of using more of information technology</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of knowledge, technology and standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of standard in this area</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of knowledge, technology and standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misconception of people about green products and services</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of awareness and education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of knowledge and new technologies</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of knowledge, technology and standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of enough knowledge</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of knowledge, technology and standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of facilities</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of facilities, infrastructure and equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of support</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buying specific brands and materials</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of brand obstacles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of internal motivation</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of internal motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic instability</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of economic and financial instability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of ownership</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of ownership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aesthetic or luxury barrier</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of brand obstacles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of supervision</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of management, policies and plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underestimating negative effects of the job</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of ignorance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High expenses</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of affordability of improvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customers’ irrational expectations (customers’ needs have priority over environmental issues)</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of conscientious attitude in the customers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preliminary codes – Barriers</td>
<td>Barriers’ meta-codes (The barrier to greening jobs is a matter of …)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrong perception of helping society</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of knowledge, technology and standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of attention and care and proper management or strict rules</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of management, policies and plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of trust in the system</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of trust in the system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial concerns</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of affordability of improvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of conscientious attitude</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of ignorance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of regular check-ups</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of management, policies and plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old system</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of lack of facilities, infrastructure and equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of enough customers</td>
<td>A barrier to greening jobs is a matter of economic and financial instability</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on Table 5.11, the main barriers to do a greener job are the items listed below, with each also indicating whether they are external or internal:

- Lack of facilities, infrastructure and equipment (External)
- Lack of management, policies and plans (External)
- Inappropriate habits (Internal)
- Lack of sharing the responsibility (External)
- Lack of support (External)
- Lack of knowledge, technology and standards (External)
- Lack of natural resources (External)
- Ignorance (Internal)
- Lack of awareness and education (External)
- Brand obstacles (External)
- Lack of internal motivation (Internal)
- Economic and financial instability (External)
- Lack of ownership (External)
• Lack of affordability of improvement (External)
• Lack of conscientious attitude in the customers (Internal)
• Lack of trust in the system (Internal).

As illustrated in Table 5.12 below, lack of knowledge, technology and standards; management, policies and plans; lack of support and ignorance are the main barriers for participants to do their job sustainably. The lack of facilities, infrastructure and equipment was also mentioned by some participants as an important and influential obstacle. It is obvious that for both the drivers and the barriers, external reasons outweighed internal reasons. In both areas, financial reasons, rules and regulations, and branding were the main external reasons. Personal attitudes toward the way of doing a job were the main internal determinant of green work.

Table 5.12: Categorising the meta-codes and sub-codes for barriers

| Lack of facilities, infrastructure and equipment | Lack of proper infrastructures  
The lack of facilities  
Old system |
| Lack of management, policies and plans | The lack of practical actions and plans  
Lack of sustainable policies; Lack of supervision  
Lack of attention and care and proper management or strict rules  
Lack of regular check ups |
| Inappropriate habits | Citizens’ habitual behaviours |
| Lack of sharing the responsibility | Underestimating tour leader jobs in educating the society |
| Lack of support | Lack of support; Lack of facilities and support  
Lack of support from any helpful organisation |
| Lack of knowledge, technology and standards | Any ignorance or the lack of knowledge  
The lack of using more information technology  
The lack of standards in this area  
The lack of knowledge and new technologies  
The lack of enough knowledge |
| Lack of natural resources | Possible lack of water and natural resources |
| Ignorance | The ignorance of both government and people about the effect on the environment  
Underestimating negative effects of the job  
Lack of conscientious attitude |
| Lack of awareness and education | Lack of better informed and educated workforce  
Misconception of people about green products and services |
| Brand obstacles | Buying specific brands and materials; *Aesthetic or luxury barrier |
| Lack of internal motivation | Lack of internal motivation |
| Economic and financial instability | Economic instability  
Lack of enough customers |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lack of ownership</th>
<th>Lack of ownership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of affordability of improvement</td>
<td>High expenses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>More concern about expenses than the environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lack of conscientious attitude in the customers</strong></td>
<td>Customers’ irrational expectations (customers need prioritise environmental issues)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of trust in the system</td>
<td>Lack of trust in the system</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.8. **Chapter summary**

This chapter presented the findings of the current study in detail. The results of the semi-structured interview and self-interviewing is presented. The data revealed the motivations for and impediments to working in tourism jobs. It considered existing literature and the data collected to identify the implications of improving the greenness of tourism jobs. This chapter has supported and added to previous theory regarding the current state of tourism work practices, and the drivers of and barriers to greening jobs in this industry. Drivers and barriers found in this study were both internal and external. While the external drivers and barriers carried more weight in the eyes of participants, the internal drivers and barriers were also of importance. Lack of technologies and standards; and a lack of management plans and policies are the main barriers. Support from the government and financial incentives were recognised as the main drivers. During the development of the chapter, the methodology used in this study shed light on many issues, such as common motivations for doing a tourism job and drivers for greening jobs. Throughout this discussion, the implications of the findings were also highlighted.
CHAPTER 6
DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

6.1. Introduction

Chapter 5 presented the key findings of the data analysis. This included drivers for, and barriers to, participating in greening jobs. Chapter 6 provides an overview of these findings while considering existing literature. Further, the implications for planning, developing, improving, and promoting green jobs in Rafsanjan are discussed.

First, in this chapter, a general idea of the drivers for, and barriers to, participating in greening current jobs is discussed (Section 6.2). Also included will be an analysis of previous relevant literature.

This chapter also presents a summary of the main findings pertaining to the three research objectives stated in Chapter 1 (Section 1.2). Next, the chapter deals with the study's contribution to theory and practice in green jobs in tourism (Section 6.4). In Section 6.5, the limitations of this research are provided, while further research to be conducted is proposed in Section 6.6. Section 6.7 contains the concluding statement of this thesis.

6.2. Drivers for, and barriers to, green jobs in tourism

There have not been previous findings on green job drivers and barriers in Iran. Various research studies have been conducted, in each sector of tourism separately, on green jobs and the process of developing them in different countries: Ahn et al. (2013) - United States; Aguado & Holl (2018) - Spain and Norway; Amandeep (2017) - India; Avcikurt et al. (2016) - Kuoni Group; Bekele (2017) – China; DEFRA (2006) - UK; Erdogan & Baris (2007) - Turkey; Graci & Kuehnel (n.d.) - Best Practices hotels around the world; ; Kasim & Ismail (2012) - Penang, Malaysia; Li (2016) - International Metropolises; Mbasera et al. (2015 and 2016) - South Africa and Zimbabwe; Noor & Kumar (2014) - Malaysia; OECD (2011) – Global; Sinha & Dhumes (2014) - India; Sinha (2011) – global and India; Sudhakara (2013) – India; Wang (2012) - Taiwan. Some research has also been conducted on drivers and barriers in green entrepreneurship in the agriculture industry (Rezaei, Kahrizi & Najafpoor 2016; Rezaei, Najafpoor & Naderi 2017; Izadi, Rezaei & Asadollahpoor 2016). Adding to that, drivers for, and barriers to sustainable tourism have also been considered in previous literature (Gohari 2018). Some drivers and barriers
identified in this study confirm those of previous work on drivers and barriers globally (Bradbrook et al. 2013; Bond, Pacifici & Newman n.d.; Ghazilla et al. 2015), and some of the present study’s findings are in contrast with those of previous research (Perrett 2011; Bond, Pacifici & Newman n.d; Ghazilla et al. 2015; Ahn et al. 2013). The main drivers identified herein are financial opportunities and constraints; governmental attitude and support; policies and regulations. The lack of knowledge, technology and standards; lack of management, policies, plans; and ignorance are the key barriers for participants being able to conduct their work sustainably. However, in previous studies, some of the variables discovered were different (Bradbrook et al. 2013; Bond, Pacifici & Newman n.d.; Ghazilla et al. 2015; Perrett 2011), while a study on hotels and restaurants in Malaysia bore similar results (Kasim & Ismail 2012). Among these factors, drivers that are consistent with the findings of previous studies are government control and incentives (Bradbrook et al. 2013). The barriers to participating in greening jobs found in previous studies are high costs, the unwillingness to pay additional costs and lack of awareness (Bond, Pacifici & Newman n.d.). Two studies reported the following the following drivers and barriers as follows: increased education and greater availability of green products as the main drivers, and unreliable/unproven technology and limited availability of new technology affected the greening of commercial properties as barriers (Perrett 2011). In the second study, it was found that improved company image through greening work process and creating the perception of increased product quality, and weak organizational structure to support greening were the drivers, while inadequate R&D, design and testing within the organisation were the most significant barriers (Ghazilla et al. 2015). Lack of support and ignorance is mentioned in all previous research as barriers (Perrett, 2011; Bond, Pacifici & Newman n.d.; Ghazilla et al. 2015). This is consistent with the current study. In Kasim and Ismail (2011), management expressed concern about the environment but struggled to implement those concerns. While some restaurants made efforts to green their jobs, this occurred only to the extent that such changes saved costs. Being too apprehensive about adopting environmentally friendly work practices due to uncertainty about long-term revenue was one of the key barriers observed. This is consistent with the current study.

The current study focused on the drivers and barriers for workers and professionals in tourism being able to work greenly. These factors were compared to those of previous studies. This study also identified drivers that have not been explored previously in Iran. These were essential knowledge, internal motivation, opening up to
new ideas and mind change and job class level.

Also, the barriers to participating in greening jobs that this study identified differ from those of other studies. Inappropriate habits, ignorance, lack of ownership and lack of trust in the system are examples of barriers not previously explored. It is important to notice that most of the past studies used quantitative methods to capture participants’ opinions about barriers and drivers.

Furthermore, this study categorised the drivers and barriers as internal or external. Although participants could have emphasised external policies as most important, internal reasons can be viewed as similarly important. Internal motivation; opening up to new ideas and mind change; the tendency to cooperate with environmental policies are the main internal drivers mentioned for engaging in the greening of jobs. Internal barriers that were identified included: inappropriate habits; ignorance; lack of internal motivation; lack of conscientiousness of customers; and lack of trust in the system.

This study is based on qualitative methods. This study also highlights the motivations for and impediments to participating in tourism jobs. These can be very similar to those that pertain to greening such jobs. In other words, the same reasons that act as impediments to greening jobs can also drive workers to quit that job. Also, as illustrated in sections 6.3.2 and 6.3.3, as the reasons for working in tourism shift from the financial to the social, personal and environmental, sustainable work practices increase. Some motivations for and impediments to working in tourism identified in this study reflected the participants’ mindset towards the environment and society in the context of their job. This was also observed in relation to the drivers of and barriers to participants greening their jobs. The findings of the present study are that young workers and professionals in the tourism industry chose this job because of personal interest or being interested to get in touch with people. More experienced workers and professionals working in tourism, at the time of this study, mentioned other reasons such as doing a valuable job for the community or being in touch with nature. These results highlight that people working in tourism predominantly chose this industry for social and environmental reasons, rather than solely for financial gain. Considering these findings, it is interesting that despite their social and environmental attitude, they ignored environmental concerns and what is best for society, which is greening their jobs.
In addition to motivations, identifying impediments to working in tourism jobs was a unique contribution of this study to the existing literature, for the above reasons. Young workers and professionals’ main impediment was unreasonable criticism. Other reasons provided by the workers were difficulty in dealing with other colleagues or difficulty in dealing with the tax department, which indicated that one of the main impediment for workers to work in tourism is social. Another important impediment was lack of a practical and cooperative system. Workers and professionals who were more experienced stated that ignorant people and ignorant government were the main reasons for feeling resentful toward this job, which was also mentioned as a barrier to greening jobs.

The findings presented on drivers and barriers show that lack of knowledge is one of the key aspects of avoiding the greening of jobs. This highlights the role of promotions and campaigns in raising awareness among tourism job-holders of the importance of environmentally sustainable tourism jobs. Such interventions could also help motivate them to contribute to greening their jobs. This study also underscored a rise among tourism workers and professional in self-education, training and gaining awareness about the environmental impact of their work.
6.3. **Review of research objectives**

This study investigated drivers for and barriers to engaging in green jobs and greening current jobs in tourism. The main aim of this study was to understand workers’ and professionals’ attitudes, behaviours and preferences with regards to carrying out green work practices in their tourism job. Prior to this study, there has been a lack of research on the drivers and barriers influencing participation in the greening of jobs in tourism. As a result, there are certain gaps regarding the information about workers’ and professionals’ behaviour, attitudes and preferences about this issue. In response, the current study aims to fill these gaps by using a qualitative method to pursue the three research objectives as provided in Chapter 1. Sections 6.3.1 to 6.3.3 summarised the main findings of this study in relation to those three objectives.

6.3.1. **Research objective one: To identify the current state of tourism, and the activities and preferences of tourists in Rafsanjan**

Research objective one in this study presented the tourism activities and tourism jobs. Statistical data on tourism activities and the state of tourism in Rafsanjan that may influence opportunities for greening tourism jobs will now be summarised.

Having summarised findings on employment preferences and practices, findings of the current situation of the tourism industry in Rafsanjan will be reported. The main activities engaged in by tourists to Rafsanjan included visiting friends, family and relatives, and engaging in leisure and business. Most of the visitors went to this city for day trips, while a similar number had overnight stays. This reflects an increasing number of transit passengers and one-day business passengers. Most tourists chose friends’ and family’s houses as their preferred type of accommodation. Expenses while travelling were mostly for transport followed by food and beverages. Also, large amounts of money were spent on health care, goods and products. Finally, the preferred mode of travel was by a privately-owned car, which is the most popular mode of travel in Iran. One reason for this is the low cost of petrol and car maintenance (Guillaume, Zytek & Farzin 2011)
6.3.2. Research objective two: To investigate the drivers for Rafsanjani workers and professionals toward greening their jobs in tourism

Objective two starts with identifying the main motivations of people for working in tourism jobs. This is followed by the drivers for greening those jobs. It was intended that this may reveal insights into the attitudes of workers and professionals necessary for adopting green work practices. It has been found that material and financial motivations can be weaker than if a job is performed out of personal interest. This is also true of those with a passion for being in touch with society and nature. Commitment, satisfaction, efficiency, innovation and creativity to perform the job sustainably, will increase where there is a deeper motivation for doing that particular job (Borzaga & Tortia 2006). Based on the human need hierarchy (Health Knowledge 2018), the deeper and more internal the incentive is, the performance quality of the workplace will increase. The most common motivation reported was being in touch with society and people, as well as being able to contribute to the community. Personal interest and money making were other motivations frequently cited by participants. Participants were asked about potential drivers of creating green jobs. General drivers mentioned by participants were mostly extrinsically focussed. These included financial/non-financial encouragement and reward; governmental supervision; governmental help and support; cooperation and help of council; and so forth. Intrinsic general drivers reported were, changing the common culture; and turning the environmental concerns into a personal and internal concern; and so forth.

Drivers found in this study for greening current jobs, were categorised as internal or external. External drivers reported policies and regulations; comprehensive and proper planning; governmental attitudes and support; educating and awareness; essential knowledge; proper infrastructure; cooperation with authorities; financial opportunities and constraints; customer’s concerns; satisfaction and expectation, jobs’ class level; branding concerns.

These findings highlight that drivers for greening current jobs can be internal and more motivational as well. For example, Opening-up to new ideas; the process of mind change; and internal motivation. Also, the results suggest that financial opportunities and constraints; governmental attitude, support and policies; and regulations are the most effective drivers for greening jobs in Rafsanjan. No significant difference was observed
among the drivers mentioned by professionals and workers, or between various age or educational attainment groups. In sum, the research identified that people are more willing to engage in environmentally friendly work practices for external reasons.

6.3.3. Research objective three: To explore the barriers to greening tourism jobs by Rafsanjani workers and professionals

The third research objective was to explore the barriers of Rafsanjani workers and professionals to greening their jobs. Internal barriers identified by participants included inappropriate habits; ignorance; the lack of internal motivation; the lack of conscientious attitude in the customers; the lack of trust in the system. However, the data revealed that interviewees identified more external than internal barriers to, and drivers for greening their jobs.

External barriers identified were lack of facilities; infrastructure and equipment; management, policies and plans; sharing responsibility; support; knowledge, technology and standards; natural resources; awareness and education; brand obstacles; economic and financial instability; lack of ownership; and affordability of improvement. To increase the rate of engagement in greening jobs, more promotion is needed to educate stakeholders about the values and principles of green jobs. As well, comprehensive strategies could be developed to overcome the external barriers identified.

Barriers and impediments to performing tourism jobs were also investigated. Some impediments to doing a tourism job can be common with the barriers to greening that job. In addition, some barriers cited by the participants were environmental (lack of water), which vindicates the significance of this study in the context of global warming and the urgent need for greening jobs. Other deterrents were aspects of the job role that were unsustainable and therefore in need of greening (everything is about speed, long working hours). These deterrents were as follows: unreasonable critics, not having a proper tourism culture; fussy customers; working hours; tax department; high expectations from the government; being every one's servant; ignorant government; going to new markets is a challenge; coming across ignorant customers; not being appreciated enough for the work performed; lack of water; lack of knowledge between people; working like a robot; irresponsible customers.

The motivations, impediments, drivers and barriers identified here suggest that participants are interested in being more environmentally responsible in their work. Also
underscored was that they resent any irresponsible behaviour. Reasons given for disliking a job were similar to barriers to carrying out green work. This indicates that deep down tourism workers would like to perform environmentally-friendly work, but certain impediments prevent this. Those restrictions were outlined in the preceding paragraphs of this report.

6.4. Contribution to knowledge

This research yielded some novel findings, which resulted in theoretical and practical contributions to existing knowledge. These contributions are presented in sections 6.5.1 and 6.5.2.

6.4.1. Theoretical contribution to knowledge

This study used a qualitative methodological approach for examining green jobs in tourism, which had limited previous application. In addition, this study may improve the theoretical understanding of Rafsanjan’s tourism job profile. The theoretical contributions are as follows:

First, the literature suggests that the tourism industry and activities in Rafsanjan influence the extent to which tourism jobs affect the environment. A key theoretical contribution of this study was to consider tourism activities when examining the greenness of tourism industries. The results also suggest that the environmental impact of certain jobs is influenced by the type of tourism taking place. Jobs which had greater impact on the environment were food and beverage; retail and industry; transportation. Finally, the literature suggests that the health of the economy is influenced by the state of the environment and vice versa. This was corroborated in the present study, as all the participants reported that their work and the environment had reciprocal effects on each other. The findings indicate that there is a lack of awareness regarding how to work sustainably, or how the participant’s job impacted the environment. As mentioned in the literature on this topic, cultural richness and local control (Chernyshev n.d.) (determined from input from people and government) influence how jobs are carried out.

Data collected from self-interviews also contributed to theoretical knowledge. Specifically, this included identifying workers’ and professionals’ drivers for, and barriers to, participating in greening jobs. The drivers and barriers were identified from participants’ responses about how to perform their work in environmentally sustainable ways. The drivers (represented in the findings section) that encouraged workers and
professionals to engage in green job activities were: *changing the common culture and turning the environmental concerns into a personal and internal concern; policies and regulations; comprehensive and proper planning; governmental attitudes and support; educating and awareness; essential knowledge, proper infrastructure; cooperation with authorities; financial opportunities and constraints; customer’s concerns; satisfaction and expectation; jobs’ class level; and branding concerns.* While no previous research exists on this topic in Rafsanjan, a previous study on green hotels in Tehran yielded similar results (Ziaei & Ranjbar 2013). However, new factors were discovered in this study including the drivers of *educating and awareness; essential knowledge; cooperation with authorities.* Also, *education and awareness* connected drivers with the education and promotion system (Shobeiri & Pap Kiadeh 2016; Kalhori & Naeimi Majd 2017).

In addition to the drivers to greening tourism jobs in Rafsanjan, the barriers found included: inappropriate habits; ignorance, the lack of internal motivation; conscientious attitude in customers; trust in the system, facilities, infrastructure and equipment, management, policies and plans; sharing responsibility; support; knowledge, technology and standards; natural resources; awareness and education; brand obstacles; economic and financial instability; ownership; and affordability of improvement. While some of these barriers have been identified previously (Ziaei & Ranjbar 2013), Ziaei and Ranjbar’s (2013) study did not identify internal barriers effectively. Therefore, barriers identified in the current study contributed understanding of barriers to engaging in greening tourism jobs in Rafsanjan.

Finally, the literature suggests that environmental, social and economic activities are interrelated. This theory is confirmed by the present findings, which highlight the drivers and barriers that were influencing the greening of tourism jobs.

### 6.4.2. Practical contribution to knowledge

This study has helped to make a practical contribution. In particular, the present findings could assist tourism industry stakeholders in improving planning and management systems. Having profiled the workers and professionals in tourism, and the tourism activity in Rafsanjan, the drivers for and barriers to greening tourism jobs, new options arise for increasing the importance of green jobs. For example, policies, rules and regulations, the education system, marketing and advertising could be employed to increase awareness and participation in greening tourism jobs in Rafsanjan. This would
have positive economic, social and environmental impacts on that city.

In addition, the findings of this research could enable tourism services to progress toward more sustainable products, services and offers. Branding and standards could be modified and enhanced to increase compliance with a greener tourism economy. An example of this would be to introduce green standards as an obligation to run tourism businesses.

6.5. Limitations of the research

The researcher acknowledges that there were limitations involved in this study. Theoretical and practical contributions might be more limited when data is collected from only one place. This study only represents the population of workers and professionals in tourism jobs in Rafsanjan. It does not include the whole population of Iranian workers and professionals in this sector. Also, the current study only focused on a limited number of tourism jobs that exist in the region. Therefore, the current findings may not generalise to other geographical locations.

Notwithstanding these limitations, the findings on drivers and barriers are consistent with those identified in previous studies. In addition, this study expanded them both relative to similar Iranian literature and the extant research. The data of this study was also collected from industries for which tourism is an aspect of their business. Therefore, it is possible to extend the findings of this research to other jobs and industries and/or cities within Iran, with caution.

While the sample size was small, which lead to inconclusive findings, the aim of the study was to provide preliminary findings that could lead to further investigation of the issues under study. Also, the lack of statistical power of the quantitative findings was counterbalanced by yielding qualitative data to address the research objectives. Moreover, this was achieved by providing a rich in-depth understanding of the participants’ preferences and views. Thus, while the findings are not generalisable to the wider population, the data presented here provide a better understanding of tourism professionals’ and workers’ preferences with regards to greening their jobs.
6.6. The extent of further research

A deeper understanding of green jobs in tourism and their effect on the society, environment and economy is needed. Various limitations of this study were identified and to overcome those limitations, this section suggests possible future studies that could be undertaken. Further, limited guidelines are provided in this chapter, which are helpful for expanding the current study.

6.6.1. Further research into workers’ and professionals’ perceptions of green jobs in Iran

A deeper understanding of green jobs in tourism and their effect on society, the environment and the economy is needed. Various limitations of this study were identified and to overcome those limitations, this section suggests possible future studies that could be undertaken. Further, some guidelines are provided in this chapter, which are helpful for expanding the current study.

6.6.2. Application of the methodology to other types of tourism studies

The methodology used in this research with professionals, job owners and entrepreneurs, was self-interviewing. Further adoption of this methodology in future studies would help evaluate its effectiveness for understanding how workers and professionals might contribute to greening tourism jobs.

Using this new method also presented some difficulties during this study. Based on the author’s experiences of its limitations, the following are suggestions for improving its adoption in future:

- Videos and texts that are used in the research must be selected to consider the research aims and objectives. Validating the videos is best done with a pilot group instead of with peers. The perceptions of participants can differ from those of academics and university students. Workers and professionals in tourism generally have a different point of view. Videos should not be in a professional language. They should be simple and understandable for people with any education level.

- The location of this study was one city in Iran. Self-interviewing was mostly done with the entrepreneurs and professionals who had been working in tourism jobs in Rafsanjan for a long time. When applying this methodology to a different group
with less experience, it would be important to give them more information to obtain useful answers.

6.6.3. Further research into green jobs and the connection with global warming

This study suggests that financial issues and government support are the main drivers influencing the greening of tourism jobs. It is suggested that more research should be done to understand the effect of green jobs on the development and improvement of societies and communities. From another point of view, global warming, which is considered one of the main threats to humanity is directly related to the way that economies choose to run their activities. Green jobs research opens a new door to helping to address global warming more effectively. Therefore, more research into this area is vital.

6.6.4. Further research into green jobs and the connection with the fundamental principles

This study came across some fundamental principles for applying greening concept to any job. It is suggested that more study will be done on the effect of gig economy or fissured workplace on functioning green jobs. Both these two concepts create an unsuitable situation in any workplace for applying green job. In addition, corporate social and environmental responsibility (CSR and CER) is fundamental in advancing green job agenda. Doing more research in these areas makes the green job creation possible in any society.

6.7. Concluding statement

This study aimed to address the question, is there a lack of interest in greening jobs among workers and professionals in tourism? Another question of interest was, how can tourism jobs be greened? What drives them and what impedes them from greening? To address these questions, the demographics of participants, and the characteristics of tourism in Rafsanjan, Iran were profiled systematically. Workers’ and professionals’ job processes in tourism have also been described. In addition, the study has presented the drivers for, and barriers to, greening jobs in tourism. This study may also be one of the limited studies to have used the qualitative methods of interviewing, and self-interviewing, to explore more experienced workers and professionals’ perceptions of the way they perform their jobs. It is proposed that, due to using this data collection method, the answers provided by this study are more in-depth and well-thought through
than what has been achieved by previous studies.

Various possibilities for future studies into green jobs in tourism were also identified in the current paper. The researcher hopes that this work will inspire further research into how to green tourism jobs, as this is vital for developing and improving society, the economy and the environment. The author also hopes that the present findings will aid in creating strategies and policies for the greening of tourism jobs, and hopefully lead to greening the economy more broadly. Further, it is hoped that more participation from workers and professionals in greening their jobs might also generate additional job opportunities. This study highlights that the mindset of workers and professionals in tourism, and in any industry, is key to developing green industries.

The drivers and barriers found in this study highlight that tourism is highly focused on revenue. Financial encouragement and constraints were the main drivers for, and barriers to greening jobs. Some participants were apprehensive about making such changes because of the potential cost. This is despite evidence that greening jobs is associated with lower costs over the long term. Larger organisations with greater access to finance can be more open to greening jobs, as far as it improves their competitive advantage or strengthens their branding. Most participants were not convinced about the benefits of greening their jobs, nor were they overly accepting of green innovations. On the contrary, older workers and professionals showed more genuine concern about the environment, their behaviour and their job performance. Lack of policies, rules and regulations was described as one of the main barriers to greening tourism jobs. This was because of perceptions that government support is needed to make the transition to a green economy. Regular supervision systems, government involvement and wise practices can lead to greening current jobs.
References


Auerbach, C & Silverstein, L 2003, Qualitative data: An introduction to coding and analysis, NYU Press, New York.

Bahrami, M, Karami, M, Sharhastani, S & Tahmasebizadeh, M 2017, 'People's knowledge and function of the city of Rafsanjan toward solid urban waste management', *Journal of Rafsanjan University of Medical Sciences*, vol. 16, pp. 571-580.


Battaglia, M, Cerrini, E & Annesi, N 2018, 'Can environmental agreements represent an opportunity for green jobs? Evidence from two Italian experiences', *Journal of Cleaner Production*, vol. 175, pp. 257-266.

Bavdekar, S 2016, 'Formulating the right title for a research article', *Journal of the Association of Physicians of India*, vol. 64, pp. 52-56.


Bemani 2013b, Rafsanjan's economy is dependent on agriculture, viewed 16 December 2018, <https://www.yjc.ir/fa/news/4979627/85-%D8%A8%AF-%D8%B1%DB%85%D8%AF-%D8%A7%D9%82%DB%8A%DB%85%DB%8A%D8%A7%D8%AF-%D8%B1%D9%81%DB%83%D9%86%DB%AC%DB%A7%D9%86-%D9%88%DB%87%D8%A8%DB%83%DB%8A%D9%87-%DB%A9%DB%84%DB%A7%D9%88%DB%B1%DB%82%DB%8C-%DB%A7%DB%83%DB%8A%DB%8E>


Carfì, D & Schilirò, D 2012, 'A coopetitive model for the green economy', *Economic Modelling*, vol. 29, no. 4, pp. 1215-1219.


Center of Strategic Studies 2017, *The fears and hopes of a province*, viewed 16 December 2017, <http://www.css.ir/fa/content/112693/%D8%A8%DB%8C%D9%85_%D9%88_%D8%A7%D9%85%DB%8C%D8%A7%DB%8C%D9%87%80%AF%D9%87%D8%A7%DB%8C%D9%85%DB%8C%D8%A7%DB%8C%D8%A7%DB%8C%D8%AF%D9%87%D8%A7%DB%8C%D9%85%DB%8C%D8%A7%DB%8C%D8%A7%DB%8C%D9%86>.


Chowdhury, MF 2015, 'Coding, sorting and sifting of qualitative data analysis: Debates and discussion', *Quality & Quantity*, vol. 49, no. 3, pp. 1135-1143.

Colombotos, J 1969, 'Personal versus telephone interviews: effect on responses', *Public Health Reports*, vol. 84, no. 9, p. 773-782.


Crotty, M 1998, *The foundations of social research: Meaning and perspective in the research process*, Sage, California.


Dana Information Network 2018, *Wandering wastes in the center of the province until women's depression is shadowed by Sarcheshmeh Copper Complex*, viewed 18 December 2018, <http://www.dana.ir/news/758042.html/%D8%A7%D8%B2-%D8%B3%D8%B1%DA%AF%D8%B1%D8%AF%D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%A8%D9%88%D8%AF%D9%86-%D8%B2%D8%A8%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%87-%D9%87%D8%A7-%D8%AF%D8%B1-%D9%85%D8%B1%DA%A9%D8%B2-%D8%A7%D8%B3%D8%AA%D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%AA%D8%A7-%D8%A7%D9%81%D8%B3%D8%B1%D8%AF%DA%AF%DB%8C-%D8%A8%D8%A7%D9%86%D9%88%D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%AF%D8%B1-%D8%B3%D8%A7=DB%8C%D9%87>.

Denzin, NK & YS Lincoln, YS 2000, Handbook of qualitative inquiry, Sage, California.


Douglas, JD 1985, Creative interviewing, Sage, California.


Eghtesad Online 2016, *The largest producer of pistachios in the world + Infographic*, viewed 28 December 2017, <https://www.eghtesadonline.com/%D8%A8%D8%AE%D8%B4-%DA%A9%D8%B4%D8%A7%D9%88%D8%B1%D8%B2%DB%8C-91/236510-%D8%A8%D8%B2%D8%B1%DA%AF-%D8%AA%D8%B1%DB%8C%D9%86-%DA%A9%D8%B4%D9%88%D8%B1%D9%87%D8%A7%DB%8C-%D8%AA%D9%88%D9%84%DB%8C%D8%AF%DA%A9%D9%86%D9%86%D8%AF%D9%87-%D9%BE%D8%B3%D8%AA%D9%87-%D8%AF%D8%B1-%D8%AC%D9%87%D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%A7%DB%8C%D9%86%D9%81%D9%88%DA%AF%D8%B1%D8%A7%D9%81%DB%8C%DA%A9>.


Energy Today 2017, *Opening 1.2 MW Rafsanjan solar power plant*, viewed 22 December 2018, <https://www.iranenergy.news/news/13479/960605/%D8%A7%D9%81%D8%AA%D8%AE%D8%B4-%DA%A9%D8%B4%D8%A7%D9%88%D8%B1%D8%B2%DB%8C-91/236510-%D8%A8%D8%B2%D8%B1%DA%AF-%D8%AA%D8%B1%DB%8C%D9%86-%DA%A9%D8%B4%D9%88%D8%B1%D9%87%D8%A7%DB%8C-%D8%AA%D9%88%D9%84%DB%8C%D8%AF%DA%A9%D9%86%D9%86%D8%AF%D9%87-%D9%BE%D8%B3%D8%AA%D9%87-%D8%AF%D8%B1-%D8%AC%D9%87%D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%A7%DB%8C%D9%86%D9%81%D9%88%DA%AF%D8%B1%D8%A7%D9%81%DB%8C%DA%A9>.


Erwin, M 2011, *Demand for green jobs*, Georgetown University, Washington, DC.


Ghobadi, G & Verdian, M 2016, 'The environmental effects of tourism development in Noushahr', *Open Journal of Ecology*, vol. 6, no. 9, pp. 529-536.


Gohari, M 2018, 'The barriers to tourism industry in Iran', *Donyaye Eghtesad*, viewed 24 December 2018, <https://donya-e-eqtesad.com/%D8%A8%D8%AE%D8%B4-%DA%AF%D8%B1%DB%AF%D8%B4%DA%AF%D8%B1%DB%8C-48/343872-%D8%B9%DB%8C%DA%AF%D8%B1%DB%AF%D8%A7%D9%85%D9%84-%D8%B3%D8%B1%DA%AF%D8%B1%D8%AF%D8%A7%D9%86%DB%8C-%D8%B5%D9%86%DB%98%DA%AA-%D8%A9%D9%88%D8%B1%DB%8C%8D%B3%D9%85-%D8%AF%D8%B1-%D8%A7%DB%8C%DB%8C%8D%A7%D9%86>.

Golestan Amin 2018, *Golestan Amin Palace*, viewed 26 December 2018,


Graci, S & Dodds, R 2008, 'Why go green? The business case for environmental commitment in the Canadian hotel industry', *Anatolia*, vol. 19, no. 2, pp. 251-270.


Hamshahri Online 2012, 70% of Rafsanjan's pistachios were damaged, viewed 17 December 2018,
<https://www.hamshahrionline.ir/news/235942/%DB%B7%DB%B0%DB%A7%DB%B1-%D8%A7%DB%8C%DB%B4%DB%8C>.


I.R. of Iran Meteorological Organization (IRIMO) 2018, Meteorological Organization of Iran, viewed 12 December 2018, <https://www.irimo.ir/far/wd/701-%D9%BE%DB%8C%D8%B4-%D8%A8%DB%8C%D9%86%DB%8C-%D9%88%D8%B6%D8%B9-%D9%87%D9%88%D8%A7%DB%8C-%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86.html?id=127>.


International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC) 2012, Growing green and decent jobs,
ITUC International Trade Union Confederation and Millennium Institute Belgium, viewed 31 March 2017, <retrieved from ITUC International Trade Union Confederation and Millennium Institute database>.


Iranian Students’ News Agency (ISNA). 2015a, 8 billion Tomans revenue of Valiasr University of Rafsanjan in 2015, viewed 14 December 2018, <https://www.isna.ir/news/95122113391/%D8%AF%D8%B1%D8%A2%D9%85%D8%AF-%D8%AA%D9%88%D9%85%D8%A7%D9%81%D8%AF-%D8%A7%D9%86%D8%B4-%DA%AF%D8%A7%D9%87-%D9%88%D9%84%DB%8C-%D8%B9%D8%B5%DB%B1-%D8%B9%D8%AC-%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%DB%AC-%D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%AF%D8%B1-%D8%B3%D8%A7%D9%84-95>.


Iranian Students’ News Agency (ISNA) 2018a, 100 days to a deep, comfortable breath, viewed 10 December 2018, <https://www.isna.ir/news/97091909539/%DB%B1%DB%B0%DB%B0-%D8%B1%D9%88%D8%B2-%D8%AA%D8%A7-%DB%8C%DA%A9-%D9%86%D9%81%D8%B3-%D8%B9%D9%85%DB%8C%D9%82-%D8%B1%D8%A7%D8%AD%D8%AA>.

Iranian Students’ News Agency (ISNA) 2018b, Introduction of Rafsanjan tourism industry using knowledge designers, viewed 12 December 2018, <https://www.isna.ir/news/97091808909/%D9%85%D8%B9%D8%B1%D9%81%DB%8C-%D8%B5%D9%86%DB%B9%D8%AA-%DA%AF%D8%B1%D8%AF%D8%B4-%DA%AF%D8%B1%DB%8C-%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%DB%AC-%D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%AF%D9%87-%D8%A7%D8%B2-%D8%B7%D8%B1%DB%8D-%DA%97%87%DB%A7%8C-%D8%AF%D8%A7%D9%86%D8%B4-%D8%A8%D9%86%DB%8C%D8%A7%D9%86>.

Iranian Students’ News Agency (ISNA) 2018c, Vali Asr University of Rafsanjan has been constantly improving over the past 27 years, viewed 12 December 2018, <http://kerman.isna.ir/default.aspx?NSID=5&SSLID=46&NID=59700>.


Irvine, A, Drew, P & Sainsbury, R 2013, ‘Am I not answering your questions properly? Clarification, adequacy and responsiveness in semi-structured telephone and face-to-
face interviews', *Qualitative Research*, vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 87-106.

Irwin, S 2013, 'Qualitative secondary data analysis: Ethics, epistemology and context', *Progress in Development Studies*, vol. 13, no. 4, pp. 295-306.


Jackson, RL, Drummond, DK & Camara, S 2007, 'What is qualitative research?', *Qualitative Research Reports in Communication*, vol. 8, no. 1, pp. 21-28.


Jamshidnezhad, A 2016, *Tourism and its effect on the enviornment*, viewed 22 October 2018, <https://donya-e-eqtesad.com/%D8%A8%D8%AE%D8%B4-%D9%88%D8%B7-%D8%B0%DB%8C-%D9%84%D8%B1%DB%8C-%D8%AA%D8%A7%D9%85%D8%B3%DB%8C-%D8%B4%D8%AF%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86>.


Jazebeha 2018, *Rafsanjan attraction*, viewed 17 December 2018, <https://jazabeha.ir/7-%D8%AC%D8%A7%D8%B0%DB%8A%D8%97-%D8%AF%DB%8C-%D9%86%DB%8C-%D9%84-%D8%B4%D9%87-%D8%B1-%D8%A7%D9%85%D8%B3%DB%8C-%D8%A7%D9%86>.


Jobinja 2019, Tourism jobs in Iran, viewed 12 October 2018, <https://jobinja.ir/jobs?filters%5Bkeywords%5D%5B5%5D=%DA%AF%D8%B1%D8%AF%D8%A4%DA%AF%D8%B1%DB%8C&filters%5Blocations%5D%5B5%5D=&filters%5Bjob_categories%5D%5B5%5D=>.


Khane Kheshti News 2003, Rafsanjan is one of the most polluted cities in the world!, viewed 19 December 2018, http://www.khanehkheshti.com/12311/%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86-%D9%83%D9%8A-%D8%A7%D8%B2-%D8%A2%D9%84%D9%88%D8%AF%D9%87-%D8%AA%D8%B1%D9%8A%D9%86-%D8%B4%D9%87%D8%B1%D9%87%D8%A7%D9%8A-%D8%AC%D9%87%D8%A7%D9%86/.

Khane Kheshti News 2017, Report on environmental challenges in Rafsanjan, viewed 12 December 2017, http://www.khanehkheshti.com/124710/%DA%AF%D8%B2%D8%A7%D8%B4-%D8%AE%D8%A7%D8%B2-%DA%86%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%B4-%D9%87%D8%A7%D8%AC-%D8%B2%DB%8C%D8%B3%D8%AA-%D9%85%D8%AD/.


Kvale, S 2007, Doing interviews, Sage, California.


Li, HR 2016, 'Study on green transportation system of international metropolises', *Procedia Engineering*, vol. 137, pp. 762-771.


156

Mason, M 2010, 'Sample size and saturation in PhD studies using qualitative interviews', Qualitative Social Research, vol. 11, no. 3, art. 8.


Mehr News 2017, 34% of the country's pistachio product was produced in Rafsanjan, viewed 16 November 2018, <https://www.mehrnews.com/news/4121799/%D8%B3%DB%B4-%D8%AF%D8%B1%D8%B5%D8%AF-%D9%85%D8%AD%D8%B5%D9%88%D9%84-%D9%BE%D8%B3%D8%AA%D9%87-%DA%A9%D8%B4%D9%88%D8%B1-%D8%AF%D8%B1-%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%AA%D9%88%D9%84%DB%8C%D8%AF-%D8%B4%D8%AF>.


Miles, MB & Huberman, A 1994, Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook, Sage, California.


Morse, JM 1994, 'Designing qualitative research', in NK Denzin & YS Lincoln (eds), *Handbook of qualitative inquiry*, Sage, California.


Mosafer Salam 2018, *An introduction of Rafsanjan city*, viewed 18 September 2018, <https://mosafersalam.com/city/%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86/>.


Phillimore, J & Goodson, L (eds) 2004, 'Qualitative research in tourism: Ontologies, epistemologies and methodologies', Routledge, London.


Rafsanjan City Council 2018, *The history of Rafsanjan*, viewed 19 August 2018, <http://rafsanjan.ir/%D8%AA%D8%A7%D8%B1%DB%8C%D8%AE-%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86/>.

Razaei, HG 2015, *Rafsanjan environmental problems*, <https://www.mehrnews.com/news/2506837/%D8%B1%D9%88%D8%B2%D8%A7%D9%86%D9%87-%DB%B8%DB%B0-%D8%AA%D9%86-%D8%B2%D8%A8%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%87-%D8%AF%D8%B1-%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%AA%D9%88%D9%84%DB%8C%D8%AF-%D9%85%DB%8C-%D8%B4%D9%88%D8%AF>.


Ritchie, J, Lewis, J, Nicholls, CM & Ormston, R 2013, *Qualitative research practice: A guide for social science students and researchers*, Sage, California.


Saba Energy 2016, *Solar plant in Rafsanjan*, viewed 16 December 2018, <https://www.sabapeq.ir/project/%D8%A7%D8%AD%D8%AF%D8%A7%D8%AB-%D9%86%DB%8C%D8%B1%D9%88%DA%AF%D8%A7%D9%87-%D8%AE%D9%88%D8%B1%D8%B4%DB%8C%D8%AF%DB%8C-%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86/>.


Schneider, N 2016, *The empirical possibility of green growth: Evidence of significant relationships between economic growth & job creation, poverty reduction and resource...*
See Iran 2018, *Rafsanjan attractions*, viewed 11 December 2018, <https://seeiran.ir/tag/%D8%AC%D8%A7%D8%B0%D8%A8%D9%87-%D9%87%D8%A7%DB%8C-%DA%AF%D8%B1%D8%AF%D8%B4%DA%AF%D8%B1%DB%8C-%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86/>.  

Shahabian, P 2007, 'Investigating the role and effects of urban tourism on sustainable city development with emphasis on perception of residents', *Architecture Urban Design and Planning*, vol. 4, no. 7, pp. 121-132.


Slevitch, L 2011, 'Qualitative and quantitative methodologies compared: Ontological and epistemological perspectives', *Journal of Quality Assurance in Hospitality & Tourism*, vol. 12, no. 1, pp. 73-81.


Statistical Center of Iran 2017a, *Results of surveys of tourists*, viewed 12 April 2018, <retrieved from Statistical Centre of Iran database>.


162


Tracy, SJ 2012, *Qualitative research methods: Collecting evidence, crafting analysis, communicating impact*, John Wiley & Sons, UK.


Weaver, D 2006, *Sustainable tourism: Theory and practice*, Routledge, USA.
Weaver, D & Lawton, L n.d., *Sustainable tourism: A critical analysis*, viewed 30 August 2018, <retrieved from Cooperative Research Centre for Sustainable Tourism database>.


Winter, J & Moore, MC 2013, "The “green jobs” fantasy: Why the economic and environmental reality can never live up to the political promise", *Journal of Manufacturing Systems*, vol. 6, no. 31, pp. 1-31.


Young Journalists Club (YJC) 2014, *Rafsanjan's economy is dependent on agriculture*, viewed 23 September 2018, <https://www.yjc.ir/fa/news/4979627/85-%D8%A7%D9%82%D8%AA%D8%B5%D8%A7%D8%AF-%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86-%D9%88%D8%A7%D8%B3%D8%AA%D9%87-%D8%A8%D9%87-%DA%A9%D8%B4%D8%A7%D9%88%D8%B1%D8%B2%DB%8C-%D8%A7%D8%B3%DA%A9>. 
Young Journalists Club (YJC) 2016, 600 Foreign tourists visited Rafsanjan tourist attractions, viewed 22 September 2018,
https://www.yjc.ir/fa/news/5977580/%D8%A8%D8%A7%D8%B2%D8%AF%DB%8C% D8%AF-600-%DA%AF%D8%B1%D8%AF%D8%B4-%DA%AF%8B1-%D8%AE%D8%A7%D8%B1%D8%AC%DB%8C-%D8%A7%D8%B2- %D8%AC%D8%A7%D8%B0%D8%A8%D9%87%D9%80-%C9%87%D9%8A-%DB%8C-% DA%AF%D8%B1%D8%AF%D8%B4-%DA%AF%8B1-%DB%8C-% D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86>

Young Journalists Club (YJC) 2017, Rafsanjan pistachio economy has been challenged, viewed 22 September 2018,
https://www.yjc.ir/fa/news/5957746/%D8%A7%D9%82%D8%AA%D8%B5%D8%A7% D8%AF-%D9%BE%D8%B3%D8%AA%D9%87-%D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%DB%8C-% D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%AF%DA%86%D8%A7%D8%B1-%DA%86%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%B4- %D8%B4%D8%AF%D9%87-%D8%A7%D8%B3%D8%AA>

Young Journalists Club (YJC) 2018a, Entrepreneurship Rafsanjan save the economic crisis, viewed 25 September 2018,
https://www.yjc.ir/fa/news/6733834/%DA%A9%D8%A7%D8%B1%D8%A2%D9%81% D8%B1%DB%8C%D9%86%DB%8C-%D8%B1%D8%A7%D9%87-%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D8%AA- %D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%A7%D8%B2- %D8%A8%D8%AD%D8%B1%D8%A7%D9%86-%D8%A7%82%D8%AA%D8%B5%D8%A7%D8%AF%DB%8C>

Young Journalists Club (YJC) 2018b, A study on the crisis of pistachio absence in Rafsanjan, viewed 13 December 2018,
https://www.yjc.ir/fa/news/6568491/%D8%A8%D8%B1%D8%B3%DB%8C-%D8%A8%D8%AD%D8%B1%D8%A7%D9%86-%D9%86%D8%A8%D9%88%D8%AF- %D9%BE%D8%B3%D8%AA%D9%87-%D8%AF%DB%8C-% D8%B1%D9%81%D8%B3%D9%86%D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%86>


Appendix A: 

The analysis of tourism statistic data in Rafsanjan (Secondary data)

A.A Demographic characteristics of the sample

Participants’ preferences, interest and acceptance of new trends can be related to their demographic characteristics (Kónya, Matić & Pavlović 2016). This section provides a descriptive overview of the demographic characteristics of participants and discusses the results by considering all relevant literature and statistics. Specific information collected here includes gender, age, level of education, participants’ type of service/work in the tourism industry, and longevity of working in tourism jobs.

A.A.A Gender of participants

During the data collection stage, 12 participants agreed to participate in the following semi-structured interview, while nine others agreed to a self-interview. It is evident from Figure A.1 that the gender distribution of participants was not entirely even. Ten participants in the semi-structured interviews were male and two were female (see Figure A.1), while there were only six participants in the self-interviewing group. However, the data for the semi-structured interview reflect the population of Rafsanjan, which totals 83,607 and 78,302 for males and females respectively. This is also reflected in the population of the Rafsanjan region, which is 162,723 and 148,491 for males and females respectively (Statistical Centre of Iran 2017b; Management and Planning Organization of Kerman Province 2017). The ratio of males to females among self-interviewees was consistent with the gender profile of Rafsanjan as well. Female participants in the self-interview expressed their interest in different ways. Some said that they are successful women who would be happy if other women used their experience to do a greener job. Others stated they believe that establishing a business can easily harm the environment without sufficient knowledge of sustainable practices. They recognise that this could also be the result of lack of conscientiousness, or care for future generations.
A.A.B Age of participants

Participants were asked to indicate their age group. The age distribution shows that more than half were aged between 18 and 33 years, with the same number of people aged between 34 to 40 and 41 to 47 (see Figure A.2). Among self-interviewees, ages ranged from 26 to 47, except for one participant who was over the age of 60. Self-interviewees expressed that they felt uncomfortable with semi-structured interviewing. However, they were happy to do the self-interviewing because of the authority and independence it gives them. They were more willing to give their experiences and ideas as a story to the researcher. In Rafsanjan, the largest age group is in the range of 18 to 40 for both men and women (Statistical Centre of Iran 2017a), which is consistent with the data of this study.
A.A.C Education level of participants

The graph in Figure A.3 below, illustrates the distribution of participants’ highest education level. It is evident from the data collected that in both the semi-structured interviews and self-interviews most of the participants were well educated, as the majority held a bachelor’s degree or a postgraduate qualification. According to the Statistical Centre of Iran (2017b) and Management and Planning Organization of Kerman Province (2017), in Rafsanjan, 14,322 employed people hold a bachelor and postgraduate qualifications. 13,803 have other post school qualifications, while 3,830 have a diploma. The lowest number of participants in this study held a diploma. Some of these people participated in the pilot study, but they expressed confusion about the topic and named it a “high level topic”. However, some of the business owners with a diploma were interested in completing the self-interview. They indicated that this method gave them more self-confidence to think about the topic and express their opinion about it.

![Figure A.3: Level of education of participants](image)

A.A.D Participants type of service in tourism

The graph in Figure A.4 below illustrated the distribution of participants’ employment and job type. It is evident from the data collected that most of the participants in the semi-structured interview work in accommodation, and food and beverage services. This is inconsistent with the general number of these types of jobs in Rafsanjan overall.
(almost 5 accommodation businesses, i.e. hotels and eco-lodges in the Rafsanjan region, and 199 food and beverage centres in Kerman) (Statistical Centre of Iran, 2018; ITCHO, 2017). The number of tours and tour leaders working in Kerman is 278. 11 travel agencies operate in Rafsanjan (Management and Planning Organization of Kerman Province 2017). Participants in transportation did not participate in the semi-structured interview because of a lack of time. They also felt that there is nothing they can do to reduce the damage of their industry on the environment. As a result, they viewed participation in the current study as futile (Management and Planning Organization of Kerman Province 2017). Those involved in cultural and recreational services felt that their work does not contribute negatively to the environment to a significant extent. However, from both groups, some participated in the self-interview. In the Yearbook of 2017, the Statistical Centre of Iran noted that following retail, the food and beverage industry employs the second highest number of workers in Iran. Accommodation, art and amusement activities, cultural, sport and leisure activities, libraries and museums together form a considerable part of employment in Iran (Statistical Centre of Iran 2017b). Agriculture and industrial activities, as the main attraction of Rafsanjan, constitute the biggest employers for jobs in Rafsanjan (Center of Strategic Studies 2017). The tourism service, agriculture and industry form 38.9%, 31.9% and 29.3% of the Kerman economy respectively (Center of Strategic Studies 2017). Considering the above numbers, self-interviewing was done in all these areas to cover all important aspects related to the economy and tourism activities in Rafsanjan. Those involved in food and beverage were not included in self-interviewing because most of their input was obtained from semi-structured interviews.

Figure A.4: Participants type of service in tourism
A.A.E Longevity of Working in Tourism Jobs

Figure A.5 illustrates the amount of time participants spend working in the tourism industry. The data collected shows that the majority of participants who did the semi-structured interviews had been working in this industry for one year or less. Others had been working in tourism for 5 to 10 years. In comparison, some self-interviewees had worked in tourism for more than 10 years, and others between 5 and 10 years. The first group said that they are keen to educate other businesses with their experience, and the second group were happy to talk about their innovative ideas. In the semi-structured interviews, people in the first year of business were keen to talk about the challenges and drivers influencing them to improve their environmental practices.

Figure A.5: Longevity of working in tourism jobs
Appendix B:
The analysis of the profile and demographic characteristics of workers and professionals in the tourism industry in Rafsanjan

The profile and demographic characteristics of workers and professionals in the tourism industry were gathered in the present study. There is a lack of relevant previous studies on workers and professionals in the tourism industry in Rafsanjan. Most studies on this topic have provided a general definition of the profile of workers and professionals in Rafsanjan. As this study was focused only on tourism workers and professionals, no comparison could be made in some areas. Nonetheless, this study suggests that males are more interested in greening their jobs than females are – a finding which does not have any support from previous studies, although it is compatible with Rafsanjan’s general demographics (Statistical Centre of Iran 2018). As yet, no data exist regarding the age of workers and professionals in tourism, or how long they have worked for. Interestingly, this study found a correlation between age and longevity of employment. Ages of the participants (workers) in the semi-structured interviews ranged from 18 to 33. Most of them had been working in the tourism industry for one year or less. Those who participated in self-interviews were aged between 26 and 47. Most had been working in this industry for more than ten years. This study also showed that the older people are, the more they understand the environmental effect of their jobs. They were also more likely to comply with environmental rules and educate others about this. Previous findings show that most people involved in tourism jobs in Iran have a bachelor degree (Jobinjia 2019; Irantalent 2019). This is consistent with the current findings, which show that the highest number of participants hold a bachelor degree. In their yearbook of 2015, the Statistical Centre of Iran stated that accommodation, and food and beverages employ the highest number of people in the tourism industry. On the other hand, the main part of Rafsanjan’s economy is agriculture, which represents 29.3% of the economy of the region (Statistical Centre of Iran 2018). This justified the number of participants for the semi-structured interviews and self-interviews of this study.

Characteristics and profiles of tourism activities have been studied previously (Statistical Centre of Iran 2018). These studies have provided insight into the type of tourism, the time spent in Rafsanjan, the type of accommodation, expenditure while travelling and modes of travel. However, these studies did not focus on green jobs. The
findings of the current study show that the above-mentioned issues have an effect on tourism jobs and how they are performed. The participants were in agreement with these findings.

The findings help to define the type of jobs in the tourism industry in Rafsanjan that need the most attention. This is determined by the amount of time devoted by tourists and the amount of money they spend. The contribution of this study to knowledge regarding green jobs in Rafsanjan is clear. Therefore, restructured promotions, strategies, policies and pilot plans could be based on the new knowledge provided herein, which could foster greater awareness of more responsible behaviours. Rafsanjan could provide a model of how to develop green jobs policies in Iran more broadly.
Appendix C:
Semi-Structured Interview Framework for Workers and Professionals Working in Tourism Industry

Interview framework

*The student researcher will let participants know that there are no right or wrong answers. That it is expected that there will be a differing point of view and these are most welcome.*

*Each interviewee will be advised that they could withdraw from the project at any time and that their names would be kept confidential and not used in any publications written as a result of this study.*

*Interviewing will stop when the data saturation point is reached, i.e. when the themes emerged from the interviews start to repeat themselves.*

**General Information**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Identification**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• May I know which part of the tourism industry you are working in?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• May I know what are your principal responsibilities within your job?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Longevity of Working in Tourism Job**

| • May I know what is your professional background? Have you ever worked in the tourism area before? |
| • How long have you been in this position? |
Participants’ ideas about facts and figures of tourism

- What is your opinion about these expenditure habits of tourists in Rafsanjan?

Participants’ ideas about their motivations for and impediments to doing a tourism job

- What do you like the most about your job as a tourism job?
- What does make you feel disappointed about your job? What is the biggest barrier to doing your job?

General picture of participants’ ideas about the main themes of the study

Green design and energy efficiency (Process)

Open questions were asked about:

- The heating/cooling/ lighting system
- Shading systems like shutters, light-tight blinds or suitable curtains to reduce the energy use
- Time-switches or motion sensors
- Energy and water waste

Green Materials and Green Purchase (Process, People)

Open questions were asked about:

- Using toxic or pollutant materials at work
- Using regional/seasonal and organic products

Health and Well-being and Toxics Reduction (Process, People)

Open questions were asked about:

- Smoking in indoor places
- Using eco-friendly cleaning agents and detergents or toilet papers of facial tissues
- Hazardous wastes or liquid chemicals

Waste Minimisation and Recycling (Process, People)
Open questions were asked about:

- Regulating and managing to litter
- Waste separation at work

Environmental Support (External context, Preconditions)

Open questions were asked about:

- Financial support
- Budget allocated related to environmental issues

Monitoring, Evaluation and Management (People, External context)

Open questions were asked about:

- Department or person, responsible for environmental issues and the regularity of energy register
- Checking up heating/cooling/lighting by the owner
- The role of the workplace for contributing to the environment and the most significant issue related to the environment in the workplace

Policy and Training and Reporting (People)

Open questions were asked about:

- Environmental policies
- Environmental training to find any solutions for doing the jobs in a more environmentally friendly and its effects on jobs and arrivals

Transition questions

- Based on what we said, how do you think your role in the workplace can contribute to the environment?
- How your job is affecting the environment?
- How do you think your workplace can do jobs in a more environmentally friendly way?
- What is the most significant issue related to the environment in your workplace? To what extent is it addressed currently?
• If your workplace will be more environmentally friendly, what will be the effect of that on your job?
• If your workplace will be more environmentally friendly, what will be the effect of that on tourism flow and arrivals to your workplace?
• If the jobs will be more environmentally friendly, what will be the effect of that on your behaviour?

Questions about Drivers

• What do you consider as an encouragement that drives the jobs in your workplace to be done in a more environmentally friendly?
• What factors do you think can trigger your workplace to make existing jobs, more environmentally friendly?
• What factors do you think can trigger your workplace to create some jobs which are more environmentally friendly?

Questions about Barriers

• What do you consider as an obstacle that blocks the jobs in your workplace to be done in a more environmentally friendly?
• What factors do you think can stop your workplace to make existing jobs, more environmentally friendly?
• What factors do you think can stop your workplace to create some jobs which are more environmentally friendly?
Appendix D:
Semi-Structured Interview Framework for Workers and Professionals
Working in Tourism Industry in Persian

No right or wrong answers are expected, and it is expected that different perspectives will be given.
Names will be kept confidential and will not be disclosed in any of the studies that use this study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Details</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I can determine in which area of the hospitality industry you are working?

I can determine the main work of you in your job?

Can you determine the duration of your work in this occupation?

I can determine who are the main owners of this occupation?

I can determine the main occupation of the hotel industry?

I can determine why you love doing this occupation?

I can determine why you are dissatisfied with your occupation?

I can determine if working in tourism has any obstacles for you?

I can determine the main topics of this study?
سوالات باز:

• سیستم گرمایش / خنک کننده / روشنایی
• سیستم های سایه‌ای مانند گردو، برده‌های سبک و یا برده‌های مناسب برای کاهش مصرف انرژی
• سولنیج های زمان‌یاب سنسور حرکت
• زیاله ارزی و اب

مواد سیز و خردسیز (فرایند، مردم)

سوالات باز:

• استفاده از مواد سیز و خردسیز در محل کار
• استفاده از محصولات منطقه‌ای / فصلی
• کاهش سموم و آفتاب‌زمان و رفاه (فرایند، مردم)

سوالات باز:

• سیستم‌های سایه‌ای مانند کرکره، پرده‌ها و یا پرده‌های مناسب برای کاهش مصرف انرژی
• زیاله‌های خطرناک با مواد شیمیایی مناسب کمک به کاهش مصرف انرژی
• زباله و آب و مواد سیز و خرده (فراوانی، مردم)

سوالات باز:

• کم کردن و بارزبافت زیاله (فرایند، مردم)
• تنظیم و مدیریت باستر
• حمايت از محیط زیست (زیمنه خارجی، پیش شرط)

سوالات باز:

• آموزش محیط زیست در محل کار
• نظارت، ارزیابی و مدیریت (افراد، زیمنه خارجی)

سوالات باز:

• گروه یا شخص مستند سیستم محیطی و منظم بودن ثبت انرژی
• بررسی گرمایش / خنک کننده / نور توسط مالک

سوالات باز:

• نقش محل کار در پیشگیری و در اجرای یک روش به محیط زیست و مهم ترین موضوع مربوط به محیط زیست در محل کار
• سیاست و آموزش و گزارش (مردم)

سوالات باز:

• سیاست‌های زیست محیطی
• آموزش محیط زیست و گزارش (مردم)

سوالات انتقال:

• گذران آنچه گفتیم، شما فکر می‌کنید که نشان داده شما در محل کار می‌تواند به محیط زیست کمک کند؟
• چگونه گذشته که مالک کار شما می‌تواند کار را به شیوه‌ای سازگار با محیط زیست انجام دهد؟
• مهم ترین موضوع مربوط به محیط زیست در محل کار شما چیست؟
• آگر محل کار شما سازگار با محیط زیست بود، تأثیر آن بر کار شما چیست؟
• آگر محل کار شما سازگار با محیط زیست باشد، تأثیر آن بر جویای گردشگری و ورود به محل کار شما چیست؟

سوالات در مورد انگیزه‌نامه‌ها
چه عواملی فکر می‌کنید به عنوان تشکیل‌دهنده موقعیت‌های جدید می‌تواند در محل کار شما مشاغل تدوین‌کننده با محیط زیست سازگار تر گردد؟

چه عواملی فکر می‌کنید به عنوان تشکیل‌دهنده موقعیت‌های جدید می‌تواند در محل کار شما مشاغل تدوین‌کننده با محیط زیست سازگار تر باشد؟

چه نوع مشاغل جدیدی می‌تواند در محل کار شما ایجاد شود تا محل کار شما با محیط زیست سازگار تر باشد؟

سوالات در مورد موانع

چه عواملی فکر می‌کنید به عنوان مشاغلی که مانع می‌شود مشاغل به صورت سازگار با محیط زیست انجام شوند؟

چه عواملی فکر می‌کنید به عنوان مشاغلی که مانع می‌شود مشاغل به صورت سازگار با محیط زیست انجام شوند؟

چه عواملی فکر می‌کنید به عنوان محل کار شما را متوقف کند تا شغل‌های جدیدی ایجاد کند که با محیط زیست سازگار تر باشد؟
Appendix E:
Self-Interview Questions in English

Interview framework

The student researcher will let participants know that there are no right or wrong answers. That it is expected that there will be a differing point of view and these are most welcome.

Each interviewee will be advised that they could withdraw from the project at any time and that their names would be kept confidential and not used in any publications written as a result of this study.

Interviewing will stop when the data saturation point is reached, i.e. when the themes emerged from the interviews start to repeat themselves.

General Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Identification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• May I know which part of the tourism industry you are working in?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Longevity of Working in Tourism Job

| • How long have you been in this position? |

Participants’ ideas about facts and figures of tourism

• What is your opinion about these expenditure habits of tourists in Rafsanjan?
Participants’ ideas about their motivations and barriers to doing a tourism job

- What do you like the most about your job as a tourism job?
- What does make you feel disappointed about your job? What is the biggest barrier to doing your job?

Participants’ ideas about drivers and barriers for greening their jobs

1. Describe your job situation for me. How much you think your job is environmentally friendly?
2. What are the drivers for or barriers to make your job more eco-friendly?
Appendix F:
Self-Interview Questions in Persian

هیچ پاسخ درست یا غلطی وجود ندارد.

انتظار می‌رود که دیدگاه‌های منتفی‌نوردی وجود داشته باشد

به تمامی دیدگاه‌های متفاوت ارزش، اهمیت و به‌هیچ‌پدیده خواهد شد.

نام آنها محرمانه نگه داشته شود و در هیچ یک از کارهایی که از این مطالعه مورد استفاده قرار می‌گیرد، نام آنها نوشته نخواهد شد.

اطلاعات کلی

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>تاريخ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>زمان</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

اطلاعات فردي

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>جنسیت</th>
<th>سن</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>سطح تحصیلات</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>نوع شغل</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| • می‌تواند بدنام در گذشته باشد از صنعت 
| گردشگری در حال کار هستید؟ |
| طول مدت شاغل بودن در این شغل |
| • چه مدت در این موقعیت بوده اید؟ |

ایده‌های شرکت کنندگان درباره حقایق و ارقام گردشگری

نظر شما در مورد این عادات از مال گردشگران در رفت‌وآینده چیست؟

ایده‌های شرکت کنندگان در مورد انگیزه‌های آنها برای انجام و یا انجام ندادن یک کار گردشگری

• چه چیزی را در مورد شفقتان از همه بیشتر دوست دارید؟
| چه چیزی باعث ناراحتی شما در مورد شفقتان می‌شود؟ برگزیدن مانع برای انجام کار شما چیست؟ |

ایده‌های شرکت کنندگان در مورد انگیزه‌های آنها با محیط زیست

وضعیت شغلی خود را برای من توضیح دهید. چقدر فکر می‌کنید کار شما سازگار با محیط زیست است؟

انگیزه‌های آنا برای سازگار کردن شغل شما با محیط زیست چه هستند؟
Appendix G:
Self-Interview Texts in English

Green Jobs

The green economy and green jobs do not have a single definition; the UN Development Program considers a green economy as an economy that will improve people's happiness and social equity, while dramatically reducing environmental hazards and ecological deficiencies. The ILO considers qualified green jobs as:

- Reduce energy consumption and raw materials.
- Reducing greenhouse gas emissions.
- Minimising waste and contamination.
- Maintaining and recovering the eco-systems
- Satisfaction of consumer demand
- Reaction to rival actions

Companies can become green in three ways: value-added processes, redesigning and fixing some of the company’s problems by greening management systems, as well as greening the products, the greening of the value-added process, and finally refining technology or launching a new technology aimed at reducing the damaging environmental effects for all stages. The following methods can be used to produce the product:

- Modification: Extend the life of a product by modifying its parts
- Correction of worn and damaged parts: Product life extension through reengineering
- Reproduction: A new product based on an experience
- Reuse: Design a product that can be used at any time
- Recycling: Products that can be converted into raw materials for use in other products
- Reduced: Each product contains at least the raw material

The green job is a green cycle of the economy with a vision to the future that the green indicators throughout the whole process of the "inner and outer cycle" work, and its relationship with the working people and the surrounding environment are in fact a system process with a continuous improvement approach that all its components interact with each other and the environment, in a mutually reversible manner, and there is a convergence between economic, environmental and social responsibilities. Green indicators are based on environmental, social, economic and health indicators that affect the health of individuals and the environment. Environmental indicators should also be based on environmental standards in the work cycle from the start to the end and have the green chain management. Social
indicators include things like general welfare, quality of life, safe working conditions, job security and future job security. Economic indicators also make sense in economic development, earnings, employment creation and green entrepreneurship; health indicators are also non-threats to human health, "direct and indirect," internal standards, safety, and health and green skills. Green jobs are the jobs that have one of the following features:

- Green Indicators are to be followed by the "first category of deployment criteria."
- Intrinsically Green Indicators with a Green Economy Approach "Reducing Production and Carbon Emissions, Energy Efficiency"
- Intrinsically Green Indicators with Education and Research Approach to Promote the Environment
- Yellow jobs: Occupations that are required to comply with specific environmental standards and standards in their "deployment, production, selection, and ..." "Difficulty Classes of these jobs are 2 and 3 Deployment Standards."
- Red jobs: Occupants require special environmental management due to one of the hazardous properties, such as toxicity, pathogenicity, explosion or flammability, corrosivity, and the like. "Difficulty Classes of these jobs 4,5,6,7 Deployment criteria."
- Greening Jobs: A system-based process with educational and policy approach that through environmental education by changing attitudes, behaviour and skills of individuals, creating theoretical and practical sensitivity to them about environmental and health issues and the promotion of environmental ethics and practices. Incentive and Punitive Policies An environmental framework for matching jobs with the environment and creating reciprocal and reciprocal relationships between them, meeting environmental standards and standards, is designed to achieve a healthy environment, social welfare and community health.
Appendix H:
Self-Interview Texts in Persian
شاخص هایی سازنده در آن‌ها و عواقب شود "رده‌ی اول ضوابط استقرار".

شاخص‌های داتا سازی ریجکست اقتصاد سازی "کاهش تولید و انتشار کریم، کارآمدی انتزاعی".

شاخص‌های داتا سازی ریجکست اقتصاد سازی "پژوهش در راستای ارتقاء محیط زیستی".

مشاعل زرد: مشاغلی است که هر روزه استفاده و صوابات خاص محیط زیستی در فرآیند کاری خود "استقرار، توپیک، انتخاب و..."، سرنوشت "رده‌های دو و سه ضوابط استقرار".

مشاغل قرمز: مشاغلی است که به ناپایداری آن‌ها از خواص خطرناکی از قبیل سمیت، بیماریزا، قابلیت انجام با اشغال، خوشه‌گی و مشابه آن‌ها به مدیریت خاص محیط زیستی دارد "رده‌های 4، 5، 6، 7 ضوابط استقرار".

مشاغل قرمز: رویکرد سیستمی با ریجکست اقتصادی و سیستم‌کاری است که با طریق ارائه محیط زیستی با تغییر تغییرات، رفتار و میزان افزایش حساسیت نظری و عملی در آن‌ها نسبت به مسائل محیط زیست و سلامت و ترویج اخلاق محیط زیستی و با اعمال سیاست‌گذاری و ترویج کارهای محیط‌پسند، به تکمیلی جهت اجرای شرایط و ضوابط و استانداردهای محیط زیستی به منظور دست‌یابی به محیط زیست سالم، رفاه اجتماعی و سلامت جامعه توجه است.
Appendix I:
Information Sheet Used in Data Collection Process in English

INFORMATION TO PARTICIPANTS INVOLVED IN RESEARCH

You are invited to participate

You are invited to participate in a research project entitled identifying drivers and barriers for green jobs in the tourism sector which is going to be done in R afsanjan.

This project is being conducted by a student researcher Elahe Hoseinifirouzabadi as the student of the master by the research in tourism major at Victoria University under the supervision of Professor Terry Delacy and Dr. Min Jiang from College of Business.

Project explanation

This project aims at investigating the implementation of green jobs in the tourism sector in Ramsanjan, Iran. The green job is defined as employment created in different sectors of the economy and through related activities, which reduces the environmental impact of those sectors and activities, and ultimately brings it down to sustainable levels. This includes helping to reduce consumption of energy and raw materials, de-carbonise the economy, protect and restore ecosystems and biodiversity and minimise the production of waste and pollution. This study aims to realise what drives jobs to be more environmentally friendly or on the other side, what avoid jobs to be environmentally-appropriate and sustainable and investigate the drivers and barriers for workers and professionals of the tourism industry regarding green job situation in Ramsanjan. It aims at achieving the following three specific objectives: 1) To identify the current level of green jobs in the tourism sector in Ramsanjan. 2) To identify the drivers of Ramsanjan professionals and workers regarding green jobs. 3) To identify the barriers of Ramsanjan professionals and workers regarding green jobs. Methods used in this study includes interviews and secondary data analyses. The expected contribution to knowledge is to gain an insightful understanding of green jobs in the tourism sector. This could be expected to benefit Ramsanjan economy to lead it more toward sustainability and various jobs, that are directly or indirectly related to tourism, in particular.

What will I be asked to do?

The participants will be asked some open questions about your observations in tourism jobs, and there is no wrong or right answer. You are free to answer the questions in any way you see fit and express your ideas freely. This research is just looking for understanding the job situation in the tourism area, from your point of view. The maximum amount of time for this interview is one hour. The participants would be asked to be audio-recorded if they agreed to. You won’t be video recorded.

How will the information I give be used?

The information given will allow us a deeper understanding of the green job situation and more effectively encourage the tourism activities to engage in environmentally-friendly jobs. The significance of this research relies on the development of efficient ways of participation in the environmentally-friendly jobs in the tourism sector that will result in an increase in the economic contribution and social and environmental development within Ramsanjan. The results of this project also will be published as journal articles and as a thesis.

What are the potential risks of participating in this project?

There will be some psychological and social risks like feeling afraid or stressed about being isolated at the workplace and being depressed because of isolation at work, and even losing the jobs can also be considered. Maybe you start to feel alienated or far from colleagues or feeling less satisfied and happy with your work by paying more attention to the negative parts of your work because of the interview questions. It also can be possible that as you will be asked the questions, you start to feel anxious with the types of questions and by giving such information you feel threatening your

V.1/2013

1 of 2
situation. Sometimes at that time you continue for any reason, but after that, you start to feel very stressed and worried about the information you already gave to the researcher, and it can put a lot of pressure on you emotionally not to feel safe any more at work. If the information is revealed accidentally, it also can put you under a very severe situation at the workplace and doesn’t let you improve in your career or make colleagues or boss or the supervisors behave you in a strange way or in an ignoring way which finally can lead you to resign or be fired. As the interview is through Skype or telephone, you can minimise the risk by choosing a private place, and after working hours, to let you be comfortable, peaceful and safe enough to talk freely and express your opinion. You won’t represent any organisation; you talk about your personal experience. You are free withdrawing at any level of the interview that feels uncomfortable; you can resign and stop the interview, and also you can be sure that all of the information will be kept confidential and will be re-identified. The interview will be stopped if anything was going to happen during the interview, and you can make sure everything is safe enough for you. The time can be preferably after hour work not to put you in a bad situation career-wise. It means the risks which are mentioned above are possible to happen to you if any information will be revealed accidentally, so it is better to keep your self-safe by doing the interview at somewhere which is far from your workplace or your colleagues and supervisors. Also, you will be sent a form of consent, and you can take your time to sign it or decide not to participate.

**How will this project be conducted?**

This project use interview as its main method of work. The interview will be done through Skype or telephone, but you won’t be video recorded, and the audio record will be done if you will agree with that in the consent form. For doing an interview, you just will be asked some question about your observation and its place related to the environment, and you are free to answer and explain your ideas and points of views as you see fit. There is no right or wrong answer, and you are free to speak about your previous experiences.

**Who is conducting the study?**

Chief investigator: Professor Terry DeLacy  
Co-supervisor: Dr Min Jiang  
Student researcher: Elahe Hoseinifrouzabadi  
Local contact person: Bahareh Sharifi

Any queries about your participation in this project may be directed to the local contact person listed above. If you have any queries or complaints about the way you have been treated, you may contact ValiAsv University, Rafsanjan, Kerman: baharehsharifi@ymail.com or mobile number +98913047933 or helpline 1480.  
You also can contact the Ethics Secretary, Victoria University Human Research Ethics Committee, Office for Research, Victoria University, PO Box 14428, Melbourne, VIC, 8001, email researchethics@vu.edu.au or phone (03) 9919 4781 or 4461. Another contact person can be the researcher Elahe Hoseinifrouzabadi 0426102700, 101 Ballarat road, Footscray, VIC or Email elahe.hoseinifrouzabadi@live.vu.edu.au or you may contact the supervisor Terry DeLacy 0429962020 or Email terry.delacy@vu.edu.au.
Appendix J:
Consent Form Used in Data Collection Process in English

CONSENT FORM FOR PARTICIPANTS INVOLVED IN RESEARCH

INFORMATION TO PARTICIPANTS:
We would like to invite you to be a part of a study into identifying drivers and barriers for green jobs in the tourism sector which is going to be done in Rafsanjan.

This study aims at investigating the implementation of green jobs in the tourism sector in Rafsanjan, Iran; which is realising about the issues that drive green jobs at workplaces or the factors that don't let the jobs to follow the greening (sustainability) route, in Rafsanjan. This work is done with the intention of contributing positively to the environment which is the basis of any touristic activity and changing the job ways from being harmful to clean and meaningful jobs, ecologically. During this work, you will be asked some open questions about your observations in tourism jobs, and there is no wrong or right answer. You are free to answer the questions in any way you see fit and express your ideas freely. This research is just looking for understanding the job situation in the tourism area, from your point of view.

CERTIFICATION BY PARTICIPANT

I, .................................................. of Rafsanjan certify that I am at least 18 years old* and that I am voluntarily giving my consent to participate in the study: "Identifying drivers and barriers for green jobs in the tourism sector: A case study of Rafsanjan, Iran." being conducted at Victoria University by "Elahe Hoseinifrouzabadi."

I certify that the objectives of the study, together with any risks and safeguards associated with the procedures listed hereunder to be carried out in the research, have been fully explained to me by Elahe Hoseinifrouzabadi and that I freely consent to participation in attending the interview and communicate openly with the researcher.

☐ By checking this box, I consent to have the discussion audio-recorded.

I certify that I have had the opportunity to have any questions answered and that I understand that I can withdraw from this study at any time and that this withdrawal will not jeopardise me in any way.

I have been informed that the information I provide will be kept confidential.

Signed:

Date:

Chief investigator: Professor Terry DeLacy
Co-supervisor: Dr. Min Jiang
Student researcher: Elahe Hoseinifrouzabadi
Local contact person: Bahare Sharifi

Any queries about your participation in this project may be directed to the local contact person listed above.

If you have any queries or complaints about the way you have been treated, you may contact Vali Asr University, Rafsanjan, Kerman. baharesharifi@ymail.com or mobile number +98913047933 or helpline 1480. You also can contact the Ethics Secretary, Victoria University Human Research Ethics Committee, Office for Research, Victoria University, PO Box 14428, Melbourne, VIC, 8001, email researchethics@vu.edu.au or phone (03) 9919 4781 or 4461. Another contact person can be the researcher Elahe Hoseinifrouzabadi 0426102700, 101 Ballarat road, Footscray, VIC or Email elahe.hoseinifrouzabadi@live.vu.edu.au or you may contact the supervisor Terry DeLacy 0429660202 or Email terry.delacy@vu.edu.au.

V.1/2013
اطلاعات به شرکت کنندگان در تحقیقات

ار ضم سه دوخت شده است و به این پژوهش تحقیقاتی با نام شناسایی محور ها و موانع مشاغل سیر

ابن پژوهش نوع محقق دانشگاه اهمیت حیاتی را به تشتیل و پیشنهاد شرافتی کردن روش های

نوع پژوهش برنامه ریزی شده است. این پژوهش به دستگاهی در دانشگاه و یکتا تحت تئوری بررسی نوردی لیبری و دکتر مین

جایگاه از دوران پن سیس انجام مشورت.

نوشیت پژوهش

هدف از این مطالعه بررسی پیاده سازی سای مشاغل سیر در دانشگاه فردوسی مشهد و ایران است

در این پژوهش ایجاد شغل های نادیده و روانی را که به دنبال مشارکت در مشاغل سیر در بین سازمان مشاغل سیر، را شناسایی می کنند. شغل های سیر به عنوان مشاغلی در

یک مطالعه ای از تجربیات و از طریق فعالیت های مرتب توریستی است. توریست از سوی دیگر، بسیاری از مشاغل کمک به

کافش مصرف ارزی و مواد غذایی کم کنند. کم کردن این اثرات در اکثریت خدمات و مراکز انجام می شود.

است که شغل ها را دوست داشته و نظری رسته محسوب می شود. از این نجت چه مواردی که

مما به کمک کردن از اینه شغل ها را دوست داشته و نظری رسته محسوب می شود. این از ابتدا

زیست محیطی مناسب و پایداری می کند و بررسی محکر ها و مواد اقل مصرف و مشاغل و

یک تحقیق کمی در مورد وضعیت شغلی در رفسنجان. هدف از این پژوهش به سه هدف نهایی است: 

مطالعه پیامدهای مصرفی در موسسه سنای رفسنجان. هدف از این دستیاب به سه هدف نهایی است: 

بنا بر این اگر این امر به بیان اقتصادی است و هر در رضا از مشاغل سیر در بین سازمان مشاغل سیر

مطالعات تعدادی باز است. انجام موارد مربوط در دریافت از مشاغل سیر در بین سازمان مشاغل سیر

بنا بر آن، این ابهام نسبت به منابع اقتصادی رفتاری باشد این

منابع به موسسه های گردشگری دیگر و پیشنهاد شغلی شناختی در منطقه گردشگری است. لذا این

缘 به سوختگی که به همکاری با تروید کشوری سازمانی می شود.

چگونه از اطلاعاتی که داده شده، استفاده می شود؟

این اطلاعات به ما درکی از تا از وضعیت شغلی سیر و به طور موتور فعالیت های گردشگری را

یا کمک در مشاغل سیر مشابه شناخت و سوختگی می شود. این ابهام نسبت به منابع اقتصادی رفتاری باشد این

کارآمد مشاغل در مشاغل سازگار با محیط زیست در بین گردشگری مثبت است که منجر به

نگهداری از محیط زیست در بین گردشگری مثبت است که منجر به
خطرات اتحالیاتی مشاهده شدند در واقعه راوان و اجتماعی مانند احساس نیرس، استرس و نیاز دارد تنها ممکن است این احساس نیرس، وضعیت باشند که باید برای احساس نیرس، وضعیت بگذاریم. همچنین ممکن است با شروع سوائلات احساس نیرس. نوع سوائلات شما را باید اطمینان کنید که شما احساس نیرس، وضعیت داشته باشید. همچنین ممکن است با شروع احساس نیرس، وضعیت که شما را باید اطمینان کنید که شما احساس نیرس، وضعیت داشته باشید. همچنین ممکن است با شروع احساس نیرس، وضعیت که شما را باید اطمینان کنید که شما احساس نیرس، وضعیت داشته باشید.
هر گونه پرسشن در مورد مشارکت شما در این بررسی ممکن است به بخش تامس محلی شخص دستور شده در بالا هدایت شود.

اگر در مورد نحوه توقف شما شکایت یا درخواست داشته باشید، می توانید با بخش دانشگاه 
با شماره تلفن +98 9139479331
پیامرسید. بررسی جزئی ویژه 14800 نمایشگاه
می‌توانید به بخش دانشگاه
PO Box 14428
احیا تحقیقات انسانی دانشگاه ویکتوریا، دفتر تحقیقات، دانشگاه ویکتوریا، میل 14399194781
یا researchethics@vu.edu.au، ایمیل، میل، ویکتوریا، 8001
می‌توانید با محقق رابطه حسینی فیروز آبادی تامس پگرید از
Ballarat road، Footscray، ویکتوریا، 101
و یا با سرپرست بررسی نری دولتی با تلفن 04461
تامس پگرید. شما همچنین می‌توانید با محقق رابطه حسینی فیروز آبادی تامس پگرید از
Ballarat road، Footscray، ویکتوریا، 101
و یا با سرپرست بررسی نری دولتی با تلفن 04461
tanya.delacy@vu.edu.au یا ایمیل.
فرم نمایندگان کنگره کنندگان در تحقیق

اطلاعات نهایی کنندگان:

آزمایش در دانشگاه می‌تواند که به‌صورت ایرانی مطالعه برای نسخه‌ای محکم و موانع مشاغل سبز در بخش گردشگری پایدار بهتر که در رفتارهای انجام می‌شود.

هدف از این مطالعه بررسی بله‌ای سازی مشاغل سبز در بخش گردشگری رفسنجان است. هدف از این مطالعه بررسی بله‌ای سازی مشاغل سبز در بخش گردشگری رفسنجان است.

باید به عنوان سازمان‌های مسئولیت‌های منابع و ارزش‌های افراد در راستای وسایل تولید زیست‌محیطی است. است که باید با پرداختن به دست‌رسانی کارهای باک و دیگر انرژی‌ها و بار در مورد مشابه‌سازی بخش گردشگری پیشنهادیه.

در طول این کار از مشابه‌سازی مفهوم و انتقال در سیستم‌ها و ماحول بین‌افزار در بخش گردشگری رفسنجان شده است. است که به‌صورت آماده با درستی و جمع‌آوری شده است.

یکی از مهم‌ترین است دیگری به‌صورت گردشگری اصلی است. این تحقیق فقط به دنبال دیدگاه‌ها و بررسی در بخش گردشگری است.

نام نویسندگان

من از تأییدی که انتظار می‌گردد. همزمان با گزارش تجربه عضوی به رهایی زیرک که در این تحقیق می‌تواند بررسی گزارش می‌گردد. به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

در این تحقیق می‌گردد. همزمان با گزارش تجربه عضوی به رهایی زیرک که در این تحقیق می‌تواند بررسی گزارش می‌گردد. به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

با نیک‌باد این بخش، من موافقت می‌کنم که صحت می‌گردد. همزمان با گزارش تجربه عضوی به رهایی زیرک که در این تحقیق می‌تواند بررسی گزارش می‌گردد. به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.

نام نویسندگان

محل تحقیق: دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی، دکتر نویسی

همگی از پژوهشگران و افرادی که به‌طور کامل توصیف جزئیات فیزیک رفته اید. توصیف داده‌های ایند و من به‌طور آزادانه در مصاحبه شرکت می‌کنند و آزادانه با پژوهشگر ارتباط برقرار می‌می‌کنند.
یا تلفن 1399194781 يا researchethics@vu.edu.au، Melbourne. VIC. 8001
4644 تماس بگیرید. شما همچنین می توانید با محقق الگه حسبی فیورواندی تماس بگیرید از
طريق 0426102700 101 Ballarat road, Footscray, VIC و یا با سرپرست پروژه تری دولبی
elahe.hoseinifirouzabadi@live.vu.edu.au تماس بگیرید.
terry.delacy@vu.edu.au یا تماس بگیرید
0429662020
Appendix M:
The Videos Which Are Used in Self-Interviewing


